

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XLVII • 2021



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

from those of spoken English.

The premise of considering what art was present in ancient music is excellent. An overview of musical genres and instruments in the context of broad ancient history is a critical part of interdisciplinary scholarship, drawing on the sister disciplines of history, musicology, and organology. The problems mentioned above somehow got past the reputable publisher's peer review and editorial processes, leading to a book with content that belies its recent publication date.

ALLISON A. ALCORN

ILLINOIS STATE UNIVERSITY

Maggie Kilbey. *Music-Making in the Hertfordshire Parish, 1760–1870*. Hatfield: University of Hertfordshire Press, 2020. 292 pp., many black-and-white illus. ISBN: 9781912260263. \$27.87 (paperback).

Author and historian Maggie Kilbey opens her consideration of music-making in the Hertfordshire parish by prioritizing the combination of musical and social history in her study. This interaction is central to the book and allows Kilbey to demonstrate the scope of her subject and the mutual dependence and influence of musical and social innovations within the Hertfordshire parish.

The author questions some established theories associated with church music-making during this period, arguing convincingly that different counties and parishes showed disparity in their approaches to church music-making and that Hertfordshire in particular was influenced by its proximity to London. She also challenges the idea of sequential changes in church music-making, proving through this study that many parallel stages existed in terms of suggested improvements to parochial music.

Kilbey examines the continual, and often fruitless, attempts made during this period to improve and encourage parochial music-making and congregational singing. In exploring her subject, the author skilfully draws together a wide variety of sources, including newspaper advertisements, ecclesiastical publications, private diaries, contemporary litera-

ture, and—crucially—individual church records to create a vivid picture of music-making in the Hertfordshire parish. The nine chapters are supplemented by four appendixes, including two useful and informative maps of Hertfordshire and the parishes cited in the book, and two tables noting the presence of organs, singers, and instrumentalists in the parishes considered.

The nine chapters present a vast amount of information, considering pertinent topics as wide ranging as charity schools, the production of hymnals, the impact of non-conformist movements, church musicians and the instruments they played, financial and religious disputes, the establishment of singing classes and choirs, and the fabric of church buildings. In each chapter, the author interweaves historical, social, and musical considerations, displaying their mutual interdependence and influence in attempting to improve and develop parochial music-making. Kilbey creates a highly detailed picture within each of these chapters, and there are only occasional instances where, in the effort to provide detail or explain background, the overall chronology of the central narrative is lost.

Chapter 2 focuses on the enforced role charity schoolchildren played in attempting to encourage congregational singing. The author offers a fascinating insight into the place of these children, both in society and within the church, assessing their visual and musical impacts on church congregations. Discussing the importance of their visual image, Kilbey comments: “Children in many charity schools in London and the provinces were provided with specific clothing” and therefore provided “a display of ‘clothed’ objects of charity” (p. 39) for congregations to observe and hopefully patronize. The original intention in using charity schoolchildren to lead the singing was to encourage the congregation to sing too. However, as Kilbey argues, these attempts to improve parochial music-making, although perhaps theoretically sound, ultimately proved largely unsuccessful in practice. A number of examples cited by the author demonstrate that, for multiple social and musical reasons, the reality remained that “rather than leading the singing, children were singing on behalf of the congregation” (p. 43).

Chapter 4 centers on the presence, role, and performance of the singers and church bands who contributed to parochial music-making. Through surviving church accounts and payments, Kilbey proves the use of various wind and string instruments employed in different combinations within Hertfordshire church bands. She notes that, although anecdotal informa-

tion indicates that flutes were regular members of church bands, “little evidence of their use survives, probably because flutes have neither reeds nor strings, the purchase of which provide the main surviving evidence for clarinets, oboes, bassoons, violins and cellos in churchwardens’ accounts” (p. 98). These instruments were used in various combinations in church bands (as indicated in Appendix four) and, in some cases, were recorded in contemporary paintings, such as the image featured as the cover illustration to this book. Thomas Webster’s *A Village Choir* (1847) depicts the singers at Bow Brickhill, Bedfordshire (just north of Hertfordshire) with a band comprising a clarinet (a six-keyed English example), bassoon, and cello. Kilbey’s research confirmed that the clarinetist John Wooton was a wheelwright and baker and the cellist Thomas Baskerville a blacksmith, both therefore belonging to a class of “artisan tradesmen” (p. 94). The author suggests that this was true of the majority of church musicians at this time, again demonstrating an important connection between social class and involvement in parochial music-making. When considering the resulting effects of these church bands in performance, Kilbey creates a richly detailed and engaging portrait of the (often highly questionable) musical skills in evidence, vividly bringing parochial music-making to life. The author selects an effective range of contemporary descriptions and demonstrates a prevailing opinion that, in the words of one nineteenth-century writer, “our beautiful service is disfigured and disgraced to gratify the vanity of every drivelling performer on the clarionet, flute, fiddle, or violoncello. The resemblance of all this complicated discordancy of sound, to what we usually call music, is faint indeed” (p. 92).

This chapter also offers a fascinating insight to the provision and funding of church instruments, reeds, and strings, demonstrating the diverse ways in which these instruments were purchased and maintained. Kilbey cites the importance of multiple figures such as provincial composers, charity school teachers, organists, church band musicians, local landowners, patrons or clergymen, and provincial shopkeepers in supplying and supporting church bands. In addition, the author also notes the obtaining of church instruments by subscription, in part exchange, by hire purchase, in instalments, or as second-hand instruments, revealing “a complex funding picture” (p. 100). Kilbey also highlights a close connection between military and church bands, demonstrating the influence of the military band in introducing a wider selection of instruments into parochial music-making. Furthermore, the author also notes that in the parish of Wel-

wyn, a possible overlap of these two bands appears likely, as Mr. "Otway may have directed both the church bands and the local [military] band of music" (p. 107).

A further confirmation of this close association is displayed by parishes which appear to have used the same instruments in both their church and local military bands. One telling example of this, which even included a specific modification to an instrument to enable its use in both environments, is recorded in Oakham, Rutland. An 1806 inventory of church goods included two bassoons, and Kilbey discovered an invoice from Köhler and Percival (makers of military musical instruments) for a bassoon with a trumpet top. These trumpet tops, made from silver, brass, or copper, were interchangeable with the usual wooden bassoon bell. Although the reason for the provision of these trumpet tops is not immediately apparent, Kilbey clarifies this, commenting that "With flared metal trumpet tops the bassoons would better match military instruments such as horns and trumpets in terms of both appearance and loudness, while a standard wooden bell would give a softer appearance and volume that would blend better with church band instruments" (pp. 107–09). This demonstrates versatility in the bassoon's usage, as Kilbey sheds new light on the technical and musical reasons behind this little known organological design feature. The author provides an interesting photograph of two bassoons housed in the Bate Collection, University of Oxford: a Goulding & D'Almaine bassoon with a trumpet top and a Cuvillier bassoon with the usual wooden bell. The black-and-white photograph is unfortunately a little too dark to discern all the details of these instruments and the material of the flared bell; however, the trumpet top shape is clearly visible and demonstrates the organological differences between these two instruments.

Several of Kilbey's chapters are illustrated with a range of iconographical material, including photographs of surviving church instruments, contemporary paintings, plans of church interiors, patent organ designs, and satirical drawings of the time. Although the photographs used in the book are unfortunately sometimes too dark to discern all the details of the instruments under consideration, they enhance her discussions and are effectively incorporated. The author also includes a number of tables to present more detailed or complex information with greater clarity. Although this is for the most part successful, the order of information presented in the tables sometimes does not allow the reader to interpret the

information with reference to Kilbey's discussion as readily as might be hoped. This occasionally lessens the impact of the tabulated information.

For example, in table 6.2 (p. 171), the author presents an 1846 classification of hymn tunes as "1 = solid and ecclesiastical, 2 = light and inferior, 3 = lax and secular." Her point concerns the popularity of the two lower classifications of hymn tunes in Hertfordshire, despite the unfavorable contemporary descriptions cited here. However, the table is ordered not by these classifications, but rather in alphabetical order by hymn tune, splitting the classifications up and lessening the impact of the table in supporting her point in this particular case.

Likewise, Appendix 4 documents references to singers and church bands in Hertfordshire parish churches from 1760 to 1850. The presence of singers and various instrumentalists is designated by dots for each parish, and it would have been fascinating to gain an idea of the date or dates (within the period 1760–1850) that these musicians were present.

In Kilbey's introduction to this book, she comments: "It is to be hoped that the new findings presented in this book will encourage other researchers to undertake studies in their own regions, adding even more to our growing understanding of the development of music-making during this important period" (p. 6). Through her accessible and engaging written style and the rigor and depth of research presented, readers will gain a vivid picture of Hertfordshire's musical and social history during more than a century. Fostered by Kilbey's zest and enthusiasm, they may also be encouraged to investigate music-making in their own parishes.

CATHERINE CRISP

UNIVERSITY OF CHICHESTER