

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XLII • 2016



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

subject matter problematic. For readers interested in best practices in musical instrument conservation, consider the Pollens book as a musical instrument supplement to a more complete and authoritative conservation text, such as *Conservation of Furniture* by Shayne Rivers and Nick Umney, Butterworth-Heinemann (2003).

Pollens does include a great deal of specific treatment advice, but it is here that the book can mislead. A central tenant of conservation goes virtually unsaid in the book: *most conservation treatment methods are situation-specific*. As any conservator's notebook would have, this one has rules of thumb for treating particular condition issues. It is between that starting point and any final decision about how to proceed in any particular case that the expertise of trained conservators come to bear, since any final treatment necessarily considers other materials and variables in the context. The entry on stain removal on page 285, for example, lists ten types of stain, along with a chemical for removing each. There can be no doubt that Stewart Pollens in his post at the Metropolitan Museum would either have been familiar with the science or sought advice from conservation specialists if he did not, in order to progress from his notebook's rule of thumb to a safe treatment in the current situation. Yet, in the stain removal entry, no mention is made about how the recommended solvents, bleaches, acids, and soaps could damage or otherwise interact with all the possible substrates and coatings that might be present in the same spot.

The best treatment plans can come from a co-equal collaboration between instrument maker/restorer and conservation specialists, regardless of who ultimately conducts the treatment. This book will help each understand the other, and so should be on the shelf of every musical instrument collector, restorer, and conservator who might be called upon to plan or participate in conservation interventions.

In short, this book is analogous to a pharmacology primer in which many types of medications and their dosages are given without noting possible side effects and without designating which are "over the counter" and which are "prescription." Ask your conservator what's right for you.

JOHN K. WATSON
COLONIAL WILLIAMSBURG

Alberto Cuéllar et al. *La Escuela Granadina de Guitarreros = The Granada School of Guitar-Makers*, ed. John Ray, [Granada]: Diputación de Granada, 2014. 305 pp., many color illus., Spanish/English edition. ISBN 978-84-7807-537-9. €40 (hardbound).

This study of the Granada school of guitar makers is a much awaited and appropriate addition to the literature on Spanish lutherie. Other schools are well documented, notably those of Madrid, Málaga, and Cádiz, all of which are quite distinct from one another. However, although it is known that there were many guitar makers in and around Granada, it is not immediately apparent that they formed their own school, especially since an unusually high proportion of the makers, compared to other schools, were not originally from Granada. The Catalan composer and guitarist Fernando Sor, for example, recommends many makers representing prominent schools in his 1831 *Méthode pour la Guitare*, and is careful not to omit any Spanish ones, but he names no Granada makers. When I received this book I was already aware of the early Granada luthiers such as Agustin Caro and José Pernas, but I was not at all sure how to place them in terms of influences they received or that they exerted. Furthermore, it was not clear to me how their guitars were distinct from other schools. The arrival of this study made me eager to find out more.

The Granada School seems to be a very welcoming one, for it hosts many foreign nationals including John Ray (Canada), René Baarslag (Holland), Thomas Holt (Denmark), Matteo Vaghi (Italy), Stephen Hill (England), and at least three German nationals. Their craft is sincere, and apart from one relapse (Beneto Ferrer, see below) they have not sold out by importing factory-made guitars from Alicante and planting their own labels inside as “tourist” models – a disreputable and surely an illegal practice which has endured for too long. (Today, some of these guitars are even made in China.)

La Escuela Granadina de Guitarreros is a collaborative work, edited by John Ray, with contributions from Alberto Cuéllar, David Gansz, Aarón García, Angelo Gilardino, and Javier Molina. The opening chapter by Gilardino (pp. 9–25), though succinct, is beautifully written with quotations from Debussy and Lorca among others. It seems that Cádiz, Seville, and Málaga were the dominant Andalusian centers of lutherie in the eighteenth-century. Was there no demand in Granada? Even the Granadino José Contreras made his six-course “vihuelas” in Madrid. This is surprising, considering that Granada was apparently a thriving centre for craftsmen and has been so for many centuries. Aarón García begins (pp. 231–249) the work of defining important and diagnostic aspects of Granada work. He cites an 1803 Agustin Caro guitar in his chapter as one of the earliest six-single-string guitars, carefully mentioning the earlier Italian efforts (he omits the contemporaneous London-made

"Spanish" guitars by J. Longman) and he observes that Caro's guitars were the first with raised fingerboards extending to the soundhole. José Pernas was perhaps the earliest established *guitarreo de Granadina*, with Beneto Ferrer and later the Casa Ferrer to follow. At their lowest point, they sourced some of their guitars from other workshops, but Eduardo Ferrer, José's nephew, later apprenticed some of the Yamaha makers. Eduardo is now considered to be the founder of the modern Granada group of makers, both for the esteem in which his guitars are held and his work in training many of the next generation. Some of their guitars were based upon the Ramirez pattern, which once again raises the question of whether we are dealing with a *school*.

Apparently the oldest extant Granada-made instrument of the guitar family is by Rafael Vallejo (actually made in Baza, a province of Granada), and is in storage at the Victoria & Albert Museum, London. Aarón García, in his section, describes this instrument as a guitar-psaltery (Engel likens it to a *chitarra-salterio*). Gilardino, wisely avoids calling Vallejo a guitar-maker or the earliest known *Guitarrero de Granadina*. Indeed, Vallejo was almost certainly primarily a furniture-maker. At present, the V&A has no real interest in its musical instruments and it would be fitting if it were to donate this instrument to an appropriate museum in Granada (or even Baza), where it could be justly venerated.

The heart of the book is undoubtedly the comprehensive catalog of the current guitar-makers (pp. 153–227). This contains a brief biographical description of each one, accompanied by a photograph of them in their workshop, a sample guitar, with a brief description including the bracing lay-out. It is pleasing to see a female *guitarrera* amongst the members of this male dominated occupation. Until very recently, I was not aware of a single female guitar maker in history, although many wives of guitar-makers probably assisted their husbands but were never recognized; others who worked in the Mirecourt cottage industry and in the 1890s Samuel Edmund Potts employed "several young women" in his London workshop. (Alas, his intentions must be doubted, for he was imprisoned after an incident with one of his workers.) Today, the handful of female makers includes two very prominent craftswomen, namely, Amalia Ramírez (Madrid) and Kathrin Hauser (near Munich). The catalog is preceded by Alberto Cuéllar's in-depth account, of Granada making (pp. 27–151).

David Gansz's writing (pp. 251–288), in places, is fluid and compelling, and he makes one of the most important points admirably well,

namely, that the Granada makers have exported the Andalusian (mainly Torres) and the Madrid (mainly smaller versions of Ramirez and Barbero) designs, probably more than any other Spanish group of luthiers. Javier Molina completes (pp. 289–299) the group of essays with a survey of the makers, past and present in Baza.

The book would lead us to believe that the Granada makers are traditionalists. This, however, is not entirely correct given that there is some “double-top” experimentation and perhaps some carbon-fibre lattice-brace models. Looking through the catalogue, the designs of the *guitarreros* seem to be fairly independent of one another, still leaving me wondering what the defining characteristic(s) of the *escuela Granadina* are. Is it that their guitars, on average, are smaller than those of today?

The photography throughout is of consistent quality, although the printing is a little dark, and the diminutive catalogue representations leaves little to refer to. Despite my reservations, I commend the authors and wholly recommend their book; it is an excellent read. The various essays, although occasionally repetitive (excusable in a collaborative work like this) are sewn together in an excellent manner. I am left with the impression that the *Granadina guitarreros* are harmonious and happy to share their knowledge and experience, through their warmth and generosity. Perhaps that is what makes the Granada “school.”

JAMES WESTBROOK

BRIGHTON & CAMBRIDGE, ENGLAND

Whitney, Quincy. *American Luthier: Carleen Hutchins—the Art & Science of the Violin.* Lebanon, NH: ForeEdge Books, 2016. 312 pp., 16 illus. \$35.00 hardcover ISBN 978-1-61168-592-3; \$34.99 Ebook ISBN 978-1-61168-927-3.

Agree or disagree with her ideas, appreciate her instruments or think they are just interesting experiments, Carleen Hutchins (1911–2009) was a force to be reckoned with, and her work in violin acoustics and lutherie were important features of the twentieth-century violin world. Spurred on by a fascination with stories in which science and art overlap, Quincy Whitney documented the life story of Hutchins, the scientist-cum-chamber music aficionado caught in the June Cleaver world of mid-twentieth-century America. *American Luthier* is the result of nearly two decades of work for Whitney, a journalist who bravely took on the interdisciplinarity necessary in order to write about Hutchins. Carleen