

*Journal of the  
American Musical  
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XLI • 2015



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).  
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair  
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).  
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

canvas to paint the picture of the instrument's regional characteristics and construction techniques. Good charts illustrate bell profiles, bore, and tone-hole sizes.

In addition to four appendixes, there is an illustrated glossary of terms, a comprehensive bibliography, and a general index. The companion DVD has been coded so that the reader can view performances on instruments that are marked with an asterisk in the text. There are so many beautifully photographed illustrations that an index of them would have been a welcome addition to the work, but this is a small criticism considering the outstanding qualities of this important book. Sabine Klaus has given us a unique perspective on the history of trumpets and other high brass instruments. She deserves a hearty Brava for her epic coverage of our instruments. Her work will set a high standard for scholars who continue the story. This five-volume magnum opus will be required reading for brass players and organologists.

RALPH THOMAS DUDGEON

PROFESSOR OF MUSIC, EMERITUS

STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK, CORTLAND

***Inventing the American Guitar: The Pre-Civil War Innovations of C. F. Martin and his Contemporaries*, ed. Robert Shaw and Peter Szego, Milwaukee: Hal Leonard Books, 2013. 310 pages, 178 color plates, 53 black and white photos and illustrations, and glossary. Cloth \$50.00.**

After years of collecting and studying early American banjos, the New Jersey instrument collector Peter Szego began turning his eye toward American guitars of the nineteenth century. Seeking to fill a gap in knowledge about such guitars, in 2008 he and the Philadelphia instrument dealer Fred Oster met with seven other scholars to begin amassing information about the design, dimensions, history, and chronology of guitars made between 1833 and 1867 by Christian Friedrich Martin, the leading American maker of this period. Data about twenty important examples from the Martin workshop revealed much about the production of such instruments. In 2009 a second conference with additional scholars was held to gather data on other Martin guitars, then totaling more than forty instruments.

Two useful things resulted from this American guitar brain trust. The first is the fine book that is the subject of this review, and the second was a wonderful exhibition of about thirty-five early American guitars at New

York's Metropolitan Museum of Art during most of 2014. In his preface to the book, Szego makes clear his debt to Philip Gura's important publication from 2003, *C. F. Martin and His Guitars 1796–1873*. (See my review of that book in this JOURNAL, vol. 31 (2005), 187–191.) Whereas the strength of Gura's study lies primarily in its biographical and cultural history, however, the present book offers valuable information about the guitars themselves.

Over the past twenty years or so, many publications have been devoted to the guitar in all its forms; most have been written for fans of the guitar in general. The present publication is one of the few that furthers our understanding of one particular segment of guitar history, namely its construction and presence in antebellum America.

The book is very handsome, with abundant high-quality color photographs and an attractive layout owed largely to Szego's own hands-on effort in producing it. Forty-five guitars are featured, each identified with a different profile number at the upper corner of the page when it first appears. The reader will find multiple images of each guitar, from overall shots (showing front, back, and side) to countless details illustrating bridges, headstocks, labels, decorative elements, and even period cases. Supplementing these photos are numerous period images of makers and players, advertisements, and shop locations. Scholars will be pleased to find good comparative dimensions of the instruments and diagrams showing bracing patterns. The end material contains measured drawings of two early Martin guitars, from about 1837 and 1841–43. The large format of the book allows all of the images to be presented at a good size.

Were it only for its photos and other illustrations, this book would be invaluable, but the accompanying essays provide text that is both engaging and informative. Five authors were selected to tell the story of early American guitars from different angles. Each contributor is a specialist, and most participated in one or both of the conferences convened by Szego and Oster.

After an introduction by Jayson Kerr Dobney, who curated the exhibition in New York, the book opens with a chapter by the English scholar James Westbrook about Johann Georg Stauffer, the Viennese instrument builder whose work directly influenced the earliest guitars produced by C. F. Martin. This is followed by a well-written chapter by Arian Sheets, curator at the National Music Museum, explaining the background of Martin's work in the Vogtland, a German region long known as a center for instrument making.

Five of the essays were authored by Richard Johnston, whose scholarship about Martin and his instruments had already begun to take shape in a 1997 publication jointly authored with Jim Washburn, titled *Martin Guitars: An Illustrated Celebration of America's Premier Guitar Maker*. Johnson's chapters in the present work provide a unifying thread about Martin guitars, giving an overall structure to the work's narrative. Three important chapters by David Ganz, a peripatetic researcher and writer, provide fascinating insight to the influence of the Spanish guitar in America before 1850, along with an especially useful essay about the Connecticut instrument maker James Ashborn, whose factory produced three times as many guitars as Martin's during the early 1850s. (It was also a nice surprise to encounter information about the Connecticut flute maker Asa Hopkins in this chapter.) The luthier David LaPlante further fleshes out the influence of Spanish guitars on Martin's work with a chapter about instrument making in Cadiz.

In addition to new material about Ashborn, this book provides at least a bit of information about some less-documented American guitar makers who were contemporaries of, and sometimes collaborators with, C. F. Martin, including George Maul, Henry Schatz, and Louis Schmidt.

It is hard to find problems in this publication, but I would single out one present in varying degrees in so many books and journals these days: weak editing. Each essay is generally well written, but the book's overall readability would have been enhanced by reducing overlap in the contents of the various chapters by editors Szego and Robert Shaw, and by deleting needless repetition within some individual chapters. In particular, it was unnecessary repeatedly to tell the story of C. F. Martin's background and emigration to America, though I applaud Ganz's implication that proof is far from concrete about Martin actually apprenticing with Stauffer (138). Likewise, Ganz's essay about Ashborn states in three separate places that Ashborn produced three times as many guitars as Martin during the early 1850s. It is an interesting fact, but one that did not need to be restated. Ganz's chapter also suffers from a slight bit of hyperbole. He refers to the inlay on Ashborn's highest grade guitars as "extraordinary" (160). That inlay may be more intricate and elaborate than is typical on other American guitars of the period, but in terms of fine woodworking, it probably does not rise to the level of extraordinary, although in this context one could argue that "extraordinary" simply means "atypical." Likewise, the description of the fabric interiors of Ashborn's original guitars cases as "dazzling" seems a bit over the top (165).

The most troubling chapter, from an editorial standpoint, is the opening one by Westbrook. Westbrook's research is sound, but he has a habit of loosely using different terms when referring to the same component on a guitar. This problem also occurs in chapters by some of the other authors. It is most noticeable regarding the structures applied to the underside of the guitar's soundboard, most often called "bracing." But in this chapter one also finds the terms "bar" and "strut." The glossary suggests that there might be a reason for using these differing terms, but not one that is convincingly explained. Writers about guitars also seem to struggle when referring to the parts of the instrument's body, especially the soundboard. This is sometimes called the top, sometimes the front, and at least once in this book (14) the face. Another confusing term is "purfling," which most commonly means thin strips of wood or other material inlaid into a channel within the perimeter of a violin's belly and back. With guitars, too often this term is used to refer to decorative material surrounding the edge of the body, which should more accurately be called "binding." Guitar scholars should come to a consensus about these parts and their terminology. At the very least, it would be helpful to see terminology used consistently within a publication.

Very few actual errors are found, but I noticed at least two regarding the unusual harp guitars made by the Philadelphia guitar maker Emelius Scherr. In describing Scherr's reasons for creating an elongated guitar whose bottom end rests on the ground (30 and 35), Johnson incorrectly attributes to Scherr the statement that the benefit of this design is that it moves the guitar away from the player's body, thus avoiding a muffling of the sound. This, however, is my own personal conclusion; I gave Szego my unpublished research on Scherr, and it was never stated by Scherr or any period writer who commented on his guitars. And speaking of Scherr, it is odd to read that "there is no surviving evidence of North American guitar makers who were active before Martin's arrival in 1833" (28). This is clearly contradicted by Scherr's 1831 patent for his harp guitar (30), even if that instrument was not a normal "Spanish" guitar, an instrument that Scherr also produced as early as 1835, if not earlier. It also seems unfair to imply that most European guitars in the early 1800s were of "lower quality" than Martin's instruments (30), something chauvinistically suggested by Gura in his book as well. Much more research needs to be done regarding European guitars of this period before making such overarching statements.

These are small quibbles in an otherwise excellent book, whose sound research, excellent photos, and beautiful design far outweigh its minor

flaws. Szego and his colleagues deserve hearty congratulations for presenting much important information and many useful images in an area of guitar research that has hitherto been neglected and sometimes misinterpreted.

DARCY KURONEN

MUSEUM OF FINE ARTS, BOSTON

**Stephen Cottrell. *The Saxophone*. The Yale University Instrument Series. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2012. 390 pp.: 120 black-and-white illus., 22 musical exx., 6 tables. ISBN: 9780300100419. \$45.00 (cloth).**

Stephen Cottrell's long awaited volume offers a comprehensive scholarly history of this iconic instrument. Until now, academic research on saxophone topics has tended to be in the form of "detective work" in DMA theses, but as the author states, "most writing about the instrument occurs in newspapers and magazines or, more recently, on forums and blogs" (xv). From these and from his own exhaustive pursuits, Cottrell's purpose was to synthesize an all-encompassing *book*, the first of its kind. While written for the general reader, there is plenty for pupil and professor alike, with "many other voices" (scholars, journalists, critics, and saxophonists) telling much of the story (xvii). The author is to be commended, for although there appears to be almost no stone unturned in his search for clarity, at no point did the prose collapse under the weight of superfluous facts and data. Considerable print is devoted to anthropology, including the class, cultural, racial, and gender associations in which the saxophone came into its own. Cottrell provides a thoughtful, thorough, and even-handed account from start to finish.

For those new to the subject, the author provides a basic "how-to" introduction to the saxophone, with brief, yet enticingly descriptive overviews with pictures of the instrument and its accessories, along with acoustical and performance considerations. In his biography of Adolphe Sax (1814–1894), Cottrell offers the most complete portrait to date of the celebrated inventor, who, in his long career appears to have had as many successes as setbacks and friends as foes. Sax was an influential figure, as well as a complex psychological study, a man of determination who, as the author states, is "possibly deserving of a more extensive biography" than what is presently available (xvii). Particularly painful for this reader was the missed opportunity to discuss more thoroughly Richard Wagner's impressions, who stated that because of Sax, who worked as a