

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XLI • 2015



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

very good, there are errors in the history, so the wise reader will not rely solely on Montal's book for keyboard instrument history.

All in all, this new edition is a valuable addition to libraries, for the translation, the biographical information about Montal, Paul Poletti's foreword, and the index, but it does have issues. Sturm has done a fine job of creating a very readable translation, retaining the character of Montal's writing. On the other hand, basing this translation on the 1865 edition muddies what was original to the 1836 version, despite the helpful inclusion of parts unique to the 1836 publication as notes or appendices. Published in the last year of Montal's life, who knows under what circumstances the 1865 version was produced. Some comments remained that are clearly irrelevant well before 1865, such as stating that German pianos have thin and weak tone compared to English pianos. The serious scholar can find the original works online without too much difficulty, but the concern is that some well meaning readers will perpetuate outdated "facts" found in this edition.

Lack of bibliography or any other information about his sources for this important figure in piano history is truly unfortunate in terms of its usefulness to scholars. A related fault is Sturm's rather arbitrary and sparse insertion of comments that would be of interest and help to the reader. Still, this is a very valuable edition, particularly for the modern piano technicians who are likely Sturm's primary intended audience.

ANNE BEETEM ACKER
SAVANNAH, GEORGIA

Jérôme Lejeune. *A Guide to Period Instruments—Guide des instruments anciens—Leitfaden durch die historischen Instrumente; A Guide to Musical Instruments vol II, 1800–1950*, Belgium: Ricercar; 2 vols, I: RIC 103, 2009, 200 pp. booklet, many ill. some in color, 8 CDs; II: RIC 104, 2013, 154 pp booklet, many illus., some in color, 8 CDs. EUR 49, www.outhere-music.com.

Have you wondered what a Geigenwerk is or how a csakan is played? Perhaps you want to hear the difference between valved cornets and keyed trumpets or to learn about the origins of the viol family. Are you curious to know how Ravel's *Tzigane* would sound with luthéal or Hindemith's *Langsames Stück und Rondo* played on a traultonium? Perhaps you want to compare Landowska playing Rameau on a Pleyel with a performance on an eighteenth-century harpsichord or note the differences between the violoncello piccolo and viola da spalla? The two-volume *Guide*

to *Musical Instruments* on the Belgian Ricercar label can satisfy your curiosity and more. From the oliphant and *Cantigas de Santa Maria* to prepared piano and Ravel's *Boléro*, this two-volume audio anthology with accompanying text contains a wealth of material covering the full gamut of Western musical instruments.

The lavishly illustrated booklets by Ricercar's founder and the project coordinator Jérôme Lejeune, musicologist at the University of Liège, serves as a brief history of musical instruments. Organized systematically by instrument family, Lejeune provides an excellent overview, but given space limitations, glosses over many of the complications of nomenclature. Volume I was printed in three languages and, even though slightly larger, contains less information than the second volume produced in separate single-language versions. French was the original language, and accuracy is occasionally compromised in translation. Take *basson*, which in French is used to designate not only what in English is called bassoon, but also the dulcian (or curtal). This leads to the dubious statement in the English translation that "in true Renaissance spirit, the bassoon was also built in versions for the higher ranges." Lejeune also conflates dulcian and douçaine (a medieval cylindrical-bored shawm). Illustrations from historical sources and photographs of museum specimens clarify the situation, and dulcians are also heard on the recordings. In addition to a magnificent rendition of a four-part ballet by Praetorius, it is heard in consort. Still, with only *basson* to go by in the notes, users are left to decide whether they are listening to Jérémie Papasergio playing a dulcian or bassoon in the *Fantasia per fagotto solo* by de Selma y Salaverde.

The booklets were not conceived as a definitive source. As their title indicates, they were intended as a guide, and while they go beyond a basic account and introduce obscure instruments like the poïkilorgue, saxhorn, orphicleïde, harmoniconcorde, echo cornet, and *harmonica de bois et de paille* and occasionally provide some important historical observations (read, for instance, the account of the octobass), their primary purpose is to annotate the audio anthology.

The sixteen CDs follow a different organizational principle from the text. Instead of being grouped by instrument type, the recordings are organized chronologically in stylistic and thematic categories. One can choose to listen to "Renaissance Dances," "Bach and His Time," "Adolphe Sax and his Studio," "Keyboard Instruments played by Franz Liszt," or explore music "From the time of Charles Koechlin's Treatise." The result is a compelling sequence of performances that can be listened to on its own merits. With references to the CD tracks embedded

in the text, it is easy to find appropriate audio examples to illustrate specific instruments, but cross-referencing in the reverse direction is not as straightforward. For information on the instruments in a particular track, users have to use the index to find the relevant passage in the booklet. The index in vol. 1 is in French, so English users wishing to learn about the cervelat, manicordion, or chalemie will find the process complicated. Information on the precise specimens used on the recordings is sparse. In Léon Pillaut's *Pièce caractéristique*, a Bechstein piano from c.1900 was used, but the maker of the featured instrument, the viola d'amore, is nowhere identified. Likewise, it would be useful for instance to know what clarinet is heard in the recording of Brahms' Quintet.

This is probably the most extensive compilation of recorded examples of musical instruments ever assembled, with more than twenty hours of music and an impressive coverage of not only standard instruments and their predecessors but also rarer specimens. The majority of recordings are drawn from pre-existing releases from the Ricercar catalogue or other early-music specialist labels with lacunae filled with special commissions. The source recordings could have been better documented, particularly in vol. 1.

Well beyond simple demonstrations, all the tracks, even those of seeming slight musical worth, are high caliber. Listen, for instance to Claude Maury leading a performance of Dauprat's *1er Sextuor* on natural horns or Marie-Ange Petit's rendering of the skeleton's music from *Danse macabre* on a historic xylophone. Nineteenth-century salon ephemera are treated with equal respect to recognized masterpieces. Konrad Hünteler's rendition of a *Souvenir des Alpes* by Theobald Boehm is every bit as masterful as Yves Rechsteiner's performance of Liszt's prelude on *Weinen, Klagen, Sorgen, Zagen*. Instruments are represented in solo tracks where their tonal characteristics can be evaluated in isolation. Large-scale works demonstrate how instruments operate in combination. There is Renaissance consort music, Baroque chamber music and vocal works, and performances of selected orchestral works from Gossec to Ravel. A slight drawback is that, as on all commercial CDs, the dynamic levels of the tracks are equalized, providing little sense of relative volume. An *alta capella* is no louder than a consort of viols, and a Cavaillé-Coll organ is within the same decibel range as a clavichord.

The anthology is testament to the present state of understanding of the appropriate handling of historical instruments and demonstrates the

impact of historically-informed performance on music from Medieval to modern periods. Despite cautionary remarks on difficulties encountered during the project due to the fragility of the original instruments, there are very few signs that the instruments sound at anything but their best. Some performances are arrestingly beautiful, and as often as being entranced by the sonority of an unfamiliar instrument, I found myself engrossed by the compelling performance and oblivious of the technicalities of a specific instrument.

The second volume covers the developments from 1800 to 1950. It thus stops short of the instruments currently in use in modern symphony orchestras and incorporates some examples of electro-acoustic instruments but makes only passing reference to folk and vernacular genres. Here the text is strongly oriented towards France and Belgium. Quotations from the instrumentation treatises of Berlioz (in both the original and Richard Strauss's revision) and Charles Koechlin provide eyewitness accounts of the changing state of play, and the Paris and Brussels collections provided the bulk of the pictorial sources and playable historical instruments. However, while Paris and Brussels may have led instrument technology, the most progressive musical compositions emanated from Germany and Italy. The audio examples somewhat redress this imbalance, but the two most influential orchestrators of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, Wagner and Strauss, are conspicuously under-represented.

The recordings of the keyboard instruments deserve special mention and illustrate what has been lost with the ubiquitous modern concert grand. CPE Bach's famous *Abscheid von Silbermannischen Klavier* receives a captivating performance. We hear Chopin on Pleyel and Broadwood pianos, two designs he is known to have appreciated, and hearing Brahms *Walzer* op. 39 on an 1871 Grotrian-Steinweg is revelatory. Behind the scenes, Chris Maene's expert maintenance of instruments from his own collection and the Brussels Museum contributed to the quality of many tracks. Only a couple of instrument choices seem inappropriate: a Debussy piano roll is coupled with an 1871 Steinway and a 1900 Bechstein for Saint-Saëns.

The string instruments follow a different developmental trajectory than other families, as they reached definitive form much earlier, but Lejeune still devotes attention to the developments in technique and equipment that affected playing styles from the sixteenth century onwards, and excellent recordings demonstrate these changes.

No instrument plays itself: the quality of a musical performance depends on the symbiotic relationship between instrument and player. Neither can a performance objectively document how a specific instrument sounds. It can only record what one performer can draw out of it on a particular instance. When the same flutist plays the same music on metal and wooden flutes (Toon Fret, playing Debussy's *Syrinx*, vol. 2, CD5), the comparison allows us to discern the contributions of both instrument and player. But players can also "mask" instruments. In volume 1 are we hearing the *pochette*'s unique mode of tone production or the player's idiosyncratic phrasing? Marcel Ponseele presents a convincing performance of the Carl Reinecke *Trio*, but how close can a Belgian Baroque specialist approach the character of a late nineteenth-century Viennese oboe? A few reasonably well-known electric recordings from the early twentieth century are included and capture the timbre of the instruments with reasonable accuracy. They are the closest we can get to how contemporary performers played historic instruments, and serve as a reminder of the chronological and stylistic distance that separates us from many of these historical instruments.

In short, the Ricercar *Guide to Musical Instruments* presents a balanced account of musical instruments as art objects and functional tools for music. It provides an abundance of material that any reviewer would be hard pressed to do justice to. While both volumes will be of interest to educators and musical amateurs, the second, being more directly linked with museum and preservationist projects, is also directed at organologists. With patience, users will learn to mine its riches. It deserves a place in all music libraries and instrument museums and will serve as an indispensable resource for educators, researchers, and music lovers alike.

GEOFFREY BURGESS
PHILADELPHIA, PENNSYLVANIA

Sabine Katherina Klaus. *Trumpets and Other High Brass: A History Inspired by the Joe R. and Joella F. Utley Collection, Volume 2, Ways to Expand the Harmonic Series.* Vermillion, SD: National Music Museum, 2013. 315 pp.; 514 Color illustrations, 102 Black and white illustrations. ISBN: 978-0-98482699-2-9. Companion DVD, ISBN: 978-0-9848269-3-3. \$120.00 (hardcover, with DVD).

This is the second volume of a projected five volumes devoted to a detailed study of the high brass instruments of the Utley Collection at the