

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XLI • 2015



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

cussed traditional cultural beliefs as well as the philosophical perspectives facing contemporary scholars.

Or consider the issue of cultural appropriation and how it applies to many instruments across the globe. It is essential to explain this anthropological phenomenon in entries about instruments such as the *banjo*, and yet the term is not used there nor defined in a general article. Future iterations of the *Grove* would be well served by including interpretive discussions about cultural and sociological issues as they relate to instruments.

GDMI 2014 is an important though flawed work that will dominate many discussions in the coming years. It contains much useful information, but its organization and presentation can be confusing and misleading for users confined to the print edition alone. The editors have made a valiant and often successful attempt to create a work that documents the collective knowledge of a diverse and quickly-changing field. At its best moments, the dictionary manages to even convey a sense of excitement about its subject matter—no small feat for a reference dictionary. Many of its problems, like those of indexing, are not even relevant when using the *Grove Music Online*, and other problems—including the poor illustrations—could be corrected as material from *GDMI 2014* is made available in that format. Until such time as all of its content is uploaded and integrated, the print edition will be necessary. Whether this second edition will have the same widespread and long lasting influence as did the 1984 edition will not be known for many years. Yet, to paraphrase Waterhouse's 1985 observation, the appearance of a major reference work devoted to the subject of musical instruments is *still* an important event.

JAYSON KERR DOBNEY

ASSOCIATE CURATOR AND ADMINISTRATOR

DEPARTMENT OF MUSICAL INSTRUMENTS

THE METROPOLITAN MUSEUM OF ART

Claude Montal. *The Art of Tuning: A Self-Guided Manual for Piano Tuning, Design, Action Regulation, and Repair from mid-19th Century France: For the Piano Owner and Technician, with Guidelines for Training the Blind and Visually Impaired*, translated by Fred Sturm, Kansas City: Piano Technicians Guild Foundation, 2015, lv, 390 pp., illustrations, and music illustrations. ISBN: 978-0-9861851-0-6, \$50.

Happily, the Piano Technicians Guild Foundation has sponsored the first publication of an English translation of the piano tuning and maintenance guides by the blind French piano tuner, technician and maker Claude Montal (1800–1865). Fred Sturm, RPT, has chosen to merge and augment the original 1836 and subsequent 1865 editions of the work originally titled *L'Art d'Accorder Soi-Même son Piano d'après une Méthode Sure, Simple et Facile. Déduite des principes exacts de l'acoustique et de l'harmonie, contenant en outre les moyens de conserver cet instrument, l'exposé de ses qualités, la manière de réparer les accidents qui surviennent à son mécanisme, la manière d'enseigner l'accord aux aveugles, et un traité d'acoustique*. [The Art of Tuning One's Own Piano by a Secure, Simple and Easy Method, deduced from precise principles of harmony and acoustics, containing in addition the means of maintaining that instrument, a description of its qualities, the means of repairing problems that arise in its mechanism, and a treatise on acoustics.] This complete title perfectly gives the character of the work and is a nearly exhaustive summary of the contents. The books were purportedly intended to aid instrument owners, especially those far from a major city with skilled technicians, but were more likely used as a training and reference guide for professional piano tuners and technicians, specifically for training blind in the profession and for skilled craftsmen from other fields.

Montal was a fascinating character, as revealed by the translator's preface. Blinded by a childhood illness, Montal kept active and proved bright and able, including assisting his father, a saddle maker. He entered the Institut National des Jeunes Aveugles [National Institute for Blind Youth] at age sixteen. By age twenty, he taught grammar, geography, and mathematics at the Institute. With another student, Montal taught himself to dismantle and repair pianos and studied everything possible about the theory and practice of tuning. At age thirty he became an independent piano technician and was soon teaching classes in tuning, and buying, repairing and selling used pianos, eventually making pianos of his own design. The classes became the basis for a pamphlet on tuning sold at the Great Paris Exhibition of 1834. This was expanded into the 1836 edition.

Of interest to AMIS members, Montal includes detailed chapters discussing the various types of pianos and their components. Among many gems found throughout the book is a brief discussion of the "false" or over soundboard, clarifying the purpose of that often missing component. Diagrams and descriptions appear for many forms of grand repetition actions and upright variants of the "standard" Wornum type tape

check action. Throughout, the well-executed and labeled diagrams and descriptions of interiors, exteriors, and tools are a delight. The 1836 edition is primarily concerned with the then most common early square pianos, while the 1865 edition appropriately includes many examples of upright piano design as well as grands. Unfortunately but not unexpectedly, Montal focuses on pianos most commonly available in France and in particular those of his own design and make. Likewise he spends a disproportionate amount of time essentially hawking his own inventions, including the so-called expression pedal that simply moves the hammers closer to the strings dynamically while playing. Montal's preference for single escapement actions (not the double) is quite clear. He criticizes the double escapement action of Érard, the immediate forerunner of the modern repetition action, as being too expensive, prone to clicking and other problems, and the difficulty in finding technicians for them outside of major cities.

Of note are Montal's detailed discourse on repairs as well as design and construction choices with topics ranging from the angles of stringing, deflections of the strings at the bridge, and preferred speaking lengths to strike points. His discussion of the evolution of hammer coverings from deerskin to rabbit fur to wool felt and methods of recovering hammers is of particular consequence to restorers and builders. He states clearly that the bass should not overpower the treble. The section on piano strings and their replacement discusses types of wire and gauge correspondences along with instructions for replacing strings for both drilled and undrilled tuning pins. Here is one of several places in this merged edition where it would be helpful to distinguish more clearly between the 1836 and 1865 editions.

The chapters related to tuning are a marvel of concise detail, the delivery obviously honed by an experienced teacher. His exercises and iterative tuning method will be of interest to many. Ever practical, Montal deftly discusses topics such as temperature fluctuations, pitch raising and lowering, tuning pianos to each other or other instruments, and preparing instruments for shipping—issues little different today but for the packing straw.

Montal shows himself as scholar, teacher, and astute self-promoter. He provides very readable summaries of acoustics and the history of the piano, countered by a long self-congratulatory section replete with contemporary reviews of his book and other accolades. Without the descriptions of unusual instruments such as the ocular harpsichord and organ of tastes, they would otherwise likely have been forgotten. While overall

very good, there are errors in the history, so the wise reader will not rely solely on Montal's book for keyboard instrument history.

All in all, this new edition is a valuable addition to libraries, for the translation, the biographical information about Montal, Paul Poletti's foreword, and the index, but it does have issues. Sturm has done a fine job of creating a very readable translation, retaining the character of Montal's writing. On the other hand, basing this translation on the 1865 edition muddies what was original to the 1836 version, despite the helpful inclusion of parts unique to the 1836 publication as notes or appendices. Published in the last year of Montal's life, who knows under what circumstances the 1865 version was produced. Some comments remained that are clearly irrelevant well before 1865, such as stating that German pianos have thin and weak tone compared to English pianos. The serious scholar can find the original works online without too much difficulty, but the concern is that some well meaning readers will perpetuate outdated "facts" found in this edition.

Lack of bibliography or any other information about his sources for this important figure in piano history is truly unfortunate in terms of its usefulness to scholars. A related fault is Sturm's rather arbitrary and sparse insertion of comments that would be of interest and help to the reader. Still, this is a very valuable edition, particularly for the modern piano technicians who are likely Sturm's primary intended audience.

ANNE BEETEM ACKER
SAVANNAH, GEORGIA

Jérôme Lejeune. *A Guide to Period Instruments—Guide des instruments anciens—Leitfaden durch die historischen Instrumente; A Guide to Musical Instruments vol II, 1800–1950*, Belgium: Ricercar; 2 vols, I: RIC 103, 2009, 200 pp. booklet, many ill. some in color, 8 CDs; II: RIC 104, 2013, 154 pp booklet, many illus., some in color, 8 CDs. EUR 49, www.outhere-music.com.

Have you wondered what a Geigenwerk is or how a csakan is played? Perhaps you want to hear the difference between valved cornets and keyed trumpets or to learn about the origins of the viol family. Are you curious to know how Ravel's *Tzigane* would sound with luthéal or Hindemith's *Langsames Stück und Rondo* played on a traultonium? Perhaps you want to compare Landowska playing Rameau on a Pleyel with a performance on an eighteenth-century harpsichord or note the differences between the violoncello piccolo and viola da spalla? The two-volume *Guide*