

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XXXVIII • 2012



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

how the organ has survived in its present home for more than a century, despite dangers and dark periods of time due to fire in the adjacent factory in 1943, periods of disuse, and flood. She documents how the organ was rebuilt in 1909 and again in 1947 by the Aeolian-Skinner Organ Company of Boston, in addition to more recent alterations. Today, the organ is featured in regularly-scheduled concerts with visiting artists from around the globe. The story ends approaching the organ's sesquicentennial in 2013. Owen's narrative is vivid and engaging; it is obviously a story she is deeply inspired to tell.

Visually appealing in its layout, the monograph is profusely illustrated, including stunning photographs of the organ taken through the decades. Of particular note are black-and-white photographs by W. King Covell, taken between 1929 and 1947, and a beautiful set of contemporary color photographs by Len Levasseur. The book is well edited, with few noticeable typographical errors and a typeface that is elegant and easy to read. The organ's specifications from 1863, 1909, 1947, and the present are grouped in the appendices for easy reference. Other sections at the end of the book provide an analysis of music played on the organ in 1863 and a list of recordings made with the instrument on various media.

It is difficult to imagine how the book could be improved. Undeniably a monumental work about a monumental organ and its influence in America, it is a model upon which one hopes other books will follow in detailing other important pipe organs in this country. The book embodies the mission statement of the Organ Historical Society, which established the OHS Press, in its dedication to "documenting and preserving historic pipe organs and to raise public awareness and appreciation of America's organ heritage."

STEPHEN SCHNURR

SAINT PAUL CATHOLIC CHURCH, VALPARAISO, INDIANA

John Milnes, ed. *Musical Instruments in the Ashmolean Museum: The Complete Collection*. Oxford: Oxford Musical Instrument Publishing, 2011. 384 pp., over 300 color photographs, tables, bibliography. ISBN 978-0-9567679-0-5. £290 (hardbound).

For two centuries the Hill family was at the center of the violin trade in England, from the time Joseph Hill (1715–1784) was apprenticed to Peter Wamsley until 1992 when the legendary firm of W.E. Hill & Sons

closed its doors after more than a hundred years in the business. It was perhaps the growing interest in violins of the old master luthiers that led William Ebsworth Hill (1817–1895), founder of the family firm, to be one of the first violin makers to specialize in authentication and restoration of antique instruments. In 1936 the brothers Arthur and Alfred Hill offered the Vice-Chancellor of Oxford “the gift of a choice collection of stringed instruments which they had assembled over many years” (p. 9). In 1939 the Museum received nineteen instruments that became the nucleus of the Hill Collection, which was supplemented with other items from the Hills through the 1940s and a few items of unique merit from other collectors, most notably from Albert Cooper in 1999.

Since the production of David Boyden’s modest *Catalogue of the Hill Collection of Musical Instruments in the Ashmolean Museum, Oxford* (Oxford, 1969), significant items, such as an early cello bow by Carlo Tononi and violins by Rugeri, Lupot, and various English makers, have been added to the museum’s collection. Additionally, the state of knowledge and the expectation of documentation have grown, while Boyden’s original catalogue has been out of print for many years. The long-awaited replacement, *Musical Instruments in the Ashmolean Museum*, is a stunning catalogue, in no small part due to the exquisite color photographs by Tucker Densley, beautifully reproduced in large format on high quality paper. The catalogue, which measures 370 x 270 mm, provides multiple views of each instrument, the violins shown full size. The items of the collection are organized by instrument family, with informative introductory texts on each family, as well as a detailed description of each individual item, written by experts in the different fields: viols (pp. 15–80) by Michael Fleming; lire da braccio (pp. 81–96) by John Dilworth and Michael Fleming; violins (pp. 97–216) by John Dilworth and Carlo Chiesa; bows (pp. 217–250) by Tim Baker and Derek Wilson; citterns (pp. 251–276), five-course guitars (pp. 277–316), and English guitars (pp. 317–352) by Stephen Barber, Sandi Harris, and Lynda Sayce; and keyboard instruments (pp. 353–363) by Charles Mould, along with a general introduction by Jon Whiteley, a bibliography, and well-written biographies of the instrument makers represented in the collection.

While not a large collection, the rarity and remarkable quality of the instruments in Oxford’s Ashmolean Museum, make this a collection of great importance. Among the instruments worthy of special mention are rare viols by Gasparo da Salò, Girolamo Amati, and John Rose, and violins and violas by da Salò, Andrea Amati, Girolamo Amati, Nicolò Amati,

Antonio Stradivari, Francesco Rugeri, and Jacob Stainer, as well as a guitar by Stradivari. The most famous instrument is Stradivari's "*Messie*" violin of 1716, Ash. 17, which has the distinction of being the best-preserved violin by this most famous of makers. In particular, the varnish is in nearly immaculate condition (p. 164), and the instrument shows hardly any sign of wear, leading some experts to question its authenticity, culminating most recently in conflicting dendrochronological reports, variously assigning the youngest growth ring on the table to 1682, 1788, and 1844 (p. 165, note 13). While most experts believe in the authenticity of the instrument and the dendrochronology showing the earliest date, it is clear that the topic will continue to generate discussion. The "*Messie*" owes its excellent state of preservation to the fact that throughout its life it has hardly ever been played. When the Parisian luthier Jean-Baptiste Vuillaume acquired the violin in 1855, he decided to modernize it, replacing the original bass bar, extending and resetting the original neck, and replacing the original fittings (tuning pegs, tailpiece, button, and bridge) with new ones made especially for the instrument (p. 154). The original bass bar has been preserved but not the other fittings.

The descriptions of the instruments are generally well-written, giving enough background explanation to be intelligible to the lay reader, while providing a substantial portion of the information sought by the scholar. However, in most cases descriptions of the bowed strings neglect any mention of the bridges, which are presumably nearly all newer replacements, or what considerations went into selecting the strings, which all appear to be of recent manufacture. Consequences of such considerations are important. According to the description of a sixteenth-century viol by Gasparo da Salò (Ash. 03), described as possibly a bass, "With the present neck and bridge position, the stringing is problematic. Taking into account the string technology of the time, a standard bass tuning in *d* (*d'* - *a* - *e* - *c* - *G* - *D*) would imply a pitch level significantly higher than the modern standard of *a* = 440Hz." (p. 36) Unfortunately, no explanation is given for the rationale behind the length of the current neck, nor the positioning of the bridge which is shown slightly crooked. It is approximately aligned with the notches in the very high sound holes which are roughly at the center of the c-bouts, as opposed to the much lower bridge position chosen for Ash. 02, which also has high sound holes roughly centered horizontally with the c-bouts. Furthermore, we are given no indication as to what the authors believe to have been "the string technology of the time" (p. 36); the instrument as illustrated is

strung in plain gut, but with no discussion of how the strings would have been manufactured or what gauges were chosen.

Enquiring minds will always want to know more than can be fit into any single volume. The violin trade is well known for a culture of secrecy that does not always differentiate between science and mystique. While doing much to disseminate knowledge and conserve exemplary instruments of the past, the Hills were also contributors to the atmosphere of selective transparency, and sometimes it feels as though this collection, most of which was bequeathed by the Hills to future generations, hides as much as it reveals. Despite the wonderful illustrations in this catalogue, including many useful detail views, *Musical Instruments in the Ashmolean Museum* includes no x-ray images, which could show details such as nails and bracings, nor any pictures inside instruments, which could show blocks, linings, patches, and other construction details. Information regarding what is original versus restoration or reconstruction is often unclear. Despite containing more than 150 entries, the book's bibliography omits some significant, pertinent titles. For example, it fails to make reference to the work of Benjamin Hebbert, Rudolf Hopfner, Karel Moens, William Monical, or Robert Seletsky.

Overall, *Musical Instruments in the Ashmolean Museum* is a breathtaking achievement that makes this collection accessible anywhere a book can be shipped. In many regards, the instruments can be studied more closely through this catalogue than they could be in the course of an ordinary visit to the museum. It is easy to spend many edifying hours poring over this catalogue, which will be a real boon to scholars, instrument builders, and anyone else interested in fine instruments.

JOHN MORAN

PEABODY CONSERVATORY OF MUSIC, BALTIMORE

Günter Dullat, *200 Jahre Patente, Privilegien und Gebrauchsmuster im internationalen Holz- und Metallblasinstrumentenbau; Quellenkataloge zur Musikgeschichte*, 48, Wilhelmshaven: Florian Noetzel, 2010. 332 pp.: 88 illus. ISBN 3-7959-0925-2. €198 (hardbound).

Günter Dullat is known for a number of German articles on wind instruments: a series of books reproducing German patents for woodwinds, brass instruments (*Metallblasinstrumenten*), and saxophones that he self published (1985–1987, 1995), and books on the clarinet (Frankfurt, 2001) and saxophone (1999, latest edition, Wilhelmshaven, 2011). He