

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XXXVII • 2011



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

organ built between 1755 and 1767 for S. Nicolò l'Arena in Catania (Sicily) by the Neapolitan builder Donato del Piano. (The instrument was restored in 2004, and details can be found on the organ builder's web page: <http://www.mascioni-organs.com/restauridemo/cataniaasnic.htm>.) Although the article lacks the technical details (even the disposition) that organists or builders would seek, it presents numerous photographs and constitutes a fascinating glimpse into an unfamiliar, even surprising, facet of Italian organ building that merits more rigorous investigation. One does wonder, however, why the article indicates fifty-note, short-octave compasses while the website gives fifty-four-note compasses with chromatic bass octaves.

Although the articles vary considerably in quality and clarity, and some seem to be mere accumulations of data, the material presented is of undeniable interest and should do much to advance investigation. Unlike so many Spanish publications, the volume includes a good index.

EDWARD PEPE

OAXACA, MEXICO

Stewart Pollens. *Stradivari. Musical performance and reception* [series]. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2010. 335 pp.: 16 color photographs, 122 black-and-white photographs and diagrams, 32 tables. ISBN: 978-0-521-87304-8. £90.00 (hardcover).

Antonio Stradivari is certainly the musical-instrument maker who has been the subject of the largest number of publications in the history of organology, beginning with François-Joseph Fétis and Jean-Baptiste Vuillaume's biographical booklet of 1856 (to my knowledge the first study of a musical-instrument maker). From the last decade of the nineteenth century there has been a continuous tradition of publications, ranging from authoritative research to fiction; these have included technical and stylistic studies of Stradivari's instruments, but also writings focused on his house, his handwriting, and even the etymology of his surname. Among this myriad of publications, three have become classics: *Antonio Stradivari: His Life and Work, 1644–1737*, published by the Hills in 1902, the first comprehensive study of the maker's style; Simone F. Sacconi's *I "segreti" di Stradivari*, published in 1972, which analyzes Stradivari's construction methods from a technical point of view; and Herbert K. Goodkind's *Violin Iconography of Antonio Stradivari*, also published in 1972. In a field where the most important

makers have rarely been the subject of even a single book, therefore, the first question that springs to mind upon seeing a volume bluntly entitled *Stradivari* is: "can there be anything new to say?"

In his publications, Stewart Pollens always takes on important individuals and topics (the early pianoforte, Bartolomeo Cristofori, the bow maker François Xavier Tourte, Giuseppe Guarneri del Gesù, and Stradivari himself), usually reaching original results and making worthy, if sometimes controversial, contributions where almost everything seemed to have been said. This is due at least in part to his ability to combine his historical interests with the scientific and technical skills developed in his thirty years as conservator of the musical instruments at the Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York. In previous work on Stradivari, for example, he challenged the authenticity of the violin known as "The Messiah," arguably Stradivari's most famous surviving instrument, raising the most heated debate of the end of the century in the field of musical-instrument attribution. Since discussion of this issue was carried on outside the main organological journals, it is useful to have the article "Le Messie," *Journal of the Violin Society of America* 16, no. 1 (1999): 77–101, reprinted here, in Appendix 3. Somewhat surprisingly, there is no mention of the original publication, nor of the ensuing debate, a synopsis of which would have greatly enriched the book.

Pollens's most important contribution to Stradivari studies is his analysis and interpretation of the models, tools, and drawings that survived from the maker's workshop. There are over seven hundred such items, most of them sold by Stradivari's heirs to Count Cozio di Salabue in 1775; they then passed through the hands of collectors until 1930, when they were donated by Giuseppe Fiorini to the city of Cremona, where they are now exhibited in the Museo Stradivariano. The items were first listed and described by Simone F. Sacconi, who used them as a basis for many of his conclusions on Stradivari's violin-making technique. An inventory/catalogue with many photographs was published by Andrea Mosconi and Carlo Torresani in 2001.

Only part of this material, however, is related to violin making; the rest, mostly ignored by previous scholars, concerns an impressive variety of string instruments. This variety is only partially represented by surviving instruments, and the material documents one of the latest examples of the tradition known from at least the sixteenth century of workshops that produced the entire catalogue of string instruments

(with the exception of keyboard instruments, which began to be produced by specialists sometime during the sixteenth century). If this variety comes as a surprise, it is only because attention to Stradivari's violin making, and the number of his surviving violin-family instruments, have largely overshadowed everything else. The reader should thus not be surprised that only about one third of Pollens's book is concerned with violins, while the rest deals with Stradivari's lesser-known instruments.

The volume begins with an introductory chapter that briefly describes the historical context and critically reviews the main studies of Stradivari's biography and production. Chapter 2 describes the historical vicissitudes that led from Stradivari's workshop to the Cremona collection's present state. In chapter 3, the models, grouped by instrument typology, are discussed and compared with surviving instruments (if any), and the wider historical and cultural contexts are examined, along with technical considerations. While chapters 3 and 4 include discussion of violin forms and patterns, fittings, and setup, chapters 5 through 10 are concerned, respectively, with the production of dance-master's kits, viols and *viola d'amore*, lutes, *mandole* and mandolins, guitars, and harps. A final chapter is headed "The Workshop," but the title and position are slightly misleading. It contains various information about sources on geometry, proportions, and acoustics that Stradivari could have used for the design of his instruments (but apparently did not), followed by a step-by-step reconstruction of his violin-making process. This chapter is simply an undeclared synthesis of Sacconi's approach: it uses the same structure and method (presenting a theoretical basis of the project, and then following the course of the construction from the making of the ribs to the varnish) and the same sources (Stradivari's models, tools, and traces of surviving instruments). Pollens's slight updates (particularly concerning varnishes) largely confirm Sacconi's conclusions. A few of Sacconi's theories are refuted, such as the use of concentric circles to graduate the plates, which has had an enormous influence on violin restoration (p. 253). Pollens disagrees on the use of complex geometry (the golden section, Archimedean and Vignola spirals for the head, etc.) in the design of the models, and previously addressed this point in *The Violin Forms of Antonio Stradivari* (London: Peter Bidduph, 1992).

Three appendixes conclude the volume: the third is the above-mentioned reprint. The first, although not strictly related to the book,

is a very interesting set of photographs of the bass bars from the Hill collection, dating from 1615 (the otherwise unknown Filippo Fratello) to 1800 (Vincenzo Panormo), and including four by Stradivari (ca. 1680, 1703, 1704, 1719—the latter mistakenly written as 1714 on p. 122). The second appendix is a transcription of a paper read by Thomas Salmon in 1705 for the Royal Society of London, demonstrating a temperament for the viol. This temperament is discussed in chapter 6 of the volume under the reasonable assumption (unfortunately proven false), that it could have explained a surviving paper pattern for the division of a viol neck.

Returning to the question that opened this review, it is clear that there was—and there may be still—more to be said about Stradivari's work, if we abandon the narrow perspective handed down to us from the late nineteenth century. Pollens's book offers a refreshing and more balanced perspective, and some new ideas that bring us a little closer to understanding a production system that is still largely unclear. The volume is innovative in targeting a widening circle of readers. While Sacconi, the Hills, and Goodkind spoke almost exclusively to violin-makers, Pollens also writes for the scholar, the collector, and for the intellectually interested reader, in a style that is compatible with modern organology. He attempts in this way to close one of the largest gaps in this discipline—that between organology and violin studies.

Of course this attitude presents its own risks, and sometimes the reader is surprised, in what is a mostly specialized book, by very basic information, such as what a viol is and how to distinguish it from a cello (pp. 143–44). Some technical explanations seem aimed at a reader who will hardly be able to follow the rest of the discussion.

A more serious problem with the book is its somewhat fragmentary organization, a result of the bringing together of several separate publications from the author's previous work: much of the content of chapters 3, 6, and 7, plus Appendix 3 had been published before. While the article dedicated to the comparison between an English temperament system and a pattern for a viol neck was perfectly satisfactory in its original published state, it is somewhat incongruous after the argument has been refuted. The chapters are in themselves very interesting, but the book lacks a unifying idea that is developed throughout.

Also unusual in a monograph and more typical of the style of an article or a review is the harsh criticism of scholars such as Jeannine Lambrechts-Douillez and Karel Moens, who are both dismissed as ex-

amples of scholars who deny the very existence of Stradivari (pp. 41 and 97n1). Both scholars have declared this statement absurd. A section on pages 41–45 is dedicated to refuting the data collected by Herbert Heyde, suggesting that Stradivari must have led a large workshop. Pollens's conclusion that, on the contrary, Stradivari was assisted only by his son Francesco (p. 46) is based on even weaker evidence and contradicts all we know about the Italian production system of these years. Further work on this point is clearly needed. Definitely not the author's fault is the poor quality of the photos, whose clarity and crispness could be much improved in a second edition.

These criticisms, somehow unavoidable in a review, should not undermine interest in the book's contents, and in the quantity and quality of the subjects discussed and the conclusions drawn. The book is a new type of study on Stradivari that will hopefully open a new interest among organologists in historical violin making, drawing on the systematic application of scientific principles—an approach that had emerged already in Pollens's 1999 article "The Messiah." The new volume will be useful to the informed readers who are not specialists in the field, and also to the Stradivari experts, who will find here both new ideas and a critical synopsis of most of the existing literature.

GABRIELE ROSSI ROGNONI
FLORENCE, ITALY

Tom Wilder, editor. *The Conservation, Restoration, and Repair of Stringed Instruments and Their Bows*. London and Montreal: Archetype Publications and IPCI-Canada, 2010. Volume I, 774 pp.; volume II, 366 pp.; volume III, 338 pp.: 1,000 photographs, 300 technical drawings, CD-ROM. ISBN: 978-1-904982-41-8. \$1,395.00 (cloth).

This compendium of essays represents a monumental effort to present a variety of leading opinions concerning how we care for, handle, and interpret violin-family instruments and their bows. The work is divided into three volumes, totaling 1,478 pages. The first volume, entitled *General Issues Concerning Stringed Instruments and Their Bows*, contains fifty-two essays divided into seven parts: Pernambuco and Its Conservation; Conservation, Restoration, and Repair; History, Collections, and Connoisseurship; Documentation; Materials; Infestations; and Surfaces. A CD-ROM presents the standard documentation forms described in this volume, for easy use by those inclined to follow this