

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XXXVII • 2011



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

BOOK REVIEWS

Mauricio Molina. *Frame Drums in the Medieval Iberian Peninsula.* Kassel: Edition Reichenberger, 2010. xvii, 198 pp.: 38 black-and-white illus. ISBN: 978-3-937734-71-2. €39,00.

Mauricio Molina's multi-disciplinary study connects organology, iconography, sociology, anthropology of music, and aspects of performance practice in medieval music. These various strands of knowledge come together in considering the rarely discussed subject of *Frame Drums in the Medieval Iberian Peninsula*. The book is a shortened adaptation of the author's doctoral thesis (CUNY, 2006), which was awarded the Higiní Anglés Prize from the University's Fundación para la Música Ibérica.

The research covers two geographical areas: the Iberian Peninsula and the Mediterranean region. The Iberian Peninsula (Spain and Portugal) is introduced as a wide geographical and rich cultural space combining Christian, Islamic, and Jewish traditions during the medieval period. The Mediterranean Sea facilitated commercial and cultural exchanges across Europe and North Africa, and study of this region allows the author to explore the significance of various symbolic concepts from ancient and modern cultural perspectives. With good reason, Molina focuses on frame drums and avoids any lengthy excursion into the complexities of the political and cultural history of medieval Iberia.

The book has six chapters in three sections. The first two chapters explore iconographic and textual sources, focusing on the terminology of instruments. The middle two present the most challenging material, addressing, for example, the social context of female players, and advancing arguments about the symbolic meaning of frame drums. In keeping with the author's activities as a musician and director of a group dedicated to medieval music, he concludes with two chapters on performance practice, including discussion of reconstructing the instruments' musical timbre based on their material elements and a hypothesis about playing techniques, adopting examples from modern popular traditions in Northern Spain and the Maghreb territories.

In the first chapter, "Frame Drums in Medieval Iberian Iconographical Sources," Molina uses visual representations from miniatures, paintings, and sculptures located in various parts of the Iberian Peninsula. Since few Muslim and Jewish images survive, the greater part of this repertoire comes from Christian sources. Although the sources are

restricted, the results allow us to approximate some important aspects, such as the ensembles in which these instruments were included. As the author emphasizes in the introduction (pp. 6–10), representations of the frame drums reveal two parallel ideas in the past: they were related to pagan rituals and therefore rejected by the orthodox ideology of the Christian church; and they were often depicted in festivities as played by women who often also danced. Conversely, some allegorical religious illustrations were acceptable to Christians, and the symbolic nature of these ideas is the basis for the author's "exploration of the Medieval Iberian frame drum" (p. 10).

The changing morphology and decoration of the drums also receives close consideration. The frame drums were produced in round and square shapes, both with and without rattles, and were rarely decorated. Finally, visual sources also provide insights into the technique used to play the frame drums, a subject considered in greater depth in the final chapter, "Reconstructing the Performance Practice." Medieval playing techniques were directly related to the position of the hands, and this appears to have differed little from current practices in traditional oral music in various regions of the Iberian Peninsula and the Maghreb. The section on iconography unfortunately lacks sufficient images and information on the context of the musical ensembles; musical contexts are revealed in more depth in the textual sources of the central chapters. However, in these chapters too there is a lack of visual sources.

The textual sources and terminology of the frame drums are analyzed in the second chapter, "Terminology of the Medieval Iberian Frame Drums." A table brings together much material (p. 18), introducing terms common in the Iberian Peninsula, including Arabian as well as Christian. The section starts with the Latin term *tympanum/tympanis*, which was widespread in European literature and transferred to all sorts of other membranophones. Undoubtedly, the most extensively used terms were *pandero* (and its derivatives *panderete* and *pandeiro*) and *adufe* (and its derivatives *adulfe* and *alduf*). *Pandero*, *panderete*, and *adufe* (the Spanish variant of the Arabic *duff*) seem to have been used in later periods, for example in literature and dictionaries of the sixteenth century, as various experts including Pepe Rey have shown (Pepe Rey, "Nominalia, instrumentos musicales en la literatura española desde La Celestina [1499] hasta el Criticón [1651]," in *I Encuentro Tomás Luis de Victoria y la música española del siglo XVI: Los instrumentos musicales en el siglo XVI* [Ávila: Fundación Cultural Santa Teresa, 1997], 41–100). However,

evidence more compelling than Spanish lexicons comes from the instruments' earlier existence. Even today square-shaped instruments played by women are named *pandero* and *pandeiro* in Northern Spain and Portugal.

In chapter three, "Frame Drum Players and the Instrument's Social Context," Molina identifies and categorizes the types of players who used frame drums: men/women or professionals/non-professionals; female and male players differed in status, and their playing differed in social function and performance context. Citing Christian texts and iconography, the author notes the participation of women, including Muslim and Jewish, who played *panderos* or *adufes*. Among the conclusions of this chapter is the possible relationship of these medieval practices to popular traditions today in Spain, Portugal, and the Maghreb.

Chapter four, "Symbolism of the Iberian Frame Drums," discusses the negative meaning of these instruments that derived from their relationship with paganism and the misogynist beliefs of the players. On the other hand, Molina explores their positive meaning through different sacred texts (especially the Bible) and the image of the Jewish heroine Miriam and her companions. Interestingly, Molina suggests that the frame drums depicted among the Romanesque porticoes of the twenty-four ancients from the Apocalypse are a sign of the unity of the Old and New Testaments.

Chapter five, "Reconstruction of the Sound Colour of Medieval Iberian Frame Drums: A Study of Their Structures and Materials," studies the few available sources on the wood, metal, and leather used in the construction of such instruments. The intention is to approximate ideal objects with structures and materials like those of the medieval period, to reproduce the different timbres of the instruments.

The last chapter concerns performance practice and includes a section on the "Repertoire of Frame Drums." Modern interpreters of music will find this aspect of the book particularly intriguing, as it offers new ideas about the use of frame drums. An analysis using iconography is followed by a study of the hand positions of players of *panderos* and *adufes*. Molina primarily considers medieval dance-songs and suggests a number of pieces in the repertoire that might have contained frame drums, such as the *Cantigas de Amigo*, *Cantigas de Santa María de Alfonso X El Sabio*, and the *Llibre Vermell*. Performances of these works with frame drums may be quite successful, but we should be careful not to overuse the instruments. At present, the interpretation of early Iberian

music often introduces percussion to distinguish it from other European repertoires. As a result, some interpreters of this music, and even that of the Renaissance and Baroque, have added unsystematic and capricious membranophones of all kinds and popular idiophones from North Africa.

This book is essential reading for organologists, iconographers, and players of medieval music. Moreover, the editorial quality of the book is very high, following in the tradition of other books published by Reichenberger in Kassel in their *De Musica* series edited by Máriaus Bernadó and Juan Luis Milán.

CRISTINA BORDAS
MADRID, SPAIN

Günter Dullat. *Verzeichnis der Holz- und Metallblasinstrumentenmacher auf deutschsprachigem Gebiet von 1500 bis Mitte des 20. Jahrhunderts.* Tutzing: Hans Schneider, 2010. 578 pp.: 2 color illus., 5 tables. ISBN: 978-3-7952-1285-8. €98,00.

For those concerned with wind instruments, *The New Langwill Index: A Dictionary of Musical Wind-Instrument Makers and Inventors* by William Waterhouse (London: Tony Bingham, 1993) has become an indispensable reference book. However, as Waterhouse declares with a quote from Goethe's *Italienische Reise* in the preface to this dictionary, "such a work is never finished." In the eighteen years since the publication of *The New Langwill Index* (hereafter referred to as *TNLI*), research into the lives and work of brass and woodwind makers has continued. For the German-speaking regions, Günter Dullat has considerably expanded our knowledge through numerous publications. His *Verzeichnis der Holz- und Metallblasinstrumentenmacher auf deutschsprachigem Gebiet von 1500 bis Mitte des 20. Jahrhunderts* summarizes and expands on these earlier works and includes new information in a format that is inspired by *TNLI*.¹

1. These include: *Blasinstrumente und deutsche Patentschriften 1877–1970*, 3 vols. (Nauheim: author, 1985–1987); *Metallblasinstrumentenbau: Entwicklungsstufen und Technologie* (Frankfurt am Main: Bochinsky, 1989); *Holzblasinstrumentenbau: Entwicklungsstufen und Technologien* (Celle: Moeck, 1990); *Fast vergessene Blasinstrumente aus zwei Jahrhunderten: Vom Albisiphon zur Zugtrompete* (Nauheim: author, 1992); *Internationale Patentschriften im Holz- und Metallblasinstrumentenbau*, vol. 1, *Saxophone (1): Belgien, Deutschland, Frankreich, Großbritannien, Tschechoslowakei; 1846–1973*; vol. 2, *Saxophone (2): Vereinigte Staaten (USA); 1916–1973* (Nauheim: author, 1995); *Der Musikinstrumentenbau und die Musikfachschule in*

The *Verzeichnis* sets out to include the majority of woodwind and brasswind instrument makers in German-speaking areas from 1500 to the mid-twentieth century. But Dullat lists only makers recorded as independent craftsmen with a master's certificate or license to be self-employed. This choice is justified in one way, as the names of these masters are the ones likely to be found on signed instruments. Regrettably, he thus excludes many persons who may have made instruments in their homes, particularly in towns such as Graslitz and Markneukirchen and their vicinities, where the concept of instrument making as a cottage industry was widespread. Fortunately, he lists important suppliers of parts, such as specialized valve makers who were registered as masters or licensed to work independently.

Dullat utilizes primary sources such as address books, museum, firm and exhibition catalogues, and documents in municipal and church archives. He also incorporates important secondary literature that was not available to Waterhouse (at least not in a published format), including Erich Tremmel's *Blasinstrumentenbau im 19. Jahrhundert in Südbayern* (Augsburg: Wißner, 1993)—a substantial amount of Tremmel's work entered *TNLI* as "private communications"; Herbert Heyde's *Musikinstrumentenbau in Preußen* (Tutzing: Hans Schneider, 1994); Rudolf Hopfner's *Wiener Musikinstrumentenmacher 1766–1900: Adressenverzeichnis und Bibliographie* (Tutzing: Hans Schneider, 1999); and Enrico Weller's *Der Blasinstrumentenbau im Vogtland von den Anfängen bis zum Beginn des 20. Jahrhunderts* (Horb am Neckar: Geiger Verlag, 2004). Dullat includes all these regional studies but inconsistently excludes the German-speaking part of Switzerland with the argument that Walter R. Kälin's *Die Blasinstrumente in der Schweiz* (Zurich: Gesellschaft der Freunde alter Musikinstrumente, 2002) covers this region.

Following an explanation of how each maker is entered alphabetically, then chronologically among families, Dullat points out some problems with the material, such as changing orthography, and changes in the numbering systems of houses and names of streets. He then gives an overview of the development of wind musical-instrument

Graslitz von den Anfängen bis 1945 (Bad Nauheim: author, 1997); *Saxophone: Erfindung und Entwicklung einer Musikinstrumenten-Familie und ihre bedeutenden Hersteller*, 3rd ed. (Nauheim: author, 1999); *Klarinetten: Grundzüge ihrer Entwicklung; Systeme, Modelle, Patente, verwandte Instrumente, biographische Skizzen ausgewählter Klarinettenbauer* (Frankfurt am Main: Bochinsky, 2001); and *Holzblasinstrumente und Metallblasinstrumente auf Auktionen, 1981–2002* (Plau am See: author, 2002).

makers in the German-speaking regions. He starts this discussion with the earliest known Nuremberg trumpet maker, Hans Frank, who is first mentioned in 1427, leaving the reader slightly puzzled why the subtitle of the book commences with "1500" rather than the fifteenth century.

In a section that deals with Nuremberg's prominence as a center for wind-instrument production in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, Dullat points out that the craft organizations in Nuremberg were similar but not equivalent to guilds in other cities, as they were not self-controlled but rigidly regulated by the city council. He describes the dependency of the Nuremberg craftsmen on the dealers who sold their goods all over Europe, as trumpet makers were normally not allowed to leave the city. Dullat's comment that all types of wind instruments except cornetti were made in Nuremberg is incorrect; there is sufficient evidence that the turners as well as the *Pfeifenmacher* (woodwind makers) in Nuremberg offered cornetti among their assortment.

Dullat then describes the rise of wind-instrument makers in other German cities and towns from the seventeenth through the nineteenth century. He outlines the changes in the nineteenth century that led to mass production and a drop in quality standards. In Markneukirchen and its vicinity, important factors for the development of large factories were the availability of cheap labor, the use of steam engines and of electricity, and the development of the railway, which made possible the large-scale export of musical instruments from Saxony. Specialized crafts such as bell making, valve making or instrument assembly emerged as a result of improved training. In the second half of the nineteenth century, schools for musical-instrument makers and museums with collections of instruments that could be used as models, such as the Musikinstrumentenmuseum in Markneukirchen, were established to guarantee a high standard of education. However, during the nineteenth century the gap between rich and poor makers grew, because small workshops and untrained home workers depended on prosperous dealers, who not only had the capital to deliver the necessary materials but also dictated the prices of the manufactured goods.

Dullat concludes his overview with the twentieth century. During World War II some German musical-instrument makers, in particular those who manufactured brass instruments, were forced to convert their production to armament. After the war, important centers such as Markneukirchen and Graslitz were under Soviet rule and their factories were converted into large-scale communist operations. Some

smaller workshops managed to relocate to neighboring Bavaria, establishing new clusters for the manufacture of musical instruments, for example in Geretsried.

The historical overview is followed by a section on practices of signing wind musical instruments that does not add any substantial new information to Herbert Heyde's comprehensive study on "Makers' Marks on Wind Instruments" in the introduction to *TNLI*. Five tables follow the introductory chapters: a chronological overview of German patents between 1877 and 1967; German patents and utility models granted to foreign inventors after 1870; German utility models after 1970; German patents after 1970; and a list of trademarks. The same information can also be found in the main section of the dictionary under the names of the respective patentees, but these chronologically and alphabetically arranged tables increase the usefulness of this material considerably. However, the patents are not complete, but only excerpts from a larger work on the topic (Günter Dullat, *200 Jahre Patente, Privilegien und Gebrauchsmuster im internationalen Holz- und Metallblasinstrumentenbau* [Wilhelmshaven: Florian Noetzel, 2010]).

Systematically comparing *TNLI* with Dullat's entries under the letters A and B alone reveals over 150 new entries, demonstrating the immense wealth of new material. Many of the entries taken over from *TNLI* have been enriched by birth and death dates that were hitherto unknown, and by a considerable amount of information about the makers' families, such as marriages and births of children. However, one dearly misses references to surviving instruments, which make *TNLI* such a valuable reference book for further research. Also missing are the pictorial transcriptions of signatures and the family trees that make information in *TNLI* so accessible. Compared with *TNLI* the time frame is extended and some firms are traced further back or covered to the present. An example is the entry on the important firm of Alexander in Mainz. In *TNLI* the article begins with Franz Ambros Alexander as the family's first wind-instrument maker; Dullat goes back two more generations to the founder of the family, the tailor Dietrich Alexander, who moved to Mainz in 1662/63. One of Dietrich's sons, Franz Caspar (1729–1789), the father of Franz Ambros, was a turner, information not found in *TNLI* but important because it provides a clue as to Franz Ambros Alexander's likely training with his father. Also new is the fact that Franz Ambros was listed as a lute maker at his death. We learn also that Kaspar Anton, Franz Ambros's son, was for

several years a journeyman in Vienna, as confirmed by certificates with exact dates from the Viennese makers Wolfgang Küss (January 1, 1823) and Stephan Koch (May 1, 1824). According to *TNLI*, Kaspar Anton and his older brother Philipp were two of four brothers who founded the firm "Gebrüder Alexander," the others being Claudius and Martin. Dullat does not mention the latter two, stating that Kaspar Anton and Philipp have to be considered the founders of the firm; and readers of both books will remain puzzled about the role of the other two brothers. While only Franz Ambros receives an individual entry in *TNLI*, Dullat devotes a separate section to each family member, giving new information on marriages, children, and court appointments. In *TNLI* information about the firm succession ceases with Friedrich Sebastian Anton, while we learn from Dullat that Friedrich Sebastian Anton's brother Georg Philipp Jr. ran the firm with his widowed sister-in-law after her husband's death, and that it was continued after Georg Philipp's death by his widow, his sister-in-law and his uncle Franz Anton, the first member of the family to become a brass-instrument maker. Dullat also presents more facts on the members of the next two generations, Philipp Johann Christoph and his sons Anton Julius and Hans-Peter. Information on instrument designs is given as a list of patents and descriptions of improvements. Curiously, no mention is made of the destruction of the firm during World War II, nor is a list of addresses provided. Dullat's new information on the firm comes from personal communication with Anton Julius Alexander and is partly based on material in the firm archives.

Reading *TNLI* and Dullat's book side by side reveals the benefits of the newer work. It is clearly not meant to replace *TNLI*, but to update and expand it and is best used in conjunction with the older work. When reading both books side by side, the shortcomings of Dullat's book are not felt, since one can look at *TNLI* family trees while filling in the additional information from the *Verzeichnis*.

A book of this scope is bound to show some minor problems. For example, in the entry for Gustav Adolf Wagner we are informed that this maker was trained by Albin Heckel in Dresden. Looking at the cross-reference, the reader is slightly puzzled as to whom this entry actually refers, as both August Albin Heckel Jr. and Robert Albin Heckel were active in Gera, not in Dresden. *TNLI* clarifies that Wagner trained with Friedrich Alwin Heckel, a fact that is amply supported by the style of Wagner's instruments. Dullat's mistake originates in an entry in

Herbert Heyde's Leipzig trumpet catalogue (*Trompeten, Posaunen, Tuben* [Leipzig, 1980]), which he uncritically adopted.

Some other shortcomings, such as slightly inconsistent cross-referencing (for example the cross-reference to Schott & Söhne in the entry on Carl August Müller leads to the entry on Bernhard Schott), a date lacking in one of the entries (Jakob, Hugo Moritz), and some missing secondary literature—such as Klaus Pechstein's very important article on Nuremberg master's marks, "Die Merkzeichentafel der Nürnberger Trompeten- und Posaunenmacher von 1640," *Mitteilungen des Vereins für Geschichte der Stadt Nürnberg* 59 (1972)—do not reduce the tremendous value of Dullat's new book, as long as it is understood as complementary to *TNLI* rather than as a substitute. The *Verzeichnis* must be added to the library of all those who are concerned with wind musical instruments.

SABINE K. KLAUS
 NATIONAL MUSIC MUSEUM
 THE UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH DAKOTA

Thomas Steiner, editor. *Cordes et claviers au temps de Mozart: Actes des Rencontres Internationales harmoniques, Lausanne 2006 / Bowed and Keyboard Instruments in the Age of Mozart: Proceedings of the harmoniques International Congress, Lausanne 2006. Publikationen der Schweizerischen Musikforschenden Gesellschaft / Publications de la Société Suisse de Musicologie, Serie II, vol. 53.* Berne: Peter Lang, 2010. 376 pp.: 12 color plates, 105 black-and-white figs., 12 graphs, 5 diagrams, 4 tables, 42 musical exx., 79-minute CD with 27-p. illustrated booklet, 1 inserted errata p. ISSN: 1012-8441, ISBN: 978-3-0343-0396-5. \$58.95.

In the twenty-one years since the landmark exhibition *Die Klangwelt Mozarts* (Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna, 1991), our view of late eighteenth-century instruments and performance practice has expanded in important ways. Some of these are explored here by ten contributors to the conference *Cordes et claviers au temps de Mozart*, held in Lausanne in 2006 under sponsorship of the *harmoniques* Foundation.

Rudolf Hopfner's brief essay on violin making in Mozart's orbit offered a preview of a major exhibition on this topic, then in preparation. Using Stainer's work as a model, luthiers such as Stadlmann, Fichtl, and Thir in Vienna and Schorn and Mayr in Salzburg developed

individual styles that depart in varying degrees from Stainer's, while Geissenhof in Vienna turned to Stradivari for inspiration. Aided by photos, X-rays, and CT scans, Hopfner summarizes constructional details of the instruments and related bows.

Clive Brown follows with a critical look at the relevance of Leopold Mozart's *Violinschule* for understanding his son's violin music. With many musical examples, Brown argues that Leopold's didactic treatise offers only a starting point, and that matters of bowing, articulation, portamento, tremolo, and other vital aspects of Mozartian performance are better comprehended through a wider range of evidence, including notational conventions and early twentieth-century recordings (notably of the Klinger Quartet); the latter, Brown believes, might convey aspects of classical practice more accurately than do some present-day "authentic" renditions. Next, Michelle Garnier-Panafieu widens the focus by examining the phenomenal growth of classical string quartet music, mostly intended for amateur performance. She places this development in geopolitical context, taking account of the diffusion of the genre and its stylistic diversity in central Europe, Italy, France, and England.

Florence Gétreau then surveys portraits of Mozart at the keyboard, essentially providing a well-illustrated catalogue of the extant pictures, a thorough bibliographic apparatus, and reflections on the identification, purpose, and significance of these images. The original art works vary considerably in quality and level of detail, but taken together they provide a contemporary glimpse of Mozart, especially as a child prodigy, that transcends written accounts.

Roughly three-quarters of this profusely illustrated book concerns keyboard instruments. Richard Maunder sets the scene by recapitulating the salient points of his book *Keyboard Instruments in Eighteenth-Century Vienna* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998), with a nod to subsequent research by Michael Latcham and Alfons Huber. Maunder's explanations of different keyboard types, Viennese short-octave arrangement, representative piano actions, and special tonal effects will be helpful to readers unfamiliar with the surprising range of instruments available in Mozart's day.

Michael Latcham's eighty-page essay "Johann Andreas Stein and the Search for the Expressive *Clavier*" describes and analyses the two surviving harpsichord-pianos of this innovative, versatile builder, who was highly regarded by Mozart and very influential on the future course of

Viennese piano making. Latcham summarizes Stein's career, his output, and his fascinating efforts toward expanding possibilities for tonal and dynamic expression. One wishes for more discussion of Stein's organs, but relatively little material survives. Instead, Latcham concentrates on stringed keyboards, showing how Stein's work both synthesized and departed from established models, leading him to such inventions as the Poly-tono-clavichordium and Melodica, his hybrid claviorgan in Göteborg, and culminating, so far as practical music making is concerned, with the remarkable vis-à-vis instruments in Verona and Naples. The restored Verona example, heard here on the CD, is remarkable for its dual nature, sparkly and incisive yet dynamically nuanced; yet one can imagine that the effort of keeping it in tune, and its bulk, would have limited its usefulness.

Reinhardt Menger introduces two other instruments featured at the conference: a tangent piano by Johann Wilhelm Berner (Hamburg, 1796) and a 1783 Stein grand. Jean-Claude Battault delves more deeply into the pianos of Pascal Taskin, providing a biographical summary, analysis of construction, lengthy descriptions from the *Mercure de France* and the Académie des Sciences, and a handy bibliography and discography. While Taskin's approach to the piano seems both imaginative and tentative, his pianos testify to France's tardy acceptance of this newcomer.

Equally interesting is Daniel Piollet's treatment (based on his study published in 1988) of the little-known Parisian organ builder Jean-Baptiste Schweickart (1751–1819), whose chamber organs and organized pianos represent types that appealed to an aristocratic clientele. Judging from the surprising number of extant examples and those mentioned in inventories and advertisements, such instruments were more widely used in domestic circumstances than is generally recognized. Unfortunately, few have been restored or copied, leaving us with a still-unbalanced appreciation of classical keyboard resources.

Writing from the complementary standpoints of musician and scientist, Stephen Birkett presents two moderately technical but enlightening studies. The first explores the dynamic behavior of piano-action models typical of Stein's and Walter's instruments. Using ultrafast video, Birkett demonstrates that assumptions deduced from static relationships and measurements of parts are inadequate for explaining how these actions feel in performance and how they relate to diverse approaches to eighteenth-century piano technique. In the second,

Birkett extends previous studies of “iron” music wire and reports on his progress toward replicating it commercially according to historical practices. The scope of his inquiry extends into the nineteenth century, and touches on methods of dating wire samples.

The book concludes with catalogue descriptions and clear detail photos of eight keyboard instruments (two of them modern copies) featured at the conference, and biographical statements of the authors, whose contributions (in German, French, and English) are provided with summaries in the other languages. An index would have been useful.

The CD, entitled *Claviers mozartiens* (Lyrinx strumenti, LYR 2251), records stylish performances by Pierre Goy (president of the *harmoniques* Foundation) of seven works by Mozart, using the 1777 Stein vis-à-vis harpsichord-piano, a copy by Thomas Steiner of a 1772 Hubert clavichord, and square pianos by Baumann (1782) and Beck (1773). The accompanying trilingual booklet with text by Christopher Clarke gives additional photos and essential data about these instruments, including temperaments and pitch levels. The whole package is highly commendable, attractively produced, and well worth its price.

LAURENCE LIBIN
RAMSEY, NEW JERSEY

Luisa Morales, editor. *Domenico Scarlatti en España: Actas de los Symposia FIMTE 2006–2007*, Estudios de música de tecla española, no. 2 / *Domenico Scarlatti in Spain: Proceedings of FIMTE Symposia 2006–2007*, Studies in Spanish Keyboard Music, no. 2. Garrucha, Almería: Asociación Cultural LEAL, 2009. 384 pp.: 136 black-and-white illus., 28 tables, 27 musical exx., index. ISBN: 978-84-613-1806-3. €85,00 (paper).

The present volume follows *Cinco siglos de música de tecla española*, which functioned as a kind of proceedings for symposia held between 2002 and 2004 during the Festival Internacional de Música de Tecla Española (FIMTE) directed by Luisa Morales. *Domenico Scarlatti in Spain* includes studies presented in the symposia of 2006 and 2007, the 250th anniversary of that composer’s death. Also responsible for *Claves y pianos españoles: Interpretación y repertorio hasta 1830: Actas del I y II Symposium Internacional Diego Fernández de Música de Tecla Española, Vera-Mojácar, 2000–2001* (Almería: Instituto de Estudios Almerienses; LEAL, 2003) (containing an important catalogue of surviving Spanish key-

board instruments), Morales has emerged in recent years as a leading Spanish scholar of stringed keyboard instruments.

A word on the title seems in order, since it does not really reflect or do justice to the volume's content. Apart from an introductory essay by Morales that reviews the outlines of Domenico's peripatetic life (a veritable symbol of the internationalism of his time, Scarlatti was born in Naples and died in Madrid after making important stopovers in Rome and Lisbon and visits to Paris and perhaps London) and Gerhard Doderer's essay on Scarlatti (and Carlos Seixas) in Lisbon, the book has less to do with the composer's activities than with his milieu. Doderer's essay does present important new information on Scarlatti's career and creative output, but not in Spain. Indeed, the research topics are not geographically limited to what modern readers might think of as Spain. Of course we must remember here the complicated history that made Naples and Sicily (as well as at times various other parts of what since 1861 constitutes the nation of Italy) part of the Spanish empire. Still, studies on Scarlatti's trip to Florence, instrument building in Rome, or his Portuguese period exceed the announced purview. In fact, seven of the volume's eleven organological studies belong to the chapter entitled "Keyboard Instruments: From Naples to Lisbon." In short, it might have been better simply to have left "Spain" out of the title and instead made a virtue of the wide geographic scope of the information presented.

It also seems worthwhile to remember that the eighteenth century saw a kind of "colonization" of Spain and Portugal by Italy in the form of an intense "Italianization" of musical cultures there. So that in spite of the modern tendency to think in terms of the nation-state and national identity (to identify and distinguish surviving instruments as "Spanish," "Italian," "Portuguese," etc.), such notions are often less than helpful when applied to earlier periods when boundaries were shifting and often more porous—sometimes with political, economic, religious, and cultural ramifications that could be profound for local populations. Giuliana Montanari's essay clarifies the problem of thinking along the lines of national schools when she points out that of the twenty-two harpsichords in Ferdinando de' Medici's collection in 1700 only nine conform to the stereotypical registration of two sets of 8' strings. And John Phillips wrestles with the identification of a piano that has some characteristics considered typically Spanish and others that are unique.

Readers of this journal will be happy to hear that the book—apart from one main section, “Sonatas,” that focuses on Scarlatti’s music (along with that of Sebastián Albero) and most of Doderer’s essay—emphasizes organological investigation. Topics include the construction of stringed keyboard instruments in what is now Italy (Naples, Rome, Sicily) and a Florentine instrument collection visited by Domenico and his father Alessandro. Naples is of special interest here, since Scarlatti presumably spent his formative years there and was employed as organist in the Royal Chapel from 1701 until he left for Venice and then Rome. Alessandro was born in Palermo, and the two studies of instrument building in Sicily included in the volume offer fascinating insights into a little-explored field.

The recent work of both John Koster and Francesco Nocerino has been central to the identification of a Neapolitan school of instrument building and to recognition of that city’s importance as a center for the manufacture and exportation of instruments. Koster’s essay summarizes the construction characteristics (instrument shapes, layouts and scalings, choice of construction materials, molding forms, bracing strategies, rose construction, decorations, etc.) that identify the Neapolitan school (more fir was used there than elsewhere in Italy, for example). Importantly, the author also offers caveats concerning identifying instruments through a rigid application of geographically associated characteristics since, like Scarlatti, builders could also be peripatetic and take ideas and construction methods with them. At the same time, methods and ideas also lingered, making dating difficult at times. Nocerino’s study is based on the analysis of archival documentation from the period of Spanish influence and offers important proof of both the quantity and variety of instruments constructed in Naples. (Author’s note: Neapolitan positive organs were requested as far away as Mexico City Cathedral by chapelmaster Ignacio de Jerusalem in 1758.)

Focusing on Spanish string instruments, meanwhile, Cristina Bordas Ibáñez and Rafael Marijuán Adrián bring us up to date on instrument building in Valladolid (Palencia). Michael Latcham continues his investigation of the fascinating combination instruments (varied pairings of harpsichord, fortepiano, and organ as well as imitation stops), as they were constructed in the last part of the eighteenth century in Spain. Fortunately, there is also something of interest for organists and organ builders—Luciano Buono’s study of the impressive three-in-one

organ built between 1755 and 1767 for S. Nicolò l’Arena in Catania (Sicily) by the Neapolitan builder Donato del Piano. (The instrument was restored in 2004, and details can be found on the organ builder’s web page: <http://www.mascioni-organs.com/restauridemo/catania.nic.htm>.) Although the article lacks the technical details (even the disposition) that organists or builders would seek, it presents numerous photographs and constitutes a fascinating glimpse into an unfamiliar, even surprising, facet of Italian organ building that merits more rigorous investigation. One does wonder, however, why the article indicates fifty-note, short-octave compasses while the website gives fifty-four-note compasses with chromatic bass octaves.

Although the articles vary considerably in quality and clarity, and some seem to be mere accumulations of data, the material presented is of undeniable interest and should do much to advance investigation. Unlike so many Spanish publications, the volume includes a good index.

EDWARD PEPE
OAXACA, MEXICO

Stewart Pollens. *Stradivari. Musical performance and reception* [series]. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2010. 335 pp.: 16 color photographs, 122 black-and-white photographs and diagrams, 32 tables. ISBN: 978-0-521-87304-8. £90.00 (hardcover).

Antonio Stradivari is certainly the musical-instrument maker who has been the subject of the largest number of publications in the history of organology, beginning with François-Joseph Fétis and Jean-Baptiste Vuillaume’s biographical booklet of 1856 (to my knowledge the first study of a musical-instrument maker). From the last decade of the nineteenth century there has been a continuous tradition of publications, ranging from authoritative research to fiction; these have included technical and stylistic studies of Stradivari’s instruments, but also writings focused on his house, his handwriting, and even the etymology of his surname. Among this myriad of publications, three have become classics: *Antonio Stradivari: His Life and Work, 1644–1737*, published by the Hills in 1902, the first comprehensive study of the maker’s style; Simone F. Sacconi’s *I “segreti” di Stradivari*, published in 1972, which analyzes Stradivari’s construction methods from a technical point of view; and Herbert K. Goodkind’s *Violin Iconography of Antonio Stradivari*, also published in 1972. In a field where the most important

makers have rarely been the subject of even a single book, therefore, the first question that springs to mind upon seeing a volume bluntly entitled *Stradivari* is: “can there be anything new to say?”

In his publications, Stewart Pollens always takes on important individuals and topics (the early pianoforte, Bartolomeo Cristofori, the bow maker François Xavier Tourte, Giuseppe Guarneri del Gesù, and Stradivari himself), usually reaching original results and making worthy, if sometimes controversial, contributions where almost everything seemed to have been said. This is due at least in part to his ability to combine his historical interests with the scientific and technical skills developed in his thirty years as conservator of the musical instruments at the Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York. In previous work on Stradivari, for example, he challenged the authenticity of the violin known as “The Messiah,” arguably Stradivari’s most famous surviving instrument, raising the most heated debate of the end of the century in the field of musical-instrument attribution. Since discussion of this issue was carried on outside the main organological journals, it is useful to have the article “Le Messie,” *Journal of the Violin Society of America* 16, no. 1 (1999): 77–101, reprinted here, in Appendix 3. Somewhat surprisingly, there is no mention of the original publication, nor of the ensuing debate, a synopsis of which would have greatly enriched the book.

Pollens’s most important contribution to Stradivari studies is his analysis and interpretation of the models, tools, and drawings that survived from the maker’s workshop. There are over seven hundred such items, most of them sold by Stradivari’s heirs to Count Cozio di Salabue in 1775; they then passed through the hands of collectors until 1930, when they were donated by Giuseppe Fiorini to the city of Cremona, where they are now exhibited in the Museo Stradivariano. The items were first listed and described by Simone F. Sacconi, who used them as a basis for many of his conclusions on Stradivari’s violin-making technique. An inventory/catalogue with many photographs was published by Andrea Mosconi and Carlo Torresani in 2001.

Only part of this material, however, is related to violin making; the rest, mostly ignored by previous scholars, concerns an impressive variety of string instruments. This variety is only partially represented by surviving instruments, and the material documents one of the latest examples of the tradition known from at least the sixteenth century of workshops that produced the entire catalogue of string instruments

(with the exception of keyboard instruments, which began to be produced by specialists sometime during the sixteenth century). If this variety comes as a surprise, it is only because attention to Stradivari's violin making, and the number of his surviving violin-family instruments, have largely overshadowed everything else. The reader should thus not be surprised that only about one third of Pollens's book is concerned with violins, while the rest deals with Stradivari's lesser-known instruments.

The volume begins with an introductory chapter that briefly describes the historical context and critically reviews the main studies of Stradivari's biography and production. Chapter 2 describes the historical vicissitudes that led from Stradivari's workshop to the Cremona collection's present state. In chapter 3, the models, grouped by instrument typology, are discussed and compared with surviving instruments (if any), and the wider historical and cultural contexts are examined, along with technical considerations. While chapters 3 and 4 include discussion of violin forms and patterns, fittings, and setup, chapters 5 through 10 are concerned, respectively, with the production of dance-master's kits, viols and *viola d'amore*, lutes, *mandole* and mandolins, guitars, and harps. A final chapter is headed "The Workshop," but the title and position are slightly misleading. It contains various information about sources on geometry, proportions, and acoustics that Stradivari could have used for the design of his instruments (but apparently did not), followed by a step-by-step reconstruction of his violin-making process. This chapter is simply an undeclared synthesis of Sacconi's approach: it uses the same structure and method (presenting a theoretical basis of the project, and then following the course of the construction from the making of the ribs to the varnish) and the same sources (Stradivari's models, tools, and traces of surviving instruments). Pollens's slight updates (particularly concerning varnishes) largely confirm Sacconi's conclusions. A few of Sacconi's theories are refuted, such as the use of concentric circles to graduate the plates, which has had an enormous influence on violin restoration (p. 253). Pollens disagrees on the use of complex geometry (the golden section, Archimedean and Vignola spirals for the head, etc.) in the design of the models, and previously addressed this point in *The Violin Forms of Antonio Stradivari* (London: Peter Bidduph, 1992).

Three appendixes conclude the volume: the third is the above-mentioned reprint. The first, although not strictly related to the book,

is a very interesting set of photographs of the bass bars from the Hill collection, dating from 1615 (the otherwise unknown Filippo Fratello) to 1800 (Vincenzo Panormo), and including four by Stradivari (ca. 1680, 1703, 1704, 1719—the latter mistakenly written as 1714 on p. 122). The second appendix is a transcription of a paper read by Thomas Salmon in 1705 for the Royal Society of London, demonstrating a temperament for the viol. This temperament is discussed in chapter 6 of the volume under the reasonable assumption (unfortunately proven false), that it could have explained a surviving paper pattern for the division of a viol neck.

Returning to the question that opened this review, it is clear that there was—and there may be still—more to be said about Stradivari's work, if we abandon the narrow perspective handed down to us from the late nineteenth century. Pollens's book offers a refreshing and more balanced perspective, and some new ideas that bring us a little closer to understanding a production system that is still largely unclear. The volume is innovative in targeting a widening circle of readers. While Sacconi, the Hills, and Goodkind spoke almost exclusively to violin-makers, Pollens also writes for the scholar, the collector, and for the intellectually interested reader, in a style that is compatible with modern organology. He attempts in this way to close one of the largest gaps in this discipline—that between organology and violin studies.

Of course this attitude presents its own risks, and sometimes the reader is surprised, in what is a mostly specialized book, by very basic information, such as what a viol is and how to distinguish it from a cello (pp. 143–44). Some technical explanations seem aimed at a reader who will hardly be able to follow the rest of the discussion.

A more serious problem with the book is its somewhat fragmentary organization, a result of the bringing together of several separate publications from the author's previous work: much of the content of chapters 3, 6, and 7, plus Appendix 3 had been published before. While the article dedicated to the comparison between an English temperament system and a pattern for a viol neck was perfectly satisfactory in its original published state, it is somewhat incongruous after the argument has been refuted. The chapters are in themselves very interesting, but the book lacks a unifying idea that is developed throughout.

Also unusual in a monograph and more typical of the style of an article or a review is the harsh criticism of scholars such as Jeannine Lambrechts-Douillez and Karel Moens, who are both dismissed as ex-

amples of scholars who deny the very existence of Stradivari (pp. 41 and 97n1). Both scholars have declared this statement absurd. A section on pages 41–45 is dedicated to refuting the data collected by Herbert Heyde, suggesting that Stradivari must have led a large workshop. Pollens's conclusion that, on the contrary, Stradivari was assisted only by his son Francesco (p. 46) is based on even weaker evidence and contradicts all we know about the Italian production system of these years. Further work on this point is clearly needed. Definitely not the author's fault is the poor quality of the photos, whose clarity and crispness could be much improved in a second edition.

These criticisms, somehow unavoidable in a review, should not undermine interest in the book's contents, and in the quantity and quality of the subjects discussed and the conclusions drawn. The book is a new type of study on Stradivari that will hopefully open a new interest among organologists in historical violin making, drawing on the systematic application of scientific principles—an approach that had emerged already in Pollens's 1999 article "The Messiah." The new volume will be useful to the informed readers who are not specialists in the field, and also to the Stradivari experts, who will find here both new ideas and a critical synopsis of most of the existing literature.

GABRIELE ROSSI ROGNONI
FLORENCE, ITALY

Tom Wilder, editor. *The Conservation, Restoration, and Repair of Stringed Instruments and Their Bows*. London and Montreal: Archetype Publications and IPCI-Canada, 2010. Volume I, 774 pp.; volume II, 366 pp.; volume III, 338 pp.: 1,000 photographs, 300 technical drawings, CD-ROM. ISBN: 978-1-904982-41-8. \$1,395.00 (cloth).

This compendium of essays represents a monumental effort to present a variety of leading opinions concerning how we care for, handle, and interpret violin-family instruments and their bows. The work is divided into three volumes, totaling 1,478 pages. The first volume, entitled *General Issues Concerning Stringed Instruments and Their Bows*, contains fifty-two essays divided into seven parts: Pernambuco and Its Conservation; Conservation, Restoration, and Repair; History, Collections, and Connoisseurship; Documentation; Materials; Infestations; and Surfaces. A CD-ROM presents the standard documentation forms described in this volume, for easy use by those inclined to follow this

proposed standard. The second volume, entitled *Stringed Instruments and Techniques for Their Conservative Restoration and Repair*, contains fifty-three essays in five parts: Basic Maintenance, Setup, and Preventive Procedures; Counterforms, Moulds, and Casts; Surface Interventions; The Body; and The Scroll and Neck. The final volume, *Bows and Techniques for Their Conservative Restoration and Repair*, contains thirty-seven essays in three parts: Basic Maintenance and Preventive Procedures; The Stick; and The Frog. There are 122 contributors.

The project was initiated with the founding of IPCI-Canada, an affiliate of the International Pernambuco Conservation Initiative. Tom Wilder, the Toronto-based luthier who is president of IPCI-Canada, coordinated, funded, and edited the work, the proceeds of which will go to support the conservation of pernambuco. Contributions to the compendium were solicited via a call-for-papers initiated in 2002, and submissions were evaluated by a panel of violin and bow makers, restorers, dealers, and a few professional conservators and scholars. In spite of its nature as a compendium of viewpoints, the work bears all the hallmarks of an extremely thoughtfully prepared and carefully packaged reference source. It is quite clear that it is not intended to replace standard reference works such as violin dictionaries and the classic on violin repair, *Violin Restoration: A Manual for Violin Makers* (Los Angeles: Weisshaar-Shipman, 1988) by Hans Weisshaar and Margaret Shipman. Neither is it a textbook from which a novice could learn standard procedures for common repairs. It is, however, an essential supplement for any comprehensive library dealing with musical instruments, and a particularly fine documentation of the current thoughts of some of the leading violin restorers, conservators, and scholars worldwide—in essence, a dialogue between experts from a variety of professional and geographic backgrounds.

For makers, restorers, and conservators, it will best serve those with an advanced knowledge of their profession, for whom many of the ideas contained within may be directly applied to their existing skills; the techniques described may spur further innovation. However, even for those beginning a formal course of study, a careful reading will prove instructional and thought-provoking, though one should avoid the temptation to delve into advanced techniques without a secure knowledge of the basics, which this work does not provide. For those with general or historical interests in musical instruments, with no intention of ever working on a string instrument, this set will provide an

essential primer in important concepts regarding the nature of musical instruments as objects: on the competing roles of violins as primary documents of their time, as working tools, and as works of art or stores of individual wealth.

The first volume contains the essays most likely to be of general use to those with interests in instruments besides the violin, and to the museum profession. A section is devoted to pernambuco, the wood whose endangerment has inspired a call to action among conscientious violin and bow makers worldwide. Likewise, throughout the volume, there are essays focusing on various materials used in violin and bow making, including their origins, sourcing, working characteristics, chemical composition, and, where applicable, substitutes. Sections on animal glues, ivory, horn, bone, tortoiseshell, mother-of-pearl, metal alloys, synthetic adhesives, pigments, oils, solvents, and varnishes have wide applicability to other sorts of musical instruments.

A section bearing the same title as the entire work highlights the care with which physical intervention is treated. Increased awareness of the concepts of restoration, repair, and conservation is critical to the survival of the original features and the character of historical musical instruments, especially those still in working use. Essays in this section explore how attitudes toward modifications to instruments have changed over time. Essays by Charles Beare and Andrew Dipper draw on concrete examples of former and current techniques, while Robert Barclay and Marco Tiella present more theoretical approaches. This section could have been significantly expanded, as a thorough grounding in these concepts profoundly affects one's approach to the physicality of these objects. While the philosophy of mindfulness has increasingly played a role in the repair of working instruments, such professional standards can never be enough emphasized, and it is important that choices are made deliberately rather than haphazardly, particularly when an instrument holds value as a primary historical document, not merely as a performing instrument or *objet d'art*.

An essay that might have been especially apropos would have focused on historical setup, including fittings, stringing, geometry of bridge, nuts, and saddles, and internal components in different times and places, including the twentieth century. Too often, such features of an instrument, revealing the original tonal and aesthetic choices of the maker, are obliterated when an instrument is "cleaned up" for sale or playing. When an instrument is understood in its own context, it may

be possible to achieve the required performance results with the least intrusive actions. A more-detailed history of repair techniques might have included discussion of when modifications might be preserved as part of the significant history of the instrument, and when they might detract from its aesthetics or functionality. These are very tricky issues that warrant more discussion.

The section on History, Collections, and Connoisseurship provides a fascinating look at some recent research on historical bows, the history of the violin market and the origins of instrument collecting, and issues of authenticity and expertise. While not everyone will be interested in the details of the Dodd family of bow makers, covered by Philip Kass, or the styles of French bow tips, described by Matthew Wehling, these essays are particularly good examples of close studies of the physical and historical characteristics of bows, a subject that can be particularly disorienting to non-specialists. Friedemann Hellwig, Laurence Libin, and Roger Hargrave each make thought-provoking, important, and even controversial points about the epistemology of historical musical instruments, not limited to violins and their bows. Above all, their essays reinforce the idea that interpreting musical instruments is extraordinarily difficult even from a purely academic perspective. Various scientific tools are at our disposal, but attribution can often come down to opinion, and, as Hargrave warns, large sums of money increase the stakes to a terrifying degree for any potential buyer of a valuable musical instrument.

Documentation is a critical first step for organizing and comparing the data that we can gather from musical instruments, and is the essential building block for understanding their construction and history. A section of this volume describes some documentation techniques and proposes a consistent standard for documentation of violins and bows, forms for which are provided in the book and on a supplementary CD-ROM. The standards are similar to those already used in certain types of museum cataloguing and in technical drawings, but the idea here is to instruct others as to their general applicability and ensure consistent recording of information. This will certainly be of value to any professional restorer who wishes to keep files for personal reference and development, as well as to curators wishing to increase their own knowledge and raise institutional standards of documentation. This section, though large, cannot possibly be comprehensive, but it is a good start-

ing point for those who may not have systematically recorded such information in the past, such as those in the general instrument trade.

The final sections in the first volume, concerning materials, insect damage, and varnishes, should prove especially valuable to restorers and conservators, though a general knowledge of such issues is also essential for curators and collectors, who are responsible for the care of musical instruments. The second and third volumes are more specific to the restorer's and repairer's arts, but notable in each are diagrams naming each part of the violin and bow in marvelous detail, along with an index of terms in English, French, Italian, and German. The value of these features cannot be overstated, as nothing exists in prior literature that even approaches the thoroughness presented here.

Overall, *The Conservation, Restoration, and Repair of Stringed Instruments and Their Bows* is an admirable achievement and a work of remarkable generosity on the part of the editor, Tom Wilder, of Wilder & Davis Luthiers, who will devote fifty percent of the receipts from the first five hundred sales to IPCI, then increase the contribution to one hundred percent once production costs are recovered. While the cost of the set is substantial, its position as an important, new standard reference work is unquestionable, and its charitable mission speaks to the passion with which the organizers and writers for the project approached their topic and gave their time.

ARIAN SHEETS
NATIONAL MUSIC MUSEUM