

Journal of the American Musical Instrument Society

VOLUME XXXV • 2009



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

to the value of this book. Even a set of tables as in Phillip T. Young's *4900 Historical Woodwinds: An Inventory of 200 Makers in International Collections* (London: Tony Bingham, 1993)—which could be done on as few as thirty pages—would be of immense value.

I am disappointed that the authors did not use modern means of data management to improve this book and to provide a model for future such publications. This is not an unreasonable demand; every textbook my daughter brings home from junior high school has an electronic supplement with further data, references, and study material. Indeed, Arnold Myers has shown himself to be particularly adept at this, as witnessed by the wonderful web site of the Edinburgh University Collection of Historic Musical Instruments. Happily, he has established a web page to present corrections to the *Catalogue*, <http://www.music.ed.ac.uk/euchmi/upz/uczs.html>.

Overall, the *Catalogue* is a splendid visual achievement; nevertheless, the book is limited by a lack of utility. Even as I recommend that all serious students of the historical clarinet obtain a copy for themselves and another for their institution's library, I urge Drs. Myers and Fricke to produce a data file or tabulation of the clarinets. This would expand the genus of illustrated musical instrument catalog beyond the "coffee-table" book and better meet the needs of modern scholars, who have every right to demand the highest standards of a book describing such an important collection, published by such an important institution. Sir Nicholas would have been very proud of what's here, as it's a fine accomplishment, but even prouder had it been given greater utility through the best modern means available.

ROBERT HOWE

UNIVERSITY OF CONNECTICUT, STORRS

Hugh Cheape. *Bagpipes: A National Collection of a National Instrument.* Edinburgh: National Museums Scotland, 2008. v, 54 pp.: 33 color illus., 24 black-and-white illus., CD-ROM. ISBN: 978-1-905267-16-3. £15.99 (paper).

The piping collection of the National Museums Scotland (NMS), Edinburgh, was largely assembled within three recent decades. From about twenty items in 1872, the collection by 2007 grew to more than 2,100 items, "the largest and most significant national and international col-

lection of such material in the public domain" (pp. 19–20). Included are bagpipes, fragments, accessories, instrument-making tools, documents, sheet music, and sound recordings. Portions are also displayed in the National Piping Centre, Glasgow, and the Edinburgh University Collection of Historic Musical Instruments. The collection is by no means limited in scope to Scotland or the United Kingdom. The CD-ROM describes a substantial bequest of instruments and documents from Jean Jenkins (1922–1990), an ethnomusicologist specializing in Islamic music.

The CD-ROM could easily stand on its own. It includes approximately ninety screens of prose and illustrations, forming a series of independent narratives. These are sometimes parallel to chapters of the book, but at other times introduce a new level of emphasis on selected topics. Beyond this, the disc includes a searchable catalog of more than two thousand records of the piping collection of the NMS as of 2007, as well as a discographical essay. The author, Hugh Cheape, was until recently head of the Scottish Material Culture Research Centre of NMS. His subtext is that surviving instruments—artifacts of the material culture of music—have a story to tell, and that the story may be at odds with received notions.

The subtitle of the book is doubly steeped in irony. Contrary to the pronouncements of many commentators, the Highland bagpipe—Scotland's "national" instrument—evolved relatively recently and in the shops of Lowland makers, the author argues. And despite the national celebration of this instrument, there was until recently no representative collection of it in Scotland. Addressing these twin paradoxes, Cheape gives a brief revisionist history of the loud, outdoor Highland pipe that has come to connote Scotland today. He gives equal attention, however, to two early types of quieter pipes that were in widespread use until the mid-nineteenth century: the pastoral pipes and the union pipes.

"An inherited conventional wisdom . . . suggested that the Highland bagpipe was originally hand-made in the Highlands with locally available materials such as holly, laburnum, bone and horn and that the earliest instrument was an analogue of today's bagpipe" (p. 134). This myth was long supported by a set of Highland bagpipes bearing the date 1409, which the NMS acquired by bequest in 1912. But researchers now believe that these pipes are a reconstruction dating from the late nineteenth century. Contrary to the myth of a Highland folk

tradition, researchers have found that the “great Highland bagpipe” was made in Lowland cities by professional makers who also produced pastoral and union pipes; all three types showed a diversity of form. Instead of native woods, makers from early times opted for tropical hardwoods such as Caribbean ebony and cocus, which were well suited to detailed work on the lathe.

Bagpipes of various types were played in Scotland from medieval times; a carved gargoyle at Melrose Abbey showing bagpipes appears to date from 1358. During the sixteenth century, “the typical instrument of the burgh pipers was a bellows-blown bagpipe with three drones set in a single large stock. This was generally a slightly smaller instrument than the great Highland bagpipe, and easier to maintain and to play for extended periods such as feasts and weddings” (p. 33). During these years, pipers were trained in clan-supported schools. The clan patronage declined in the eighteenth century following the Jacobite Wars, along with the schools. Cheape punctures another detail of the received myth when he reports that the great Highland bagpipe was “created in fact in the last quarter of the eighteenth century and adopted as archetype in the first quarter of the nineteenth century” (p. 131). Beginning in 1781, the Highland Society of London sponsored competitions that soon instilled the image of the piper as kilted Highland warrior. Cheape traces the Highland bagpipe’s current form to the standardizing influence of such competitions, where first prize was a set of great Highland pipes. Such pipes accompanied army regiments across the globe as they advanced Britain’s imperial ambitions.

Even before the Highland bagpipe evolved into a military or quasi-military instrument, other Scottish and British bagpipes were influenced by the stylistic demands of European concert music. Both the pastoral and union pipes, Cheape argues, were designed “to make bagpipe music appeal to sophisticated and discriminating audiences and to fit in a social and musical context of violin, piano or harpsichord, flute and oboe” (p. 80). In his *Compleat Tutor for Pastoral or New Bagpipe* (London, ca. 1746), John Geoghegan explained that the second octave was to be produced by overblowing. The chanter’s narrow conical bore and small tone-holes were inspired by the baroque oboe. Tradition has it that the union or uilleann pipe is an Irish instrument predating the pastoral pipe. Cheape disagrees, locating it within a neo-baroque tradition common to England, Scotland, and Ireland, as a later development of the pastoral pipe.

Among the eighteenth- and nineteenth-century makers discussed in some detail are Donald MacDonald, Hugh Robertson, and Adam Barclay, all of Edinburgh; Malcolm MacGregor of London; and William Gunn of Glasgow. Eighty-one makers from the British Isles are listed on the CD-ROM. Given that bagpipe makers are generally not covered in William Waterhouse's *The New Langwill Index* (London: Tony Bingham, 1993), this list offers a convenient starting point for researchers.

Cheape is well versed in the tangled political and cultural history of Scotland and the British Isles. He discusses, for example, the medieval Lordship of the Isles, which eased cultural exchanges between Ireland and western Scotland, and the Ossianic literary tradition, which brought the union pipe into London theaters during the 1790s. He is comfortable in the Gaelic tongue, to the point that he occasionally neglects to translate Gaelic phrases for his readers (pp. 60, 69, 136). Even in English, the author's lines seem at times to contain bardic elements of alliteration and echo: "the panegyric role of *piobaireachd* [piping] could realistically draw on or be grafted onto the unlettered but not untutored vernacular eulogy and elegy of the bard" (p. 66). Throughout the book, Cheape capitalizes the term Great Highland Bagpipe, as he does Small Pipes, Pastoral Pipes, Union Pipes, and Uilleann Pipes, though not the generic words bagpipe, oboe, and violin. I suspect that these typographical obeisances are bids for safe passage in the culturally embattled field he is traversing (Piper, Highlands, and Islands receive similar treatment).

While the CD-ROM is searchable, the book has no index. The copious bibliography includes early and modern sources of both organology and relevant cultural history, including twenty-seven articles by the author. Taken together, this book and disc provide an eye-opening new perspective on bagpipes in Scotland and beyond, and a welcome gateway to further research.

JAMES KOPP
HOBOKEN, NEW JERSEY