

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XXXV • 2009



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

of repetition (in chapters 2 and 3, for example). As to statements that actually seem questionable, there are extremely few. Chief among these is Noonan's use of the term "New England" (pp. 29 and 33) to describe a region that apparently includes not only Boston, but also New York City and Philadelphia. This may have seemed permissible to the author when contrasting the East Coast to the Midwest, but it is a considerable stretch of this traditional geographical term. Also slightly troubling is Noonan's failure to make much more clear in the body of his text that up until about 1820 the term "guitar" in America nearly always referred to a type of cittern, familiarly known as a "guittar" or "English guitar." He eventually spells this out relatively clearly, but his indiscriminate use of the word guitar on pages 8 through 11 without better clarification could prove confusing to an uninformed reader. In any event, the cittern and its use in America would seem to have little bearing on what happened later with the normal or "Spanish" guitar, and this issue too could have been made clearer. One other unavoidable problem is that many of the book's illustrations, taken from the period magazines examined, are understandably grainy and striated.

One wonders if we will ever see a renewed interest in re-creating the sounds of the BMG ensembles that held such sway in America at the turn of the century. The instruments are certainly available (if sometimes pricey), as is the talent to play them. In all honesty, though, many of today's players of plectral instruments are somewhat unversed in reading musical scores and playing in the tight fashion required to make such ensembles musically viable. And then there's the music itself, which would likely sound rather staid and uninteresting to most modern ears. But should anyone wish to learn more about this important period in the development of BMG instruments, Noonan's book is an excellent starting place.

DARCY KURONEN

MUSEUM OF FINE ARTS, BOSTON

Marie-Anne Sarda, editor. *Le Vieilleux: Métamorphoses d'une figure d'artiste du XVIIe au XIXe siècle*. Lyon: Fage éditions, 2008. 144 pp.: 147 color illus. ISBN: 978-2-84975-142-8. €25,00 (paper).

From July 5 to October 5, 2008, the Royal Monastery of Brou in the city of Bourg-en-Bresse in southeastern France, not far from Lyon, mounted an exhibit entitled *Le Vieilleux: Métamorphoses d'une figure d'artiste du XVIIe*

au XIXe siècle. While there have been extensive exhibitions devoted to the *vielle à roue* or hurdy-gurdy in previous years (notably at the museum in Montluçon, whose extensive collection is in storage now that the museum has devoted itself to collecting guitars), and the Musée de la musique in Paris displays a considerable number of fine examples (and lent several to Brou for the occasion), this exhibition attempted to create a broader cultural context by highlighting the image of the players and the way in which this image changed over three centuries. Marie-Anne Sarda makes clear in the introduction to the catalog that the starting point is art history rather than organology. Nevertheless, twenty-two instruments from the three centuries are displayed. Many of these instruments were bequeathed to the museum in Bourg-en-Bresse by early twentieth-century residents who were themselves collectors. The heart of the exhibition, however, is the large numbers of paintings, engravings, and porcelain figures that present the hurdy-gurdy player in different lights, from blind beggar in the seventeenth century, to aristocratic lady in the eighteenth, to wandering Savoyard or other peasant in the nineteenth.

All of these items are documented in a truly splendid catalog that also includes a series of studies illuminating various aspects of the exhibition. Most of these studies are not broad brushes but focused research papers that would in other contexts be journal articles.

Florence Gétreau, in "L'enfant vieillex en France: Mutations d'une pratique et d'un stereotype pictural," discusses representations of children playing hurdy-gurdies in the eighteenth century. A surprising number of these instruments survive, two of which are displayed in Brou. They were built in different sizes, which, as Gétreau asserts, indicates that they were tailored to different ages. These are functioning instruments down to the smallest detail, as beautifully decorated as adult instruments of the period. Gétreau points to a number of portraits of aristocratic children playing them in familial settings. On the other side of the class divide are the Savoyard children, who used hurdy-gurdies as a tool for survival as they begged in the streets. The contrast between these children from the highest and lowest ranks of society is disturbing even today; still more disturbing is that a number of the aristocratic children are pretending to be Savoyards. In some respects this study is a continuation of Gétreau's study of eighteenth-century aristocratic portraits of hurdy-gurdy players, "Les belles vieilleses au siècle de Louis XV: Peinture d'une mode triomphante," in *Vielle à roue, territoires illimités*, ed. Pierre Imbert (Saint-Jouin de Milly: FAMDT, 1996), 90–103.

In “L’association vielle à roue et musette aux XVIIe et XVIIIe siècles,” Jean-Christophe Maillard explores the relationship between the musette de cour and the hurdy-gurdy in the eighteenth century. These two instruments both produce continuous sounds—both melody and drone—but the musette is a wind instrument and the hurdy-gurdy is a bowed string instrument with a pronounced form of articulation (the *trompette*). In addition, the two instruments have very different relationships with the upper classes. The musette became “respectable” in the early seventeenth century, even while the hurdy-gurdy remained in the hands of blind beggars. It was only in the 1720s that the hurdy-gurdy became a chamber instrument in the hands of the upper classes. At this time Michel Corrette, Joseph Bodin de Boismortier, and others composed a large repertory of sonatas, concertos, and suites that could be played on either instrument alone, or together in duos. Composers also wrote virtuosic music which was singularly designed to exploit the particular idiomatic features of one or the other. I would add two points to Maillard’s discussion of these issues. First, too little credit is given to the Versailles luthier Henri Bâton, who improved hurdy-gurdies musically and visually by the addition of carving and decoration normally associated with the more fashionable viola da gamba, and by building them on the bodies of guitars and lutes. Second, hurdy-gurdies were played by many women, whereas the musette was primarily a man’s instrument. Playing duos for hurdy-gurdy and musette enabled the two sexes to interact musically on an equal basis, which was not otherwise possible, since women were discouraged from playing wind or other string instruments.

Paul Fustier’s article discusses the hurdy-gurdy in relation to the myth of Arcadia, the ideal world of shepherds and shepherdesses, a theme found in literature and painting. Its most notorious manifestation is the Petit Trianon, the make-believe peasant village built by Marie Antoinette at Versailles. A psychologist by profession, Fustier brings a different perspective as to why the hurdy-gurdy became associated with the myth and how people thought about the pastoral pose in the eighteenth century. His article is a brief summary of his dissertation, which has been published in book form as *La vielle à roue dans la musique baroque française: Instrument de musique, objet mythique, objet fantasmé?* (Paris: L’Harmattan, 2006).

Jean-François Chassaing is best known for his carefully researched history of the dynasties of luthiers, the Pimpards, Pajots, and relations, who established themselves in Jenzat, near Vichy (*La vielle et les luthiers de Jenzat* [Teilhède, Combronde: Aux Amoureux de Science, 1987]). These

luthiers developed the hurdy-gurdy that is the model for today's folk instrument. Chassaing's two essays on the hurdy-gurdy in the nineteenth century conclude the study section of the catalog. The first, "Spécificités de la vieille bressane," discusses the prominent hurdy-gurdy builders of Bourg-en-Bresse, the location of the exhibit. Several prospered in this area in the middle of the nineteenth century, taking as their models the instruments of the eighteenth-century Parisian family the Louvets. The work of those luthiers was a direct link between the nineteenth-century folk instrument and the "classical" hurdy-gurdy of the eighteenth century. Chassaing discusses the social conditions that allowed these makers to prosper. He points to the traveling musicians who played for weddings and balls in neighboring villages, who, far from being beggars, were true professionals. At the same time, bourgeois amateurs used the instruments in more intimate surroundings.

Chassaing's second essay traces the symbolism of the hurdy-gurdy from medieval times to the twentieth century. His central point is the continuity and interrelationship between themes associated with this symbolism. The first manifestation of the hurdy-gurdy was the eleventh-century organistrum, associated with the church. The blind beggars in subsequent centuries were in some sense supported and encouraged by the church. In the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century, as the wandering Savoyards succeeded the blind beggars, the hurdy-gurdy became a geographical signifier. While this article in some ways functions as a helpful summation, many of these connections seem to be a stretch.

Though the catalog of objects displayed gives a rather cursory description of the instruments, it provides a fairly extensive analysis of the art objects, in keeping with the emphasis of the exhibition. It would have been appropriate to devote more space to the instruments, since a number were originally collected by residents of Bourg-en-Bresse and are not on display in major collections. Nevertheless, this catalog, with its studies, illustrations, and analyses, is an essential acquisition for anyone interested in the hurdy-gurdy and its history.

ROBERT A. GREEN
BLOOMINGTON, INDIANA

Patrizio Barbieri. *Enharmonic Instruments and Music, 1470–1900: Revised and Translated Studies*. Latina: Il Levante Libreria Editrice, 2008. xii, 616 pp.: 21 color illus., 126 black-and-white illus., 82 tables, 58 musical exx., CD. ISBN: 978-88-95203-14-0. €60,00 (hardcover).