

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XXXIII • 2007



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

K. A. Bierdimpfl's catalog (*Die Sammlung der Musikinstrumente des bayerischen Nationalmuseums* [Munich: Straub, 1883]),¹ a list of makers represented in the catalog (with biographical sketches), a directory of museums cited, a list of abbreviations, a bibliography, and an index of persons.

In sum, I find this to be an excellent catalog. It answers almost any question that might be asked of it and raises none for which an answer is not supplied in some way. Although it is true that collection catalogs are mainly specialist publications, they enhance the body of knowledge by providing detailed information about instruments that might otherwise be inaccessible to the researcher.

CECIL ADKINS

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH TEXAS

Trevor Herbert. *The Trombone. The Yale Musical Instrument Series.* New Haven: Yale University Press, 2006. xvi, 399 pp.: 87 black-and-white illus., 27 musical exx., 6 tables, 6 appendixes. ISBN: 0-300-10095-7. \$38.00 (cloth).

In this book, Trevor Herbert, a professor at the Open University (UK) and a former professional trombonist, offers a socio-historical study of the trombone encompassing "the preoccupations of its players - their musical values, the repertoires they played, the way they played, and any processes, events or other factors that impinged on the way in which they made their living" (p. 2). This elegantly written, insightful, and thoughtful study of "phases in the history of music told from the perspective of one musical instrument and its players" (p. 7) covers the history of the instrument from its origins to postmodernism. Topics pertaining to the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries are treated especially thoroughly, and attention is given to trombone playing in Latin America, in Moravian communities, and in the Salvation Army.

However, Herbert notes that "some daunting questions remain unanswered," and that the narrative often involves an element he refers to as "informed speculation" (p. 3). While the strengths of the book lie in the

1. An exhibition catalog compiled by Alfons Ott, *Ausstellung Alte Musik: Instrumente, Noten und Dokumente aus drei Jahrhunderten* (Munich: Max Hieber, 1951), is not cited in this work.

author's knowledge and his ability to tell a good story, occasionally a more positivistic approach to detail is desired.

Herbert's research base is primarily British and American sources (single libraries or institutions in Austria, France, and Italy are also drawn upon), which leads to a strongly Anglo-American perspective. While this allows Herbert to present significant new material, it also sometimes gives the discussion a narrower focus than is warranted. For example, chapter 6, "Decline, Survival and Rehabilitation: The Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries," delves deeply into English sources, but does not mention the instrument's role in the Baroque continuo group. Chapter 12, "Orchestral Trombone Playing in the Age of Sound Recordings," offers an interesting discussion of the trombone in early recordings, but leaves the reader with the impression that there are no orchestras outside the United Kingdom, Europe, and the United States.

The fourteen chapters are roughly chronological. The chapter headings, however, indicate not periods of time, but "different thematic perspectives" (p. 5). This organization is successful for the most part, helped by the useful subheadings within chapters. However, it is difficult to follow some important threads of trombone history, as aspects of one subject may be covered in different chapters. Technique, for example, is discussed in chapter 2, "Trombone Technique"; chapter 7, "Didacticism and the Idea of Virtuosity"; and chapter 14, "Modernism, Post-modernism and Retrospection." The history of the trombone in the Renaissance is divided thematically into three chapters: chapter 3, "The Origins of the Trombone"; chapter 4, "Players and Cultures in the Later Renaissance"; and chapter 5, "Performances and Repertoires in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries." The reader might get the impression from the latter chapter that Gabrieli, Monteverdi, and Schütz were the only composers of sacred music with trombones in their respective countries at that time. Correctives are found only in appendix 2, "Centres of Trombone Repertoire," and in chapter 11, "The Moravians and Other Popular Religions," where the use of the trombone in German sacred music and the contributions of other northern Italian composers are briefly described. In addition, chapter 6, "Decline, Survival and Rehabilitation: The Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries," also covers Baroque sacred music. On the other hand, the theme of chapter 11 allows the author to focus on the instrument's ongoing historical relationship with religious practice. The establishment of brass bands by Christian missionary organizations in non-Western

cultures often resulted in unusual assimilations, such as the use of brass instruments to perform gamelan music.

Herbert warns that he is not an organologist, but his initial chapter provides an adequate outline of the trombone's morphological development, wanting only a report on the change in bell flare. His reference point for chapter 2 is what he calls "orthodox technique" (established by the nineteenth-century conservatoire tradition, p. 31), a theme that surfaces throughout the book. Herbert reminds us that "the conservatoire tradition is underpinned by a common assumption that there is a single *correct* way of playing," and "that modern conventions provide fewer clues than we sometimes assume about how trombones were played in the distant past" (p. 31). Absent, however, is any discussion of the physicality of playing (such as breathing), while coverage of pedagogical topics is superficial (for example, there are three ways to articulate triple tonguing, not just the one discussed).

In chapter 3, "The Origins of the Trombone," Herbert deftly navigates some of the thornier issues of the trombone's genesis (such as the slide trumpet debate), but not all. Luther's incongruous translation of some biblical instrument names as *Posaune* goes unnoted here, even though chapter 11 briefly mentions this as a possible inspiration for the Moravian *Posaunenchor*. In fact, the trombone's significance as a cultural symbol is neglected in the book. An isolated example, from Mozart's *Don Giovanni*, needs more commentary than it receives.

Chapter 4, "Players and Cultures in the Later Renaissance," includes South America and women. But in a history of the trombone focused on performers, it is a little surprising that women are allotted only two and a half paragraphs. It is welcome to see illustrated a sixteenth-century tablecloth depicting a woman trombone player (illustration 24), and to learn of "one greate sackbut provided for the Queens use" (p. 79) in the private chamber of Elizabeth I (although this phrase may be an accountant's expression). But surely Bottrigari's description of nuns' performances at San Vito, Ferrara, in *Il desiderio* (Venice, 1594, p. 49) and accounts of trombonists in convents in post-Tridentine Bologna mentioned by Craig A. Monson in *Disembodied Voices* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995, pp. 47 and 50) also merit inclusion.

Chapter 7, "Didacticism and the Idea of Virtuosity," is an enlightening discussion of nineteenth- and twentieth-century technical treatises. In chapter 8, "The Trombone in the Modern Orchestra," Herbert comments that orchestration manuals "unwittingly reveal the cultural

baggage of their time by expressing subjective views about orchestration and idiom" (p. 169), and follows up with revealing examples. For example, Cecil Forsyth in his *Orchestration* (London: Macmillan, 1914) dismissed the trombone solo in the "Tuba mirum" of Mozart's Requiem as "dreadful," written by a composer who did not understand the instrument (p. 173). Forsyth believed the trombone should not be used soloistically, partly due to the difficulties of legato articulation, yet today this solo is considered to epitomize the lyrical qualities of the instrument. This chapter is a veritable tour de force, presenting the history of trombone orchestration in the nineteenth century supported by a dizzying array of sources. And the lighter side of the trombone's social history is not neglected: Herbert includes George Bernard Shaw's quip that his father had "destroyed his domestic peace by immoderate indulgence in the trombone" (p. 162).

Chapter 9, "Valve Trombones and Other Nineteenth-Century Introductions," is illuminating, although more pictures and explanations comparing different valve systems would be helpful (only the Périnet valve is illustrated). Chapter 10, "Popular Music," and chapter 13, "Jazz," reflect the author's expansive knowledge of these topics. The jazz chapter is arbitrary in its choice of subject matter, but to be fair, the topic could be a book in itself. Bill Watrous (among other noteworthy jazz trombonists) and James Pankow (of the rock group Chicago) are excluded, while Rob McConnell is absent from both the valve-trombone and jazz discussions. The striking fact that trombonists are often the arrangers in an ensemble (Melba Liston and Slide Hampton, for example) goes unremarked. Chapter 12, "Orchestral Trombone Playing in the Age of Sound Recordings," traces the eventual globalization of the trombone sound through the medium of recordings. Women's involvement in the modern orchestra is relegated to five sentences, omitting mention of such pioneers as Betty Glover (Cincinnati Symphony Orchestra and Opera, 1952–85) and Abbie Conant (solo trombone, Munich Philharmonic, 1980–93). Chapter 14, "Modernism, Post-modernism and Retrospection," outlines avant-garde techniques and provides a thoughtful history of the early music movement (the author was involved as a performer in *Musica Reservata*, an English ensemble, in the 1970s). The book contains no discussion of modern trombone ensembles.

The text is amply supported by tables, six appendixes, and a substantial bibliography. Musical examples are plentiful and useful, although it would be nice to have one showing Rossini's "famously taxing rapid pas-

sages for trombones" in *Guillaume Tell* (p. 175), and to have measure numbers included consistently. Illustrations, copious throughout the book, are both clear and helpful. Typographical errors are rare (the heading on page 335 erroneously names appendix 4 instead of 5), and the printed text is clean and clear. One cannot expect a book of this sort to include everything, and Herbert's book ultimately exceeded my expectations, presenting a detailed socio-cultural history of an instrument that has not received much scholarly attention.

CHARLOTTE A. LEONARD
LAURENTIAN UNIVERSITY

Michael Cole. *Broadwood Square Pianos: Their Historical Context, and Technical Development, Together with a New Biography of John Broadwood.* Cheltenham, UK: Tatchley Books, 2005. 205 pp.: 58 black-and-white photographs, 5 drawings, 1 facsimile, 1 map. ISBN: 0-9551777-0-7. £45 (hardcover).

Twenty-three years after the publication of David Wainwright's ground-breaking *Broadwood, by Appointment* (London: Quiller Press, 1982), a new look at the history of the famous London piano-making firm Broadwood & Sons is certainly justified. Michael Cole's *Broadwood Square Pianos* reassesses some of the same material, with a focus on the instrument type that was produced in the highest numbers and enjoyed the widest distribution—the square piano. Cole, a maker and restorer of early keyboard instruments, has gained much attention with his book *The Piano-forte in the Classical Era* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998), which is written in a personal, yet technically well-informed style. This style is maintained in his latest publication. The reader is taken on a research stroll by the author, whose manner of writing also makes the book entertaining.

The time frame ranges from 1742, when the firm's founder, the Swiss harpsichord maker Burkat Shudi, commissioned the well-known family portrait preserved at the National Portrait Gallery in London, to 1866, when the last square piano left the Broadwood factory. An epilogue gives a glimpse into the twentieth century, revealing the fate of some square pianos after the heyday of the instrument had passed, and concluding with a few remarks on the beginnings of a revival.

A primary aim of the book is readability for a wide audience, and most of the material is carefully presented. The table of contents gives a one-sentence summary of each of the eight main chapters (including