

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XXIX • 2003



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

posed, showing that it was indeed part of an earlier painting. However, it is not made clear how the lid was left after the later 1974 restoration. A recent photograph would have helped.

Yet another way in which it is difficult to chart one's way through the logic of the text is by constantly being referred to substantial footnotes, which need to be read fully if the argument is to be completely understood. Footnotes are here often as important as the main text. Two instances will suffice. Footnote 27 contains the only reference to plate 9, and it is only there that one can deduce how the quilling was left after its 1974 restoration—namely, with wide jacks with *single* plectra. Rather strangely, footnote 31 solves completely an uncertainty expressed in the text. Attributions and citations apart, it would have been worthwhile for all the other footnotes to have been subsumed into the main text.

One is also slowed down by an unfortunate mix-up in the labeling of the plates and figures. Three captions should be moved: that on page 230 to page 226, that on page 233 to page 230, and that on page 236 to page 233.

Nevertheless, many interesting and important structural features are discussed in detail. For instance, in this instrument, Taskin cut vertical slots into the 4' jacks (and possibly into the missing original 8' jacks also), the length dependent on their position in the compass, so that the bass jacks were made slightly heavier than those in the treble. It was also particularly useful that the Russell Collection's 1769 Taskin was so close in date to the instrument under discussion that it was able to be used for detailed comparison. This really becomes one of the most important parts of the essay.

Kenneth Mobbs
Mobbs Keyboard Collection
Bristol, U.K.

Jeremy Montagu. *Reed Instruments: The Montagu Collection, An Annotated Catalogue*. Lanham, MD, and London: Scarecrow Press, 2001. xx, 183 pp.: 8 black-and-white drawings. ISBN: 0-8108-3938-5. \$60.00 (hardcover).

This volume is the first issued in a proposed series of catalogs of Jeremy Montagu's collection of almost 2500 musical instruments. It will take its place as Volume IV, Part 2, when the series, arranged according to the order established by Curt Sachs and Eric Hornbostel, is completed. According to the author these volumes will not be long in coming, as

they are based on his already completed ledger catalog, which was begun in preparation for an exhibition that he mounted at Sheffield in 1967.

Montagu's collection dates from the early 1960s, when he began to expand his small accumulation of percussion instruments to include instruments of all types from around the world, with the aim of acquiring material suitable for illustrating lectures and for organological research. His eclecticism is evidenced by his description of himself as an ethno-organologist, which he defines as someone with a global view, an interest in how instruments work, and an interest in their intercultural relationships. Perhaps an even more apt personification is that of a musical magpie, which he called himself in a 1997 lecture: "A musical magpie," he said, "is someone who eschews shiny objects for those that make noise."¹ This is certainly manifested in his collection, for many of the objects described and cataloged in this gathering of "reed instruments" challenge one's understanding of the term "musical instrument" as much as it challenged the author to find a niche for such objects within the confines of the Sachs-Hornbostel *Systematik*. Consider, for example, item V 138a, which is classified in section 412.14 under the rubric "Ribbon Reeds, Bark Reeds, etc." This is described as:

Fox Call, Burnham Bros., Marble Falls, Texas. Close range model. A rubber band between two pieces of mottled brown plastic; the band subsequently perished and has been replaced, courtesy of H. M. Royal Mail; the bands which they use to bundle letters are exactly the right size. In its original box with a descriptive leaflet of how successful the Burnham family are at catching coyotes, racoons, and foxes with such calls. Also an instruction leaflet and price list of other calls and instruction recordings. OL 88, OW 15, th 9, centre of gap 3 (the same on both sides, unlike III 114a). Bought at Harry's Sport Shop, Grinnell, Iowa. Two were bought and one was given to Laurence Picken. . . . (pp. 157–158)

Each entry in the catalog includes the name of the instrument in English, its place of origin, and, where appropriate, a non-English or ethnic name. These are followed by a physical description of the instrument, its provenance, some basic measurements (which usually include the length, diameter, fingerhole sizes, and other points appropriate to the specimen being discussed), and a negative and/or slide number, if

1. The sixth John Blacking Memorial lecture, "The Magpie in Ethnomusicology," given by Montagu (as President Emeritus of the European Seminar in Ethnomusicology) at the thirteenth ESEM conference (1997) at Jyväskylä, Finland. The complete text is available at <http://perso.wanadoo.fr/esem/6thJBML.HTM>.

the item has been photographed. The order of these items fluctuates throughout, probably due to the serial nature of the original ledger catalogs, where the items were listed as they came to hand, and because the author emphasizes those aspects about which he has greater knowledge and interest. There is no documentation in the catalog, hence no page numbers for the works of authors cited in the text, though their books can be found in the bibliography.

Although many of the instruments may not be of interest to everyone, on almost any page can be found a description, commentary, or incidental essay that will engage the reader. Some of the instrumental commentaries are very matter-of-fact, describing, for example, the construction of a Thai tenor shawm bell: "The bell is made in three parts, soldered together quite roughly with soft solder . . ." (p. 32–33), while others are quite colorful. Often the two will be mixed in the same entry, as is the case with this tenor shawm, which begins:

Dark-stained wood, which appears to have been worm-eaten before it was turned and varnished . . . the bottom of the body lapped with string to hold it in the bell. This arrangement derives from the Burmese *hnè*; whether the *hnè* originally had its bell fairly firmly attached in this way, or whether the Thai are a tidier-minded people who prefer not to have the bell flopping as loosely as the Burmese, is perhaps a matter for further research. (pp. 32–33)

Each section is prefaced with an essay that offers commentary of a general nature on the group of instruments at hand (e.g., the definition and description of forked shawms on page 16), or takes Sachs and Hornbostel to task for the imperfection or illogicality of their taxonomy. Such is the case in his introduction to aerophones, where Montagu rails successively at Sachs and Hornbostel and at his French colleagues in CIM-CIM for their redevelopment of the *Systematik*, "which had all the faults of the Hornbostel & Sachs, plus a great many new ones of its own" (p. 3). Sharing insights and knowledge gained during forty years of building a collection, Montagu gives us a first-hand view of the difficulties encountered in applying such an imperfect system.

At other times—and there are many of these—Montagu conveys, often with infectious if droll humor, the great love he has for his instruments. At the end of his description of item V 150a/b, "The Wonderful Double Throat or Swiss Warbler Bird Call," he writes:

A packet of four (a) were bought in a shop in Oscaloosa, Iowa, for 15 cents and four more (b) in a pink and transparent plastic box were bought from a

slot machine in a gentlemen's lavatory at a Howard Johnson restaurant on the Pennsylvania Turnpike (eastbound) for 25 cents. Two of (a) were given to Laurence Picken. . . . (pp. 158–159)

He comments elsewhere that he and Picken often purchased cheap instruments as gifts for one another when they were traveling. Picken's acquisitions are cited in Montagu's text with their CUMAE (Cambridge University Museum of Archaeology and Ethnography) collection number.

The catalog is more useful for the insights of its author as to how the items function or are constructed than for the quality of the instruments described. Montagu's treatment of the instruments is very evenhanded, whether he is describing a Triébert oboe, one of his sixty-eight shawms, a device made to demonstrate the principle behind an instrument, or an instrument retrieved from someone's dustbin. His wide-ranging interests have resulted in his cataloging all sorts of devices, and this too will be useful to someone confronted with an unknown thingamajig. Among the more exotic items, I noted some salvaged from his granddaughter's birthday party, and the final entry (item XII 100), consisting of a plastic binder strip, which Montagu identified as a retreating reed instrument² and dubbed the Eliphone—its musical capabilities having been discovered by Eliezer Treuherz, his two-and-a-half-year-old grandson.

Finally, the misspelling of Catalogue as "Catlogue" on the cover in no way blemishes the content of the book. I mention it here only that the Gentle Reader not find me remiss in the oversight.

Cecil Adkins
Denton, Texas

Brigitte Bachmann-Geiser. *Europäische Musikinstrumente im Bernischen Historischen Museum: Die Sammlung als Spiegel bernischer Musikkultur. Schriften des Bernischen Historischen Museums*, 3. Bern: Verlag Bernisches Historisches Museum, 2001. 308 pp.: 5 color plates, 50 black-and-white plates, 325 black-and-white photos, 4 line drawings. ISBN: 3-9521573-5-X. 53.00€ (hardcover).

This is a splendid volume. An illustrated catalog of the musical instrument collection at the Historical Museum in Bern, this book has features

2. Montagu defines the retreating reed as a flexible medium with longitudinal slits that dilate and contract when blown, producing the sound as the air stream exits the instrument rather than as it enters.