

*Journal of the  
American Musical  
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XXVIII • 2002



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).  
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair  
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).  
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

double-strung German and Austrian pianos (p. 70); but the differences in the distance of the hammer throw, hammer weight, and leverage are at least as significant, and he fails to note the important effect the third string has on the sustaining quality of the sound—that singing tone that Beethoven loved.<sup>3</sup> He refers to a 1795 K $\ddot{o}$ nnicke piano with a six-octave compass and six keyboards (p. 98), but that instrument has a *five*-octave range, and six *rows* of keys.<sup>4</sup> There is some confusion in his discussion of historical temperaments (which he calls “tuning systems,” p. 98). Good mentions a “just” tuning (although he appears to be describing quarter-comma meantone temperament) as common for late eighteenth-century pianos, but it was the revolving or modified meantone temperaments that were in use then, permitting the use of all keys, with the simpler ones more consonant in sound.

Nevertheless, *Giraffes* is not about acoustics, clavichords, temperaments, and keyboards with thirty-one notes per octave, and it almost seems petty to cavil its minor flaws, as annoying as they are. This second edition makes it an even more valuable reference work, but it is also a book that can be read for sheer pleasure. We know the outcome of the story of the piano—but what a labyrinthian journey it was to get here!

Edward L. Kottick  
Iowa City

**Phillipe Lescat and Jean Saint-Arroman, editors. *Clarinete: Méthodes et Traités, Dictionnaires* (Méthodes et Traités vol. 6, Série I, France 1600–1800). Courlay: J. M. Fuzeau, 2000. 303 pp. ISMN: M 2306-5802-7. €59.81 (cloth).**

Publisher J. M. Fuzeau has embarked on a series of volumes presenting facsimiles of French method books and theoretical works, each volume being devoted to a particular instrument. The volumes in series I, edited

3. A classic article dealing with this effect is Gabriel Weinreich, “The Coupled Motion of Piano Strings,” in *Five Lectures*, 73–81.

4. This piano’s keyboard is discussed and pictured in Alfons Huber, “Der  $\ddot{O}$ sterreichische Klavierbau im 18. Jahrhundert,” in *Das Klangwelt Mozarts* (Vienna: Kunsthistorisches Museum, 1991), 47–72, photographs on pp. 54 and 116. The keyboard is similar to that of Vito Trasuntino’s 1606 *Clavemusicum omnitonum* (Bologna, Museo Civico) with thirty-one notes to the octave.

by Phillipe Lescat and Jean Saint-Arroman, cover the viola da gamba, cello, viola and pardessus de viole, oboe, bassoon, clarinet, and piano-forte. The editors' accomplishment is laudable; the volumes are useful for the organologist, music historian, performer on historical instruments, and general musician.

The clarinet volume includes fifteen sources ranging from a one-page fingering chart to eighteen pages of advice for composers writing for the clarinet. It comprises fingering charts for the four-key clarinet by Valentin Roeser and Abraham [no known first name]; four-key clarinet fingering charts from flute methods by Michel Corrette and Jacques-Martin Hotteterre; method books with fingering charts for the five-key clarinet by Amand Vanderhagen, Frédéric Blasius, and Michel Yost; excerpts from treatises on instrumentation by Roeser, Louis-Joseph Francoeur, and Othon-Joseph Vandenbroeck; and encyclopedia entries by François-Alexandre-Pierre de Garsault, Jean-Benjamin de La Borde, and Nicolas Etienne Framery and Pierre-Louis Ginguené. The facsimile reproductions are clearly printed and are reproduced on opaque paper with a minimum of words or notes showing through from the verso of each page. Four sources were slightly reduced in size in order to print two original pages on one of the book's quarto-sized pages.

The sources were identified as a result of Lescat's work on his book *Méthodes et Traités Musicaux en France 1600–1800* (Paris: L'institut de pédagogie musicale et chorégraphique, 1991). For this study, he used a series of method books reprinted by the Minkoff firm in Geneva and the list of printed works from *Écrits imprimés concernant la musique*, edited by François Lesure (*RISM B*/VI/1–2, Munich: G. Henle, 1971).

Lescat and Saint-Arroman have included facsimiles of very important documents in their clarinet volume, but it is a pity that they did not check the source texts and descriptions more carefully and consult research published in English. Three sources are misidentified and/or misdated (Roeser, pp. 5–11; Abraham, p. 43; Anonymous, pp. 67–70), one is incomplete (Garsault, p. 12), and another is a conflation of two sources published as one (Framery and Ginguené, p. 65). The comments that follow offer some corrections, based on my own research, along with additional observations and suggestions for further reading.

The first source in the book, "Principes de clarinette avec la tablature des meilleurs mtres. pour cet instrument et plusieurs duo pour cet instrument," is attributed to Valentin Roeser, ca. 1760. Consisting of a fingering chart with four duos arranged from popular opera arias, it should

not be attributed to Roeser and it should be dated ca. 1775.<sup>1</sup> A surviving example is in the Newberry Library, Chicago.

The second source is a one-page description of a two-key clarinet in F by Garsault from his encyclopedia *Notionnaire ou mémorial raisonné*, published in 1761. It includes an engraving of a two-key clarinet from the lower half of plate XXXI in the encyclopedia, but without the corresponding scale—an 8 centimeter line equivalent to two feet (2 pieds). According to Garsault's text and the corresponding scale, this clarinet is nineteen inches in length and pitched in high F.<sup>2</sup>

The eighth source presented—a fingering chart for four-key clarinet by Abraham entitled “Principes de clarinette suivis de pas redoublés et de marches les plus à la mode”—can be more exactly dated as ca. 1782 (rather than the ca. 1780 date given by Lescat and Arroman).<sup>3</sup> The chart was bound with some duos as the first installment of a series of thirty-two volumes totaling 661 duets arranged by Abraham and published in Paris by Frère from about 1777 to 1785. The entire series of duets is held by the Bibliothèque Municipale in Dijon.

The tenth source in the book is a misidentified conflation of two sources published some twenty years apart. Labeled as an extract from *Encyclopédie méthodique*, dated 1788, the text should be identified as being from *Encyclopédie méthodique: Musique*, vol. 1, edited by Framery and Ginguené and published in 1791.<sup>4</sup> The facsimile page also includes en-

1. Although the title page does not include the name of a publisher, its exact title is listed in the *Almanach musicale*, vol. 1 (1775; reprint ed., Geneva: Minkoff, 1972), p. 95, as published by Girard. David Randall reproduced the fingering chart and briefly discussed the duos in “A Comprehensive Performance Project in Clarinet Literature with an Essay on the Clarinet Duet from ca. 1715 to ca. 1825” (D.M.A. thesis, University of Iowa, 1970), 28–33. For discussion of the source, its fingerings, and the type of four-key clarinet it was written for, see Albert R. Rice, “Clarinet Fingering Charts, 1732–1816,” *Galpin Society Journal* 37 (1984): 17–18, 23–24.

2. Note that although this source is correctly dated in the table of contents, the heading on the facsimile page erroneously shows a date of 1767. The engraving with the scale and a translation and commentary of Garsault's entry on the clarinet is given in Albert R. Rice, “Garsault on the Clarinet,” *Galpin Society Journal* 32 (1979): 99–103.

3. A publishing privilege was granted for this title in 1782. See Michel Brenet, “La Librairie musicale en France de 1653 à 1790 d'après des registres de privilèges,” *Sammlbände der Internationalen Musikgesellschaft* 8 (1906–07): 464. The existence of Abraham's *Principes* was initially mentioned by Joseph James Estock in “A Biographical Dictionary of Clarinetists Born before 1800” (Ph.D. diss., University of Iowa, 1972), 26. For identification of Abraham's fingering chart as a copy of a chart in Corrette's *Méthode de la flûte traversière* (ca. 1773), see Rice, “Clarinet Fingering Charts,” 24.

4. The *Encyclopédie méthodique* included excerpts from the *Encyclopédie* (1751–1765), the *Supplément à l'Encyclopédie* (1776–1780), and several other French sources. It was organized by subject and published in Paris by Panckoucke from 1782 to 1832. The

gravings of a two-key clarinet which are from the volumes of illustrations (*Recueil de planches*) that accompanied the first edition of the *Encyclopédie* (edited by Diderot and d'Alembert and published in Paris starting in 1751); the volume from which these engravings are drawn was published in 1767. A better text to combine with these illustrations would have been the short text from the original *Encyclopédie*. A more important source, not included by Lescat and Saint-Arroman, is the clarinet article written by Frédéric Adolphe Maximilian Gustav de Castillon for the second volume of the supplement to the *Encyclopédie* (1776) and the corresponding engravings of a four-key clarinet in the *Suite du Recueil de Planches* of 1777.<sup>5</sup> Had the editors compared all these sources, they would have seen that Framery and Ginguené included Castillon's text (with a correction of one word)—though not the engravings from the *Encyclopédie* supplement. Furthermore, Framery and Ginguené republished a portion of La Borde's article on the clarinet from his *Essai sur la musique* (1780), and it is this portion that Lescat and Saint-Arroman reprinted on page 65. (La Borde's entire article on the clarinet from his *Essai* is printed by Lescat and Saint-Arroman on pages 39–42.)

The eleventh source is presented as an anonymous *Gamme de la clarinette*, ca. 1790. Consisting of a fingering chart for a four-key clarinet and eleven duos, it is identical to Valentin's Roeser's *Gamme de la clarinette avec six duos* (ca. 1769) discovered by this reviewer bound in a volume of Corrette's *Méthode de flute* (ca. 1735) in the Library of Congress.<sup>6</sup> Roeser's *Gamme* is the earliest fingering chart for the French four-key clarinet and includes the earliest music directly associated with this type of clarinet.<sup>7</sup>

---

two volumes on music, entitled "Art du faiseur d'instruments de musique et Lutherie," were published as volumes 185 and 186 in 1791 and 1818. The article on the clarinet is in vol. 185, pp. 118–120, and a definition appears on page 157. See John Lough, *The Encyclopédie* (New York: McKay, 1971), 81; and "Appendix C: Dictionaries and encyclopedias of music" in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, second ed. (New York: Macmillan, 2001), 28:113.

5. See F. A. M. G. de Castillon, "Clarinette," in *Supplément à l'Encyclopédie, ou Dictionnaire Raisonné des Sciences, des Arts et des Métiers*, ed. by J. B. Robinet (Amsterdam: M. M. Rey, 1776–1777), 2:450–451; and J. B. Robinet, ed., *Suite du Recueil de Planches* (Paris: Panckoucke, Stoupe, Brunet, 1777), 144, pl. 4. For a translation of the text with commentary see Eric Halfpenny, "Castillon on the Clarinet," *Music & Letters* 35 (1954): 332–38. For comments on the fingering and the engraving of the clarinet see Rice, "Clarinet Fingering Charts," 24.

6. Rice, "Clarinet Fingering Charts," 23–24, plate V.

7. Randall, 19–21, discusses the *Gamme de la clarinette* and its duos. For identification of this publication as an altered later printing of the title page of Roeser's *Gamme de la clarinette* (ca. 1769) see Rice, "Clarinet Fingering Charts," 24.

Finally, the *Nouvelle méthode de clarinette* by Blasius (pp. 81–196) and the *Nouvelle méthode de clarinette (1<sup>re</sup> partie)* by Vanderhagen (pp. 197–274) should be dated ca. 1796 and ca. 1798, based on the plate numbers. More exact dates are not available.

Despite the untidy research and dating, this clarinet volume is important for the facsimile reproduction of several significant historical sources. It is recommended for purchase by libraries and individuals. With the increasing popularity of early music and the performance of music on original instruments, original sources are in greater demand. The most useful texts for today's performers are the fingering charts and comments for the five-key clarinets in the method books by Vanderhagen, Blasius, and Yost.

Albert R. Rice  
Fiske Museum of The Claremont Colleges

**Jim Berrow, editor. *Towards the Conservation and Restoration of Historic Organs: A Record of the Liverpool Conference, 23–26 August 1999*. London: Church House Publishing, 2000. xvi, 182 pp.: 11 black-and-white figures. ISBN: 0-7151-7568-6. £9.95 (paper).**

Within recent years there has been a growing concern among players, makers, and historians regarding the proper treatment of historic instruments. Nowhere has this been more fraught with differences of opinion than in the area of keyboard instruments, and most particularly with regard to organs. As has been the case with other instruments, differences in philosophy, leading at times to polarization, have inevitably occurred among those most closely involved. The Liverpool Conference, jointly sponsored by the British Institute of Organ Studies, the Council for the Care of Churches, and the Institute of British Organ Building, with the support of the Conservation Centre of Liverpool, may be seen as a major step in encouraging dialogue and cooperation between those of differing disciplines and viewpoints in the organ world.

The era is largely past when it was considered quite acceptable to significantly alter and/or augment historic organs, even those in substantially original condition, and when little thought was given to the proper treatment of those that had been previously altered. This former acceptance of an organ as a perpetual work in progress arose probably because