

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XXVI • 2000



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

addition to the Hamilton piece cited above, Robert Philip's essay "Pianists on record in the early twentieth century," and an article that discusses changing fashions in nineteenth-century repertoire ("Repertory and canon") by Dorothy de Val and Cyril Ehrlich, are especially worth reading. Those who have an interest in these questions and who enjoy seeing them treated with freshness and originality may find the present *Companion* well worth the price. But all too often, the book's contributors have been faced with impossible assignments, since an imprudent condensation is sometimes worse than an outright omission.

STEPHEN SIEK
WITTENBERG UNIVERSITY

Bernard Brauchli. *The Clavichord*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998. xix, 384 pp.: 122 black-and-white illustrations, 13 line diagrams, 5 musical exx., 1 table. ISBN: 0-521-63067-3. \$120.00 (cloth).

Although the clavichord has received attention in a number of organological articles over the years, there has never in any language been a full-length book to survey the subject in a comprehensive manner. Bernard Brauchli's publication is the first to achieve that goal. His enthusiasm for his subject, evident throughout the book, has helped to drive the clavichord revival in recent decades. His knowledge of the instrument's history is thorough, and we are all in his debt for the present work.

The book is clearly written and well organized. Christopher Hogwood's witty foreword presents one of the themes to be developed by Brauchli: the importance and prevalence of the clavichord during almost half a millennium. There follow an introduction and seven chapters. The introduction gives a concise account of the basics of clavichord design. The first chapter discusses the clavichord's origins, and one chapter each is devoted to the instrument in the fifteenth, sixteenth, seventeenth, eighteenth, and early nineteenth centuries, with a final chapter outlining "Aspects of clavichord performance practice." This last is followed by a "Conclusion," barely more than two pages, perhaps too briefly summarizing the clavichord's revival period in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Three appendices provide a list of iconographical documents (probably close to definitive since the iconography of the clavichord has been Brauchli's special study for

many years); a useful presentation of technical terms in five languages; and a note outlining the career of Leopoldo Franciolini (the notorious Florentine antique dealer and forger, 1844–1920). The bibliography includes source documents and modern organological studies. The book is handsomely produced, with ample margins for annotation. Given the price, one could wish that it included a selection of color plates and that the often sombre-toned black-and-white illustrations were reproduced with more brightness and clarity. In any case, the volume is profusely illustrated, adding greatly to its overall value as a reference tool.

The focus is a survey of the clavichord throughout the time of its active historical use. The author draws on extant instruments, iconography, and written texts to present the general state of the clavichord, as well as interesting offshoots, in each period. Major points covered include makers (when known), range, fretting patterns, and overall design, with many specific instruments being touched on in relation to these points. The chapters on the various centuries include accurate English translations of significant clavichord-related commentaries from contemporary treatises; for the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries a large quantity of material is included. It is indeed useful to have this material collected together and accurately translated. Perhaps most significantly for the general reader, the importance of the clavichord's position during almost five centuries is attested to, indirectly revealing the extent to which this instrument's role has been both under-represented and misrepresented in musical history as written and taught throughout the twentieth century.

A book of this nature has long been overdue. Here for the first time is an in-depth presentation of the course taken through history by one of the fundamental keyboard instruments of the Renaissance, Baroque, and Classical periods. The perspective on what such a presentation should include will vary from reader to reader. Brauchli's strength is in the thorough knowledge that allows him to depict the clavichord's evolution and its cardinal position in the history of keyboard music, illuminated by early documents and a plethora of visual images. However, the book is disappointing in a few specific areas: (1) uneven coverage of earlier versus later periods, (2) scant account of schools and trends in clavichord design, and (3) the author's clear preference for the fretted varieties of clavichord over the unfretted types.

The coverage almost inevitably differs between the earlier and later periods, but one could wish for fewer contrasts in the nature of that

coverage. With only five clavichords known to have survived from the sixteenth century, for instance, much attention is given to a few specific instruments. One misses similar detail in the survey of the eighteenth century, where the section discussing the extant instruments themselves presents less actual text than the comparable section on sixteenth-century clavichords and, in surveying the far greater quantity and diversity of building styles, gives much less detail. The tables of measurements and structural materials included for the sixteenth century have no counterparts in the discussion of eighteenth-century instruments, whose tables are limited to one on keyboard compass and another that lists builders and the number of extant clavichords by each. At the least, a closer examination of two or three instruments that represent important eighteenth-century trends would have been an informative balance to the technical detail presented so well in the discussion of sixteenth-century clavichords. The approach offered by the book may have been taken in the interests of equality of emphasis on each period (after all, there is much non-technical material in the later portions of the chapter on the eighteenth century), but the effect is to weaken the presentation of the later styles of clavichord. It is also disappointing to find that distinct schools of German building in the eighteenth century are not identified as such: the Hamburg group represented by the Fleischers, Hasses, and Gerlach and the style represented by Friederici and Horn are two notable examples. (On the other hand, the relationship among Swedish builders Lindholm, Nordqvist, and Wessberg is acknowledged.) Brauchli's presentation of the earliest known unfretted clavichords (Heinitz, 1716 and J. C. Fleischer, 1723) is minimal and is preceded by negative comments on the supposed disadvantages of unfretted instruments. Nor are their relationships to later instruments made clear: the Heinitz clearly has a great deal in common with design elements still used in the 1740s by P. J. Specken, and the Fleischer is the earliest extant example of the unfretted Hamburg style that is well known from instruments by Gerlach and the Hasses. Neither instrument is a freak—each is clearly a significant first extant item in an important mainstream of clavichord building—but these and similar points are not made in the text.

The altogether scantly organological section on the later period may partly relate to Mr. Brauchli's preference for the fretted clavichord over the unfretted instrument, a bias that emerges rather too clearly. This feeling is understandable, in that only unfretted instruments were constructed during the earlier phases of the twentieth-century clavichord re-

vival. In an effort to right the balance, players and scholars such as Edwin Ripin and Brauchli have tended to stress the unexplored and neglected. However, the unfretted instrument had a large and important role, the recognition of which this book tends to undermine.

Brauchli makes the most of any remarks in the historical record that support the fretted instrument. However, it seems clear enough (cf. comments by Johann Speth as early as 1693 and by a host of prominent eighteenth-century figures) that the unfretted clavichord was considered to be preferable for art music, certainly for the avant-garde repertory. In fact, many important works extend below the bottom C that is the usual bass limit of fretted clavichords of whatever design. Nonetheless, despite eighteenth-century preferences and the wealth of unfretted designs, we find in Brauchli's work such a blanket remark as "Ultimately, what the unfretted clavichord gained in technical facilities it lost in musical qualities" (p. 148). Although there were many builders of superb unfretted clavichords in the eighteenth century, C. G. Hubert, whose specialty appears to have been fretted designs, "was the most refined of the German clavichord makers" (p. 163). Of a 1726 unfretted clavichord by J. P. Roos, with gaps between the keys akin to those of fretted designs, "it is possible that the maker had a commission for an unfretted clavichord which he did not expect to be repeated" (p. 177). (In view of the number of layout features that would have to be altered from a fretted design, the point seems questionable; nor is the Roos keyboard a unique instance among unfretted clavichords.) It is surprising to find repeated (p. 146) the twentieth-century myth, begun by Arnold Dolmetsch in 1915 and sustained by Ripin in 1970, that Bach's *Well-Tempered Clavier* contains only three or four passages that are not playable on a fretted clavichord. In fact, there are many, often climactic, passages which cannot be sounded as written on the most usual fretted pattern because they require certain semitones to be sounded simultaneously or by suspension. There are at least two dozen such instances in Book 1 alone.

The author's intention to provide an historical survey rather than technical history is clear (and is indeed stated in the introduction). Mr. Brauchli did not set out to write the clavichord's complement to Frank Hubbard's pioneering work on the harpsichord. The book giving an in-depth look at clavichord design and acoustics has yet to be written. However, even from a survey like the present one, the reader could hope for more discussion of design elements and perhaps a suggestion of specific musical characteristics, difficult to describe though they may be.

Moreover, many of the technical comments included are highly questionable. A single example will have to suffice here. Of the very large Swedish instruments from around 1800, the author states, "A solution often adopted to save space and reduce the total length of the instrument without shortening the soundboard was to prolong [i.e., extend] the latter over the belly-rail and the keylevers of the extreme treble notes" (p. 230). Those who have experimented on paper with clavichord design factors know that maintaining a favorable position of the bridge on the soundboard with treble notes above c''' can become very difficult. The Swedish designs extending an octave higher to c''' in fact require a cantilevered belly-rail to avoid locating the bridge directly above the belly-rail itself.

To return to the very positive aspects of the book: The twentieth century's presentation of the history of keyboard instruments and their music has almost entirely slanted focus away from the clavichord and toward the harpsichord and piano. Brauchli rights the balance of this neglect, not only in the course of his work as a whole, but also by bringing together a number of quotations which one would be hard-pressed to find reproduced elsewhere. Certain passages should be surprising to many in the mainstream (and to some clavichord enthusiasts)—where else, for instance, has Bach-student Johann Philipp Kirnberger's enthusiasm for the clavichord been mentioned in modern studies? (See especially p. 326, footnote 69.) As an argument for the central role of the clavichord in European keyboard music, the book as a whole makes a powerful presentation, and one that has long been overdue. Bravo, Mr. Brauchli!

RICHARD TROEGER

ANDOVER, MASSACHUSETTS

Nicholas Thistlethwaite and Geoffrey Webber, editors. *The Cambridge Companion to the Organ*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998. xiv, 340 pp.: 39 black-and-white illus., 8 tables, 50 musical exx. ISBN: 0-521-57309-2 cloth; -57584-2 paper. \$57.95 cloth; \$21.95 paper.

This book is described by its publishers as "an essential guide to all aspects of the organ and its music. . . . The essays, all newly commissioned, are written by experts in their field, making this the most authoritative reference book currently available." This last statement, of course, is to be taken with a grain of salt, since it is certainly *not* the "most authoritative" such book. However, it is a very good one.