

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XXV • 1999



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

wind historians and another unusual feature of this work. Finally, there is a combined index of names and places.

The book is an attractive and first-rate production on heavy-stock glazed paper, with category indications on the colored edge strips of each recto page, matching the colored cover pages of each section. The boards are graced with full-color photos of one of the handsomest instruments in the collection, complementing the color plates on pages 225–37. (Oddly, the editor did not include any references under the instrumental entries to the color plates.)

In summary, Dr. Young's catalogue is an impressive addition to an already unique and substantial oeuvre by this dean of woodwind organologists. It is also a significant contribution to the growing body of scholarly monographs documenting the place of woodwind instruments in music history. As such, it belongs in every serious organological library.

MICHAEL FINKELMAN

PHILADELPHIA, PENNSYLVANIA

Barbara Owen. *The Registration of Baroque Organ Music.* Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1997. ix, 284 pp. ISBN: 0-253-33240-0 cloth; 0-253-21085-2 paper. \$39.95 cloth; \$19.95 paper.

Commenting on organ registration, the early German organ expert Arnolt Schlick said: "With eight or nine good stops, properly combined and alternated, one may give the listener much pleasure" (*Spiegel der Orgelmacher und Organisten* [Speyer, 1511], fol. 16r; my translation). Today, almost five hundred years after Schlick published his treatise, registration remains one of the most important aspects of organ playing. It is especially crucial for the music of the Baroque, the period when the organ came into its own as a major artistic instrument and a vast body of masterworks for that instrument was concomitantly produced. Modern organists, who are more likely to be playing a twentieth-century "eclectic" instrument than one based on historic principles (to say nothing of an actual Baroque organ preserved in or restored to its original condition), must often resort to musical alchemy to concoct the appropriate Baroque sounds from eight or nine (or eighty or ninety) ranks. And they receive little guidance from composers of the period, who rarely indicated details of registration on their notated scores of organ music.

If we look to other sources, however, registration practices between 1500 and 1800 (taking the extended parameters of pre-Baroque through post-Baroque music) are fairly well documented. Organ contracts often include the builder's suggestions for the use of stops in a new instrument. Writings by such authorities as Michael Praetorius, Adriano Banchieri, Andreas Werckmeister, Johann Mattheson, and Jakob Adlung, as well as Schlick, discuss contemporary instruments and often touch on registration. Of course, the dispositions of historic instruments themselves provide prime raw material for our knowledge of registration. Modern scholarship has unearthed much of this information on registration, and persistent readers will find it piecemeal in general histories of the organ and its literature, monographs and articles on individual aspects of Baroque organ sound, prefaces to musical editions, and facsimiles and/or critical translations of theoretical treatises. Nevertheless, with a large body of research recorded in diverse and not always accessible works, there has remained a need for a reliable, comprehensive study devoted to organ registration in the Baroque period.

In *The Registration of Baroque Organ Music*, Barbara Owen has taken a major step towards meeting this need. As a historian of the organ, Owen is widely acclaimed for her path-breaking research into the organ in America. Her work is published in the book *The Organ in New England*, as well as in numerous monographs, journal articles, and entries in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians* and *The New Grove Dictionary of Musical Instruments*. Owen is also an accomplished musician, for many years serving as organist and choir director at the First Religious Society in Newburyport, Massachusetts; and she has trained in the craft of organ-building in the shop of C. B. Fisk. As with organ experts over the centuries, who relied on both practical experience and theoretical knowledge, Owen's empirical skills are as much evident in the present book as is her scholarly research.

The Registration of Baroque Organ Music is arranged chronologically in four parts: (1) Prologue: Renaissance and Reformation; (2) Late Renaissance to Early Baroque; (3) High Baroque; and (4) Summation: Late Baroque to Classical. Each part contains, after a brief introductory section summarizing the organs and the music of the period, a series of chapters devoted to individual geographic areas within the time period in question. For example, the seven chapters under the heading "High Baroque" deal with England; France and Lower Netherlands; Italy; Spain, Portugal, and Mesoamerica; Northern Germany, Holland, and

Scandinavia; Central Germany; and South Germany, Austria, and Eastern Europe. Each chapter gives a list of composers active in the particular region, a representative group of organ dispositions (usually six or seven), and an examination of registration practices associated with the given style of instruments and compositions. The book concludes with two appendixes that list "Restored Historic Organs in North America" and "Modern Historically Based Organs in North America," a bibliography of 343 books and articles, and an index.

The historical data presented in the twenty-three chapters of this book will greatly facilitate a reader's quest for knowledge about registrational styles fitting a particular composer. For example, an organist seeking to learn how to register a work of Frescobaldi will find (in chapter 6) a fully annotated description of the standard Italian organ of ca. 1600. This instrument had a single manual that controlled stops of mostly principal and flute pipes, probably featuring the typically Italian *voce umana*, lacking reed stops, but amply supplied with accessory devices (drums, birdcall, tremulant). An eight-key (short-octave) pedal was often permanently coupled to the manual. Further, readers will have at their fingertips commentary culled from important treatises by Banchieri, Diruta, and Antegnati. The last-named author gives clear instructions for different combinations of stops. "Ripieno" (full organ), for example, denotes all the principal stops together, from principal 16', through the highest-pitched ranks, thus: 16', 8', 4', 2', 1 $\frac{1}{3}$ ', 1', and even higher mutation stops. In similar detail, Antegnati explains the "half ripieno" and several other combinations of sounds, and he associates sample registrations with types of compositions. Finally, the reader will profit from Owen's advice on adapting such historical evidence to modern instruments. Among other points here, she counsels the player to choose "a good warm-sounding Principal stop," perhaps one on a secondary division; to use mixtures with caution, to "avoid heavy foundational flutes, especially at 8' pitch, as well as thin voices such as strings and Quintadenas"; and to add reeds sparingly, avoiding full-length reeds entirely (p. 59).

The title of this book reflects our common understanding of Baroque music as having unity of spirit, if not uniformity in styles. Organists are perhaps more likely than other performing musicians to be influenced by an idiosyncratic example of their own particular instrument, and thus they may internalize a skewed or falsely monochromatic idea of Baroque sound, possibly coming to view this era as it has been represented by the so-called "neo-Baroque" instruments of the 1950s and 1960s. On the

contrary, Owen's study documents a remarkable diversity of color, idiom, and aesthetic in this extended period of development. For example, a majority of German experts, including Praetorius, Werckmeister, and Mattheson, assert their disapproval of combining stops of the same pitch (e.g., a principal 8' with a flute 8'). The somewhat younger Adlung, however, not only approves the combining of like-pitched stops, but even endorses a multiple-stop recipe that Owen describes as an "everything-but-the-kitchen-sink" registration (p. 167). Modern players nurtured on the "neo-Baroque" approach to organ sound may be taken aback by the admonitions commonly reiterated in historical sources against "gapped" combinations, that is, registrations made up of widely separated low and high pitched stops, with the intermediate pitches intentionally omitted. Yet at least one writer, the south German organist Johann Baptist Samber, positively recommends gapped formations (p. 179). In general, Baroque organ experts seem to agree with William Ludham's judgment that "the good taste of the player must supply the want of more particular directions for the management of stops" (p. 102) and Werckmeister's axiom that "a good ear is the best criterion" (p. 144). Such truisms embody the attitude of diversity and freedom assumed by Baroque performers, but they hardly guide the modern student of Baroque music. Fortunately, Owen's meticulous research has brought to light many of the "particular directions" for the "good ear" to choose from.

As mentioned above, Owen regularly steps outside the role of pure scholar in this book to don the mantle of teacher or coach to the musician who is required to function in the "real world" of organ playing in contemporary America (or, for that matter, in Europe). By suggesting ways to adapt historic Baroque registrations to modern instruments, she gives invaluable methods, hints, even tricks, to aid the player in achieving a semblance of authenticity on an inauthentic instrument. To do justice to eighteenth-century north German music (works by Buxtehude, Bruhns, and Böhm, for example), she advises (p. 148):

On organs with too much foundation and not enough in the way of mutations, supercouplers and reeds may have to be used in imaginative ways to achieve brightness and balance. On those with too little foundation and too much upperwork, the rule against multiplying 8' stops will have to be broken, and the upperwork perhaps used more sparingly in order to simulate a more authentic-sounding balance. As in all organs of the Renaissance and Baroque periods, a warm and singing 8' Principal is an indispensable stop, and modern organs lacking such a color are handicapped.

Thus on those unfortunate instruments possessing no 8' Principal at all, every 8' flue stop available, regardless of color, may have to be marshalled to support and balance the plenum.

In the course of the text, she also articulates certain basic principles that bear repetition, even in a specialized work like this book. Her recommendation to the organist choosing stops on an "all-purpose" or "eclectic" mid-twentieth-century instrument is that "the best approach to early keyboard music is a process of elimination, and the player must have a clear mental catalog of what may be used and what is best avoided" (p. 28). Actually, adherence to this doctrine could do wonders for a wider range of organ repertoire. In my own recent experience as visiting organist in many New York area churches, I find that pre-set registrations more often reflect the allure of accumulation than the discipline of elimination.

The major editorial task required for the production of this book concerns the nomenclature of organ stops. The vocabulary of stop names is multi-lingual, archaic, diverse, and inconsistent. Historians of this complex instrument need to decide whether to translate, modernize, standardize, and define or explain stop names; and, if this is done, how to show such editorial intervention, especially in representative dispositions. Owen's editorial policy, as stated in the introduction (p. viii), addresses these questions as follows: "While stop names will be given in the language of the country under discussion, they will be in modern, rather than archaic, spelling, with explanations where necessary." This statement leads the reader to expect that, within a given culture (i.e., geographical area and time span) the term for each comparable stop will appear in a consistent form, including spelling, diacritical markings, capitalization, etc. In fact, the book deviates from the stated policy, presenting in close proximity such variants as: Flûte, Flute, flute, and Fflute; Pédale and Pedalle; Quintadehn, Quintadena, and Quintaden; Holpijp and Holpyp; and Positivs and positives. Nor does the rule of modern orthography apply throughout, for example with the words Trommte, Hülziner Bass, Flöiten, and even the English terms Principall, Twentie, and Stopt. Moreover, Owen mentions "explanations where necessary" in her statement of editorial policy concerning her treatment of stop names, but she does not define her apparatus for showing these explanations. Thus the reader may wonder what, if any, distinction is implied by the varied uses of question marks and parentheses along with the

different spellings in such examples as: "Flûte a neuf trous 2' (?) (recorder)" (p. 9) and "Flutes à neuf trous 4' or 2'? (recorder)" (p. 11). Although these kinds of editorial irregularity demonstrate that the goal of absolute consistency is difficult to attain, more careful editing should have provided greater concordance.

While the kinds of flaws mentioned above may pose a distraction to the reader, they nevertheless do not seriously diminish the achievement of the work. In this book, Barbara Owen has created a rich resource of historical information coupled with strategies for interpreting that information on today's instruments. *The Registration of Baroque Organ Music* is the first work in the English language to survey this central aspect of organ literature. It makes an original and essential contribution to the history and practice of Baroque organ music.

JANE SCHATKIN HETTRICK
RIDER UNIVERSITY

Robert F. Gellerman. *The American Reed Organ and the Harmonium: A Treatise on Its History, Restoration and Tuning, with Descriptions of Some Outstanding Collections, Including a Stop Dictionary and a Directory of Reed Organs.* Vestal, N.Y.: The Vestal Press, Ltd., 1996. ix, 303 pp.: 437 black-and-white illus., diagrams, charts. ISBN: 1-879511-07-X cloth; 1-879511-12-6 paper. \$39.95 cloth, \$29.95 paper.

Robert R. [i.e., F.] Gellerman. *Gellerman's International Reed Organ Atlas.* Second edition. Lanham, Md.: Vestal Press, Inc., 1998. xiii, 316 pp.: 190 black-and-white illus. ISBN: 1-879511-34-7. \$35.00 (cloth).

Robert Gellerman pioneered in the field of reed organ research with the publication of *The American Reed Organ* in 1973. That work served as an impetus for the formation of the Reed Organ Society as well as encouraging new research concerning the reed organ. His 1996 volume is described by the publisher as "more than just a new edition" in light of the substantial additions of information, along with photographs, diagrams, and drawings. Indeed, the collection of photographs and company advertisements is what makes the 1996 *American Reed Organ* a worthy complement to one's research library. Gellerman has assembled a remarkable compilation of manufacturers' advertisements and contemporary descriptions of the instruments that tell the story of the reed organ as