

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XXV • 1999



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

BOOK REVIEWS

Florence Gétreau. *Aux Origines du Musée de la Musique: Les Collections instrumentales du Conservatoire de Paris, 1793–1993.* Paris: Éditions Klincksieck and Réunion des Musées nationaux, 1996. 799 pp.: 129 black-and-white illustrations, 25 tables. ISBN: 2-252-03086-0 and 2-718-3482-4. FF800 (cloth).

This is a magnificent book. Written by Florence Gétreau, an indefatigable scholar who spent some twenty years of her career at the Musée Instrumental du Conservatoire in Paris, it is an unprecedented work. Only she could have written it. Now serving as Curator of Musical Instruments at the Musée national des Arts et Traditions populaires—located on the edge of the Bois de Boulogne in Paris—Dr. Gétreau is an author, editor, and contributor to a number of highly important studies about French instruments, their makers, and the cultural context of which they once were a part, including *Instrumentistes et Luthiers Parisiens, XVII^e–XIX^e siècles* (Paris, 1988) and *Guitares: Chefs-d'oeuvre des collections de France* (Paris, 1980). In another role, as Director of the Laboratoire d'organologie et d'iconographie musicale du Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, she also produces the important series, *Musique • Images • Instruments: Revue français d'organologie et d'iconographie musicale* (Vols. 1 and 2 of which were reviewed in this JOURNAL 24 [1998]: 146–48). Her interest in the story of the musical instrument collections at the Musée Instrumental spans many years, ranging from research that she first did for her doctoral dissertation to her extensive involvement in planning for the new Musée de la Musique, where the collections are now housed.

Musical instrument museums have not been a public priority in most of the world. Complete catalogues of most of the important collections still are not available, and even basic checklists are difficult to find. It is no surprise, therefore, that histories of musical instrument collections are virtually nonexistent. With the exception of *Wege zur Musik*, published in 1984 to celebrate the opening of the new Musikinstrumenten-Museum in Berlin, and *100 Jahre Berliner Musikinstrumenten-Museum, 1888–1988*, published to celebrate the 100th anniversary of that venerable institution, little of substance has been written, as a quick glance at Gétreau's bibliography of histories of major musical instrument

collections (just one of the many lists that can be found in this comprehensive book) demonstrates. The two Berlin books, as fascinating as they are, pale in comparison to what Gétreau has accomplished.

Berlin and Paris are among the few places where musical instrument collections do receive the governmental support they deserve. Attending the January 1997 opening of the new Musée de la Musique, now a component of the Cité de la Musique (located in its own building, as well as separated administratively from the Conservatoire), this reviewer could not help but marvel at the reality of a musical instrument museum that boasts a staff of fifty. Some nine hundred of the Musée's more than four thousand instruments are lavishly displayed in monumental fashion, along with paintings, sculpture, and other music-related artifacts. Walking at twilight across the Parc La Villette (reclaimed land where slaughter houses once provided meat for the people of Paris) toward the lights of the futuristic structure that houses the Cité de la Musique, one must be amazed at the way that many cultural treasures like the musical instruments now housed in such splendor miraculously managed to survive the ravages of time—in this case, the difficulties posed by two hundred years of social strife, ranging from the excesses of the French Revolution to the barricades of 1848, the Franco-Prussian War of 1870, the slaughter of World War I, and the occupying forces of World War II.

It is the story of those two hundred years, of course, that Gétreau documents in such wonderful detail. Like most European musical instrument collections, which typically focus on instrument making in those regions where at one time or another the country exercised political or economic dominance, the Paris collection is particularly rich in French and Italian instruments. Beginning with a 1793 decree by the National Convention that called for the development of an Institut National de Musique, Gétreau leads us through the intrigues of the time, as eminent composers and others struggled to achieve their own particular aims, when many French institutions were first being established. A *dépôt* (depository) for instruments confiscated from fleeing émigrés was part of the planning, although many of those instruments were later sold or destroyed. Lists from 1794–96, 1797 and 1816–17 (Tables I–V) illustrate much of that story. Collections administered by a music school can be subjected during difficult times—then as now—to a strange kind of cannibalism, losing out to other staff or space needs. For example, harpsichords were of little practical value for student use in the early nine-

teenth century, so they were discarded from collections. Thus, it seems, instrument collections flourish best when not subject to the whims of a music faculty. Today, both the Brussels and the Paris collections are administered separately from the conservatories with which they were associated for so long.

The modern history of the Musée Instrumental dates from the hiring of Louis Clapisson as curator on March 29, 1861. He donated 230 instruments in exchange for an annual pension. Another eighty-eight instruments were donated in 1864. At his death, in 1866, he was succeeded briefly by Hector Berlioz, who died in 1869. During Gustave Chouquet's curatorship (1871–1886) many of the important Adolphe Sax instruments were acquired. Italian stringed instruments and related materials followed, after the death in 1875 of Jean-Baptiste Vuillaume, the great French violin maker. Other important collections were dispersed in the 1880s, as well, with many of the instruments ending up at the Musée Instrumental. It was also during Chouquet's tenure that instruments from India were donated by Sourindro Mohun Tagore.

Some seventy-five years later, Geneviève Thibault de Chambure became curator (1961–1973). She brought a new level of professionalism and international involvement to the Musée Instrumental. She also assembled one of the great private collections of the time—more than eight hundred instruments that the Musée eventually acquired from the Chambure family in 1979/1980.

Those are only a few of the highlights, of course. It is a rich, multi-layered story. Gétreau also writes eloquently about other issues: restoration (Table XX is a list of all such work done between 1864 and 1973), facilities, exhibiting, temporary exhibitions, concerts, catalogues, and research. The only thing missing, it seems, is a list of the 129 black-and-white illustrations.

Gétreau writes in a straightforward manner, easily accessible even to those with but a minimal reading knowledge of French. Organized with lots of subheadings, this is a perfect book for reading "a bit at a time" on long winter evenings. Even individuals who can understand not a word of French will find the book useful because of Table XXV, a chronological list of acquisitions that forms a checklist of the collections through 1993. With a concordance and an extensive index, the entire inventory is readily accessible for the first time ever.

If that is not sufficient motivation for buying the book, then invest in a copy just because such superb work deserves to be supported. Before

one knows it, copies of this monumental book will be available only through the auction houses.

ANDRÉ P. LARSON
 AMERICA'S SHRINE TO MUSIC MUSEUM
 THE UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH DAKOTA

Arnold Myers, editor. *Historic Musical Instruments in the Edinburgh University Collection: Catalogue of the Edinburgh University Collection of Historic Musical Instruments*. Edinburgh: The Collection, 1990–98. Volume 1: *The Illustrations* (1990). 168 pp. of illus., 287 black-and-white photographs; 13 x-rays. ISBN: 0-907635-17-2. £25.00. The following parts and fascicles of Volume 2 have been published (all with ISBN numbers starting with 0-907635): A.i: *Wind Instruments of Regional Cultures Worldwide* (1993). 43 pp. ISBN: -23-7. £3.00. A.ii: *Stringed Instruments of Regional Cultures Worldwide* (1995). 28 pp. ISBN: -28-8. £3.00. A.iii: *Percussion Instruments of Regional Cultures Worldwide* (1998). 32 pp. ISBN: -35-0. £4.00. B.i: *Harps, Dulcimers and Zithers* (1997). 35 pp. ISBN: -34-2. £4.00. B.ii: *Lutes, Citterns and Guitars* (1992). 44 pp. ISBN: -20-2. £3.00. C.i: *Viols and Violins* (1995). 64 pp. ISBN: -26-1. £4.00. D.ii: *Transverse Flutes* (1992). 100 pp. ISBN: -18-0. £5.00. E.i: *Oboes* (1994). 52 pp. ISBN: -25-3. £4.00. E.ii: *Bassoons* (1993). 29 pp. ISBN: -21-0. £3.00. F.i: *Clarinets* (1995). 104 pp. ISBN: -27-X. £5.00. F.ii: *Saxophones* (1996). 20 pp. ISBN: -32-6. £3.00. H.i: *Horns and Bugles* (2nd edition, 1997). 104 pp. ISBN: -33-4. £5.00. H.ii: *Cornets and Tubas* (1994). 92 pp. ISBN: -24-5. £5.00. H.iii: *Trumpets and Trombones* (1993). 69 pp. ISBN: -22-9. £4.00. H.iv: *Small Mouthpieces for Brass Instruments* (1996). 89 pp. ISBN: -30-X. £5.00. H.v: *Large Mouthpieces for Brass Instruments* (1996). 55 pp. ISBN: -31-8. £4.00. J.ii: *Drums* (1998), 44 pp. ISBN: -36-9. £4.00. K: *Ancillary Equipment* (1995). 66 pp. ISBN: -29-6. £4.00.

Edinburgh University's Collection of Historic Musical Instruments (EUCHMI) is one of the most important collections in Europe, containing more than 2,500 musical instruments, which exemplify almost every variety of European instrument as well as a large selection of instruments from many other countries. EUCHMI consists of several distinct constituent collections, including the faculty collection assembled during the nineteenth century; the Galpin Society collection; the collection of woodwinds formed by F. Geoffrey Rendall; Anne Macaulay's collection of

plucked strings; the C. H. Brackenbury Memorial Collection; woodwinds from the Lyndesay Langwill collection; the Glen and Ross Collections of bagpipes and instrument-making tools; the percussion collection of James Blades; and part of the collection formed by E. Roy Mickleburgh. Additional instruments are lent from the Glasgow Museums and Art Galleries and several private collectors.

The University is fortunate to have as its half-time curator Dr. Arnold Myers, a highly energetic and talented individual. Myers combines careers as a curator, organologist, musical instrument collector, and librarian whose specialty is marine technology. Myers also served as the review editor for *The Galpin Society Journal* from 1987 to 1996 and is now its web site manager. He has written many articles for various journals and symposia on subjects pertaining to brass instruments and has organized four international exhibitions at EUCHMI.

The first part of the catalogue, published in 1990, is a 168-page volume of photographic illustrations. Its preface offers a concise history of the collection from 1860 to 1990; specifies Myers's "Methods of Cataloguing," with abbreviations used throughout the fascicles; and contains 287 photographs of individual instruments, mutes, cases, and mouthpieces. These are divided into the following categories: instruments of regional cultures worldwide (7), plucked and hammered stringed instruments (53), bowed stringed instruments (25), flutes and whistles (30), double reed woodwinds (29), single reed woodwinds (45), bagpipes (11), conical brasswind (18), intermediate brasswind (18), cylindrical brasswind (20), mouthpieces for brasswind (16), free reed instruments and musical glasses (3), percussion (12), and ancillary items (3). A total of 277 instruments, 16 brasswind mouthpieces, and 3 ancillary items are shown in these photographs.

In addition, there are thirteen radiographs (x-rays) that show the interior construction and details of: a mandolin by Schorn, Salzburg, 1717 (2 views); a voice flute by Bradbury, England, ca. 1720 (4 views); an anonymous early nineteenth century cornett (4 views); and eight ivory and one wooden, anonymous, brasswind mouthpieces (in 3 views).

For purposes of organizing like instruments together, there is definitely an advantage to the broad categories used in Volume 1. The eighteen fascicles of Volume 2, however, are not organized according to these broad categories but rather by instrument type, such as transverse flutes (including fifes, piccolos, alto and bass flutes); oboes (including musettes and English horns); clarinets (clarinettes d'amour, alto and

bass clarinets); saxophones (including octavins), etc. The exceptions are three volumes for wind, stringed, and percussion instruments of regional cultures worldwide, which group the instruments under the Hornbostel-Sachs classification system. Additional fascicles for instruments not yet catalogued are in the process of being written.

The fascicles were written by various specialists, but they were all edited by Myers and use consistent terminology and data headings. The front matter consists of a preface by Myers, a table of contents, an introduction by the author of the fascicle, and an explanation of the cataloguing methods and terminology. Then follows the text describing each instrument or item. In addition to a complete technical description of the instrument, single parts such as violin necks and scrolls, mechanisms, key mountings, and cases are described. In addition, Myers is the first to publish thorough descriptions of brass mouthpieces, thus contributing a great deal to the understanding of their construction. Each fascicle closes with a list of references, an index of makers' and other names and serial numbers, and an index of acquisition numbers. The two indices are invaluable, since the instruments are not arranged chronologically, nor by acquisition number or maker.

Myers has made it easy to access information concerning the EUCHMI collection. Each fascicle can be purchased individually—as a paper copy, on 3.5" disc in ASCII [American Standard Code for Information Inter-change] or WordPerfect 5.1 format, or by e-mail. (E-mail versions are transmitted in ASCII format, and the recipient has to add symbols and accent marks as explained in the "Read Me" file.) In addition, information is available at the EUCHMI web site at <http://www.music.ed.ac.uk/euchmi>. The web site includes short checklists for every instrument in the collection, and its "Electronic Picture Gallery" has photographs of seventy-two important additions since 1990. Thus, a researcher having access to Volume 1 of the catalogue and the web site can study photographs of all the most important instruments in the collection to date. All the instruments and additional items listed in Volume 1 are included on the web site, and the abbreviations used in the descriptions are listed and explained. A benefit of having this information online is that changes can be made easily when a new instrument or information is added or discovered. At this time, EUCHMI is one of a handful of major musical instrument museums that truly makes use of the world wide web as a cataloguing and documentary tool. (Two other collections that offer online catalogues are the Royal Northern College

of Music Collection of Historic Musical Instruments in Manchester, England [at <http://www.mcm.ac.uk/library/hwm1.htm>], and the Musée de la Musique in Paris [at <http://www.cite-musique.fr>].)

As for the printed catalogue, inevitably, errors in labeling the photographs in Volume 1 were discovered during the preparation of individual fascicles. For example on page 27 the zither (no. 177) was made in Munich, in 1842; and on page 34 the mandolin (no. 303) is now attributed to the Vinaccia family, ca. 1770. On page 89 a photo of three clarinets was printed in reverse; its caption should read (79), (1722), and (1681). In addition, a few small errors crept into the descriptions of instruments. For instance, the dating of no. 179, an *épinette des Vosges* by I. Lambert (vol. 2, pt. B, fas. i, p. 11), is given as ca. 1800, while the text under the photograph in Volume 1 (p. 27) gives a more reasonable date of the late nineteenth century. These errors are inconsequential considering the wealth of material and photographs presented. (Second editions of the fascicles on horns and bugles [vol. 2, pt. H, fas. i] and on trumpets and trombones [vol. 2, pt. H, fas. iii] with additions and corrections have already been published.)

In conclusion, these volumes constitute one of the most significant catalogues of a very large and important instrument museum. The mass of information presented is enormous and extremely thorough. Dr. Myers is to be congratulated for producing such useful fascicles which can serve as a model catalogue for any instrument museum. This catalogue is without doubt one of the most detailed and accurate of any produced today.

ALBERT R. RICE
CLAREMONT, CALIFORNIA

Phillip T. Young. *Die Holzblasinstrumente im Oberösterreichischen Landesmuseum / Woodwind Instruments of the Oberösterreichisches Landesmuseum (Kataloge des OÖ. Landesmuseums, Neue Folge, Nr. 113).* [Linz: The Museum, 1997.] 259 pp.: 91 black-and-white plates, 7 color plates, 91 tables. ISBN: 3-85474-013-1. ÖS380 (cloth).

The woodwind collection of the Oberösterreichisches Landesmuseum (the Upper Austrian Regional Museum) in Linz is a unique and important one, including many distinctive specimens. Among these may be noted three bass recorders by Denner, a bass flute by Bizey, an oboe by

Rockobaur (Haydn's favorite maker), a tenor oboe by Denner, an exceptional anonymous bass dulcian (depicted on the cover of this catalogue), and bassoons by Denner, Eichentopf, and Rockobaur. Here too are fascinating instruments by local and regional makers little represented elsewhere. Previously described only by a checklist, this collection is now made accessible to researchers by Phillip T. Young's catalogue. Among European collections of its size, it is likely the least known, as Dr. Young points out. His handsome and well-researched volume should rectify this situation very soundly indeed.

After brief prefaces by the museum's director, Dr. Gunter Dimt, and its musical instrument curator, Stefan Gschwendtner (who also functioned as the book's editor), Dr. Young presents an informative preface in which he chronicles some high points of musical instrument collection cataloguing of the past, with particular praise going to the work of Hubert Henkel and Herbert Heyde. This serves to explain the influences on the approach selected for the Linz catalogue. He then delves into provenance matters regarding the Linz collection, considerations that play a major role for those of us trying to document the historical usage of these instruments. Many specimens at Linz came from closed monasteries or as gifts from monastery instrumentaria being relieved of obsolete items. (The most important monastery donor is the Stift Kremsmünster, which still retains a number of important woodwinds.) Acknowledgments are made to Messrs. Dimt and Gschwendtner, as well as to Prof. August Humer of the Bruckner Conservatory, Linz, who inspired this publication and functioned as the principal translator of Dr. Young's text.

The bilingual catalogue describes ninety-one instruments: recorders, flutes, crumhorns, Deutsche Schalmeien, oboes and English horns, clarinets and basset horns, dulcians, bassoons, and a musette. Also included are wooden lip-reed instruments such as cornetts and bass horns. (While not usually grouped with woodwinds, these were often made—mouth-pieces excepted—by known woodwind makers, some of whose other work is represented here.)

Each instrumental entry is arranged uniformly, with much attention given to technical detail. The following headings are used:

- I. Symbols/Devices/Text of maker's stamp, where present.
- II. Exact pitch in Hertz, if determinable. (This category is largely limited to non-reed instruments, since the reed instruments here mostly lack the appurtenances necessary to make this de-

termination and are in dry condition, making playing on them risky.)

- III. Body materials, including details of mounts.
- IV. Number and composition of keys, and which fingers are intended to close each; key mount type; key flap shape, etc. (This last is a useful identifier in tracing unmarked instruments, makers' influences, and the like.)
- V. Overall assembled length (not including exposed tenons of the fragmentary specimens); number of pieces and their names, with length of each piece and tenon indicated in chart format.
- VI. Condition of the instrument, including missing pieces and repairs.
- VII. Approximate tone-hole and vent-hole diameters, where present, indicated in chart format; embouchure diameters for flutes. (Most tone holes lying below keys are omitted, for practical reasons.)
- VIII. Provenance, where this is documented.
- IX. Brief biographical details of the maker (largely extracted from *The New Langwill Index: A Dictionary of Musical Wind-Instrument Makers and Inventors* by William Waterhouse [London: Tony Bingham, 1993], credited in the preface).
- X. Present locations of similar specimens, where not noted in IX.
- XI. Directly relevant bibliography.

Such a carefully thought-out plan includes virtually everything any user of a catalogue might want, with the exception of such advanced technical matter as schematic diagrams and x-ray photographs, of interest primarily to specialists. (In major collections material of this sort is often kept on file and may be available upon application to the museum.) Each instrumental entry is accompanied by an exceptionally clear black-and-white photograph (by Franz Gangl) and, in some cases, by a photograph of the maker's stamp and/or line drawings of the keys (by Stefan Gschwendtner). One might wish that every occurrence of a maker's stamp were pictured, but this would often have been duplication of effort. Dr. Young's descriptions and commentary are concise and informative. Prof. Humer's translations, while good, only rarely preserve the informality and conversational tone characteristic of the author's style.

Historical notes under rubrics VIII, IX, and X and bibliographic notes under rubric XI add an important dimension found in few other catalogues. (Future instrument catalogues would do well to take a page out

of Dr. Young's work in these respects.) The page layout is attractive, with plenty of "air," and the quality of the photography is virtually unrivaled.

If one had to find something to criticize, it is that most of the instruments which disassemble are shown only in that form and are not depicted whole. While in most cases it does not require much knowledge or imagination to picture them in assembled condition, the approach taken to the photography here is more valuable to the technical rather than the cultural historian. Though this problem is in part remedied by a section of attractive color plates depicting seven of the instruments in assembled form, one can only wonder why the parts were chosen to be pictured over the whole instruments in the main body of the text, particularly since details of the tenons are furnished in rubrics V and VI of applicable entries. As the author notes in the preface, no catalogue can be all things to all readers, but one still hungers for photos of each instrument as it was played. Such minor shortcomings as this naturally stand out in sharper relief in a volume this well conceived and executed than they would in a lesser work. This matter aside, here is an exceptional book that will appeal equally to the general organologist, the museologist, the technical specialist, and the music historian.

Of particular value are the appendices, compiled by editor Gschwendtner. First is an index to key flap shapes, the first such this reviewer can recall having seen in a catalogue. (Useful as this is, Herr Gschwendtner has unfortunately failed to notice several graphic errors, the most serious of which is the omission of the flap illustrations on page 242. For these illustrations, one must therefore refer to the instruments indexed to determine the flap type. The remaining two pages of this appendix contain the needed illustrations, but page 245 is inexplicably left blank.) Then comes a useful source bibliography, which includes some intriguingly obscure items of interest. (This would best have been placed at the end of the volume.) Next is a list of instruments fully broken down by type, in the same order in which they appear in the catalogue, with museum numbers and page numbers indicated. This is useful primarily in concert with the appendices that immediately follow: a listing of the instruments by museum number, and a concordance between the instruments' museum numbers and those assigned by Othmar Wessely in his checklist *Die Musikinstrumentensammlung des Oberösterreichischen Landesmuseums* (Linz: The Museum, 1952). (These two appendices could well have been combined.) Following is a list of instruments whose provenance is known, grouped by the sources from which they came—a valuable aid to wood-

wind historians and another unusual feature of this work. Finally, there is a combined index of names and places.

The book is an attractive and first-rate production on heavy-stock glazed paper, with category indications on the colored edge strips of each recto page, matching the colored cover pages of each section. The boards are graced with full-color photos of one of the handsomest instruments in the collection, complementing the color plates on pages 225–37. (Oddly, the editor did not include any references under the instrumental entries to the color plates.)

In summary, Dr. Young's catalogue is an impressive addition to an already unique and substantial oeuvre by this dean of woodwind organologists. It is also a significant contribution to the growing body of scholarly monographs documenting the place of woodwind instruments in music history. As such, it belongs in every serious organological library.

MICHAEL FINKELMAN
PHILADELPHIA, PENNSYLVANIA

Barbara Owen. *The Registration of Baroque Organ Music.* Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1997. ix, 284 pp. ISBN: 0-253-33240-0 cloth; 0-253-21085-2 paper. \$39.95 cloth; \$19.95 paper.

Commenting on organ registration, the early German organ expert Arnolt Schlick said: "With eight or nine good stops, properly combined and alternated, one may give the listener much pleasure" (*Spiegel der Orgelmacher und Organisten* [Speyer, 1511], fol. 16r; my translation). Today, almost five hundred years after Schlick published his treatise, registration remains one of the most important aspects of organ playing. It is especially crucial for the music of the Baroque, the period when the organ came into its own as a major artistic instrument and a vast body of masterworks for that instrument was concomitantly produced. Modern organists, who are more likely to be playing a twentieth-century "eclectic" instrument than one based on historic principles (to say nothing of an actual Baroque organ preserved in or restored to its original condition), must often resort to musical alchemy to concoct the appropriate Baroque sounds from eight or nine (or eighty or ninety) ranks. And they receive little guidance from composers of the period, who rarely indicated details of registration on their notated scores of organ music.

If we look to other sources, however, registration practices between 1500 and 1800 (taking the extended parameters of pre-Baroque through post-Baroque music) are fairly well documented. Organ contracts often include the builder's suggestions for the use of stops in a new instrument. Writings by such authorities as Michael Praetorius, Adriano Banchieri, Andreas Werckmeister, Johann Mattheson, and Jakob Adlung, as well as Schlick, discuss contemporary instruments and often touch on registration. Of course, the dispositions of historic instruments themselves provide prime raw material for our knowledge of registration. Modern scholarship has unearthed much of this information on registration, and persistent readers will find it piecemeal in general histories of the organ and its literature, monographs and articles on individual aspects of Baroque organ sound, prefaces to musical editions, and facsimiles and/or critical translations of theoretical treatises. Nevertheless, with a large body of research recorded in diverse and not always accessible works, there has remained a need for a reliable, comprehensive study devoted to organ registration in the Baroque period.

In *The Registration of Baroque Organ Music*, Barbara Owen has taken a major step towards meeting this need. As a historian of the organ, Owen is widely acclaimed for her path-breaking research into the organ in America. Her work is published in the book *The Organ in New England*, as well as in numerous monographs, journal articles, and entries in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians* and *The New Grove Dictionary of Musical Instruments*. Owen is also an accomplished musician, for many years serving as organist and choir director at the First Religious Society in Newburyport, Massachusetts; and she has trained in the craft of organ-building in the shop of C. B. Fisk. As with organ experts over the centuries, who relied on both practical experience and theoretical knowledge, Owen's empirical skills are as much evident in the present book as is her scholarly research.

The Registration of Baroque Organ Music is arranged chronologically in four parts: (1) Prologue: Renaissance and Reformation; (2) Late Renaissance to Early Baroque; (3) High Baroque; and (4) Summation: Late Baroque to Classical. Each part contains, after a brief introductory section summarizing the organs and the music of the period, a series of chapters devoted to individual geographic areas within the time period in question. For example, the seven chapters under the heading "High Baroque" deal with England; France and Lower Netherlands; Italy; Spain, Portugal, and Mesoamerica; Northern Germany, Holland, and

Scandinavia; Central Germany; and South Germany, Austria, and Eastern Europe. Each chapter gives a list of composers active in the particular region, a representative group of organ dispositions (usually six or seven), and an examination of registration practices associated with the given style of instruments and compositions. The book concludes with two appendixes that list "Restored Historic Organs in North America" and "Modern Historically Based Organs in North America," a bibliography of 343 books and articles, and an index.

The historical data presented in the twenty-three chapters of this book will greatly facilitate a reader's quest for knowledge about registrational styles fitting a particular composer. For example, an organist seeking to learn how to register a work of Frescobaldi will find (in chapter 6) a fully annotated description of the standard Italian organ of ca. 1600. This instrument had a single manual that controlled stops of mostly principal and flute pipes, probably featuring the typically Italian *voce umana*, lacking reed stops, but amply supplied with accessory devices (drums, birdcall, tremulant). An eight-key (short-octave) pedal was often permanently coupled to the manual. Further, readers will have at their fingertips commentary culled from important treatises by Banchieri, Diruta, and Antegnati. The last-named author gives clear instructions for different combinations of stops. "Ripieno" (full organ), for example, denotes all the principal stops together, from principal 16', through the highest-pitched ranks, thus: 16', 8', 4', 2', 1 $\frac{1}{3}$ ', 1', and even higher mutation stops. In similar detail, Antegnati explains the "half ripieno" and several other combinations of sounds, and he associates sample registrations with types of compositions. Finally, the reader will profit from Owen's advice on adapting such historical evidence to modern instruments. Among other points here, she counsels the player to choose "a good warm-sounding Principal stop," perhaps one on a secondary division; to use mixtures with caution, to "avoid heavy foundational flutes, especially at 8' pitch, as well as thin voices such as strings and Quintadenas"; and to add reeds sparingly, avoiding full-length reeds entirely (p. 59).

The title of this book reflects our common understanding of Baroque music as having unity of spirit, if not uniformity in styles. Organists are perhaps more likely than other performing musicians to be influenced by an idiosyncratic example of their own particular instrument, and thus they may internalize a skewed or falsely monochromatic idea of Baroque sound, possibly coming to view this era as it has been represented by the so-called "neo-Baroque" instruments of the 1950s and 1960s. On the

contrary, Owen's study documents a remarkable diversity of color, idiom, and aesthetic in this extended period of development. For example, a majority of German experts, including Praetorius, Werckmeister, and Mattheson, assert their disapproval of combining stops of the same pitch (e.g., a principal 8' with a flute 8'). The somewhat younger Adlung, however, not only approves the combining of like-pitched stops, but even endorses a multiple-stop recipe that Owen describes as an "everything-but-the-kitchen-sink" registration (p. 167). Modern players nurtured on the "neo-Baroque" approach to organ sound may be taken aback by the admonitions commonly reiterated in historical sources against "gapped" combinations, that is, registrations made up of widely separated low and high pitched stops, with the intermediate pitches intentionally omitted. Yet at least one writer, the south German organist Johann Baptist Samber, positively recommends gapped formations (p. 179). In general, Baroque organ experts seem to agree with William Ludham's judgment that "the good taste of the player must supply the want of more particular directions for the management of stops" (p. 102) and Werckmeister's axiom that "a good ear is the best criterion" (p. 144). Such truisms embody the attitude of diversity and freedom assumed by Baroque performers, but they hardly guide the modern student of Baroque music. Fortunately, Owen's meticulous research has brought to light many of the "particular directions" for the "good ear" to choose from.

As mentioned above, Owen regularly steps outside the role of pure scholar in this book to don the mantle of teacher or coach to the musician who is required to function in the "real world" of organ playing in contemporary America (or, for that matter, in Europe). By suggesting ways to adapt historic Baroque registrations to modern instruments, she gives invaluable methods, hints, even tricks, to aid the player in achieving a semblance of authenticity on an inauthentic instrument. To do justice to eighteenth-century north German music (works by Buxtehude, Bruhns, and Böhm, for example), she advises (p. 148):

On organs with too much foundation and not enough in the way of mutations, supercouplers and reeds may have to be used in imaginative ways to achieve brightness and balance. On those with too little foundation and too much upperwork, the rule against multiplying 8' stops will have to be broken, and the upperwork perhaps used more sparingly in order to simulate a more authentic-sounding balance. As in all organs of the Renaissance and Baroque periods, a warm and singing 8' Principal is an indispensable stop, and modern organs lacking such a color are handicapped.

Thus on those unfortunate instruments possessing no 8' Principal at all, every 8' flue stop available, regardless of color, may have to be marshalled to support and balance the plenum.

In the course of the text, she also articulates certain basic principles that bear repetition, even in a specialized work like this book. Her recommendation to the organist choosing stops on an "all-purpose" or "eclectic" mid-twentieth-century instrument is that "the best approach to early keyboard music is a process of elimination, and the player must have a clear mental catalog of what may be used and what is best avoided" (p. 28). Actually, adherence to this doctrine could do wonders for a wider range of organ repertoire. In my own recent experience as visiting organist in many New York area churches, I find that pre-set registrations more often reflect the allure of accumulation than the discipline of elimination.

The major editorial task required for the production of this book concerns the nomenclature of organ stops. The vocabulary of stop names is multi-lingual, archaic, diverse, and inconsistent. Historians of this complex instrument need to decide whether to translate, modernize, standardize, and define or explain stop names; and, if this is done, how to show such editorial intervention, especially in representative dispositions. Owen's editorial policy, as stated in the introduction (p. viii), addresses these questions as follows: "While stop names will be given in the language of the country under discussion, they will be in modern, rather than archaic, spelling, with explanations where necessary." This statement leads the reader to expect that, within a given culture (i.e., geographical area and time span) the term for each comparable stop will appear in a consistent form, including spelling, diacritical markings, capitalization, etc. In fact, the book deviates from the stated policy, presenting in close proximity such variants as: Flûte, Flute, flute, and Fflute; Pédale and Pedalle; Quintadehn, Quintadena, and Quintaden; Holpijp and Holpyp; and Positivs and positives. Nor does the rule of modern orthography apply throughout, for example with the words Trommte, Hülziner Bass, Flöiten, and even the English terms Principall, Twentie, and Stopt. Moreover, Owen mentions "explanations where necessary" in her statement of editorial policy concerning her treatment of stop names, but she does not define her apparatus for showing these explanations. Thus the reader may wonder what, if any, distinction is implied by the varied uses of question marks and parentheses along with the

different spellings in such examples as: "Flûte a neuf trous 2' (?) (recorder)" (p. 9) and "Flutes à neuf trous 4' or 2'?" (recorder)" (p. 11). Although these kinds of editorial irregularity demonstrate that the goal of absolute consistency is difficult to attain, more careful editing should have provided greater concordance.

While the kinds of flaws mentioned above may pose a distraction to the reader, they nevertheless do not seriously diminish the achievement of the work. In this book, Barbara Owen has created a rich resource of historical information coupled with strategies for interpreting that information on today's instruments. *The Registration of Baroque Organ Music* is the first work in the English language to survey this central aspect of organ literature. It makes an original and essential contribution to the history and practice of Baroque organ music.

JANE SCHATKIN HETTRICK
RIDER UNIVERSITY

Robert F. Gellerman. *The American Reed Organ and the Harmonium: A Treatise on Its History, Restoration and Tuning, with Descriptions of Some Outstanding Collections, Including a Stop Dictionary and a Directory of Reed Organs.* Vestal, N.Y.: The Vestal Press, Ltd., 1996. ix, 303 pp.: 437 black-and-white illus., diagrams, charts. ISBN: 1-879511-07-X cloth; 1-879511-12-6 paper. \$39.95 cloth, \$29.95 paper.

Robert R. [i.e., F.] Gellerman. *Gellerman's International Reed Organ Atlas.* Second edition. Lanham, Md.: Vestal Press, Inc., 1998. xiii, 316 pp.: 190 black-and-white illus. ISBN: 1-879511-34-7. \$35.00 (cloth).

Robert Gellerman pioneered in the field of reed organ research with the publication of *The American Reed Organ* in 1973. That work served as an impetus for the formation of the Reed Organ Society as well as encouraging new research concerning the reed organ. His 1996 volume is described by the publisher as "more than just a new edition" in light of the substantial additions of information, along with photographs, diagrams, and drawings. Indeed, the collection of photographs and company advertisements is what makes the 1996 *American Reed Organ* a worthy complement to one's research library. Gellerman has assembled a remarkable compilation of manufacturers' advertisements and contemporary descriptions of the instruments that tell the story of the reed organ as

only primary documents can. These documents not only provide a fascinating glimpse into another time and place, but are indispensable evidence of the importance of the reed organ in turn-of-the-century society.

Unfortunately, organizational problems make this truly valuable compilation of illustrations difficult to use efficiently. While the acknowledgments section at the end of the book serves as an adequate index to the 437 figures, gaps appear where perhaps the source is unknown: for example, figures 433–37 are completely unidentified. Moreover, “figure” includes everything from period and modern photographs to diagrams, charts, and reproductions of letters, invitations, and reed organ music. All of these are estimable tools, but failure to classify the types more precisely or to provide a complete index of the types makes for cumbersome use.

The captions present another set of problems, since many of the figures remain undated, forcing one to resort to educated guesswork. Additionally, many of the captions of modern photographs do not indicate the instrument’s current location, thus creating a sizeable impediment to further investigation. Despite these difficulties, the figures remain Gellerman’s most significant contribution to scholars researching the reed organ.

Organizational problems also mar the chapter on the history of the reed organ. Subheadings would help readers navigate the dense and detail-laden text, and the addition of charts to plot chronological progression would help them avoid confusion amidst series of numbers piled up in the prose. Grammatical errors such as incorrect subject-verb agreement, along with style concerns such as layered prepositional phrases and excess verbiage, are distracting; these should have been corrected by an editor prior to publication. On the other hand, the chapter on stops and voices offers an excellent explanation of technical mechanical matters, complete with diagrams of various reed types and stop mechanisms, as well as a stop dictionary for American organs. Several of the appendixes provide practical assistance such as reproducible stop faces, instructions for constructing a manometer with which to tune a reed organ, and tuning charts for F- and C-scale organs.

The text of *The American Reed Organ and the Harmonium* provides adequate information for readers to gain a general understanding of the reed organ and reed organ manufacturers, but it leaves too many questions unanswered to be considered anything approaching a definitive work on the instrument. While it is a good introduction for someone just

becoming interested in reed organs, scholars will recognize the need for something more thorough. For instance, Gellerman makes quite a point of the longevity of the Scandinavian reed organ business (p. 37), but the obvious question “why?” is never broached. Nor does he attempt to explain the startling statement that in 1897 Estey’s production dropped suddenly to half its previous yearly average and never recovered (p. 81) or the interesting observation that “Jacob Estey himself never built an organ and couldn’t play the organ. He was the first of a new breed in the reed organ business in the United States—the professional manager and entrepreneur” (p. 23). An exploration of the phenomena engendering the appearance of the professional manager and entrepreneur in the reed organ world would have produced a significant, original piece of scholarship of potentially greater use than, for example, twelve pages taken to reproduce portions of George Bent’s *Four Score and More* (Los Angeles, 1929)—interesting material but information available elsewhere.

Documentation is scarce within the body of the text, and even the bibliography lacks thoroughness. More importantly, the reader is done a disservice by Gellerman’s having excluded general musical instrument collections from the list of reed organ collections, since many historically important, beautifully-preserved reed organs are housed in such general collections.

Despite its deficiencies, *The American Reed Organ and Harmonium* is a fine source for amateurs seeking basic information about the reed organ and for reed organ owners who want practical help in learning to maintain their organs. The assemblage of photographs, drawings, and advertisements alone makes the book worth owning.

The second edition of *Gellerman’s International Reed Organ Atlas* continues the objective of the first edition—to present “a complete listing of all reed organ manufacturers in the world, from the beginnings of the instrument in the early nineteenth century to the present” (p. xi). If the author has not been entirely successful in that endeavor, it is difficult to imagine arriving any closer to that goal than he has, in light of his representation of thirty-five countries with a total of more than two thousand entries. The *Reed Organ Atlas* provides an excellent starting point for scholarly research and contains precisely the sort of information sought by reed organ owners around the world when they decide to find out about the lovely instrument they inherited or could not resist buying at an estate sale.

Where such information is available, Gellerman provides brief sketches of company history and includes lists of instrument serial numbers and dates to aid in determining the age of an instrument or its city of manufacture. Especially helpful is the inclusion of trade suppliers. These entries, along with extensive cross-referencing furnished by indexes, are a boon for the researcher seeking to compile the often multi-faceted record of the numerous companies and individuals involved in manufacturing a single instrument.

As in *The American Reed Organ and the Harmonium*, the photographs and drawings included in the *Reed Organ Atlas* are of particular value. Moreover, they are not simply reproductions of those that appear in *The American Reed Organ*, but rather they extend the already capacious offering of the earlier work. Not only can the illustrations be enjoyed as charming or amusing—a North Dakota farm girl perched on a dictionary to play her reed organ; advertisements showing sweethearts together at the reed organ (including one with a caption that proclaims “The HIM she likes best”)—they are also immensely instructive of the important cultural and societal position held by the reed organ.

One must be careful not to consider the *Reed Organ Atlas* a final research source, as the bibliography lacks recently produced material that would be essential to a thorough research project. However, the extent of its basic data and cross-referencing makes it an invaluable informational tool for the reed organ buff and an excellent starting point for the more serious researcher.

ALLISON ALCORN-OPPEDAHL
TRINITY INTERNATIONAL UNIVERSITY
DEERFIELD, ILLINOIS

Trevor Herbert and John Wallace, editors. *The Cambridge Companion to Brass Instruments*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997. xix, 341 pp.: 42 black-and-white illus., 5 tables, 23 musical exx. ISBN: 0-521-56343-7 cloth; ISBN: 0-521-56522-7 paper. \$59.95 cloth; \$19.95 paper.

The challenge to the editors of a volume that has fifteen authors, such as *The Cambridge Companion to Brass Instruments*, is to create a cohesive whole that, while making full use of the most recent scholarship, does not read like a group of unrelated journal articles. Trevor Herbert and John Wallace have done an admirable job meeting this challenge, and in

doing so have produced an extremely useful and readable overview of the history and technique of brass instruments that will be of interest to a broad audience.

A wide range of topics is covered in the eighteen articles prepared for the volume, the majority of which are strong contributions to the literature on brass instruments. In the introduction the editors mention six themes that they requested the authors to consider as they examined their individual topics. These common issues (concerning main developments, repertory, performance practice, technological developments, the significance of individuals, and the wider context of social and music history) do help unify the book. The editors also asked contributors to "outline controversies where they exist because the growth of interest in performance practice on brass instruments has, understandably, produced a range of different, sometimes conflicting, views" (p. 3).

Two of the most interesting articles, both of which take on the controversy challenge well, are Robert Barclay's essay on "Design, technology and manufacture before 1800" and Keith Polk's "Brass instruments in art music in the Middle Ages." Barclay's discussion presents differing views on, among other topics, the development of vented and keyed brass instruments, as well as proposing a more likely explanation of why the inner surfaces of horn bells were painted black (to mask the absence of a perfect finish) than the usual myth (so that horses would not be startled by reflections of sunlight off polished metal). Polk outlines the diverging scholarly opinions on the roots of brass instruments in the west, interweaving evidence from early manuscripts to support his analysis of developments in playing technique.

Articles are arranged approximately in chronological order, the first being Margaret Sarkissian's "Lip-vibrated instruments of the ancient and non-western world," which makes important points on gender distinctions and the dangers of relying on older, outdated sources. Other articles on brass before 1800 include "The cornett" by Bruce Dickey, "'Sackbut,' the early trombone" by Trevor Herbert, and "The trumpet before 1800" by Edward H. Tarr, all of which present the most recent scholarship on their topics. Of particular interest is Thomas Hiebert's article "The horn in the Baroque and Classical periods," which cites little-known and unique musical examples to illustrate his commentary on the development of horn technique. On nineteenth- and twentieth-century topics, articles by Ralph T. Dudgeon ("Keyed brass"), Clifford Bevan ("The low brass"), Trevor Herbert ("Brass bands and other vernacular

brass traditions”), Roger T. Dean (“Jazz, improvisation and brass”), John Wallace (“Brass solo and chamber music from 1800”), and Simon Wills (“Frontiers or byways? Brass instruments in avant-garde music”) are all strong contributions to the study of their individual topics.

On the other hand, a few articles exhibit weaknesses. Neither article by Arnold Myers (“How brass instruments work” and “Design, technology and manufacture since 1800”) includes any footnotes. Though both are overviews, some footnotes, or at least an indication of references used, would be appropriate. In other articles, not all quotes are footnoted; perhaps some are considered common knowledge, but I believe that the references should be shown. As a specialist in nineteenth-century horn technique, it is perhaps inevitable that I should notice dubious statements in regard to the horn. In Myers’s second article, he implies that the valve was invented “merely to change crook simply and rapidly” (p. 126). This idea has been repeated for years in numerous sources but has been shown to be fiction. Heinrich Stöelzel and Friedrich Blühmel, the co-inventors of the valve, both clearly intended to make brass instruments chromatic.¹ On Brahms’s use of the horn, Simon Wills states in “Brass in the modern orchestra” that in some works the composer calls for two *Ventilhörner* [valved horns] and two *Waldhörner* [natural horns] (p. 161). But though most hornists undoubtedly performed his works on valved horns during the period of their composition, Brahms *scored* them exclusively for the natural horn. This scoring also negates Wills’s statement that in Brahms’s First Symphony “valves were for him a fast method of re-crooking” (p. 162). Robert Evans’s “The post-classical horn” includes small details that are incorrect. For example, in reference to Schubert’s famous song with horn obbligato *Auf dem Strom*, D. 943 (1828), Evans comments that “the outer sections are obviously designed for the hand horn in E, or the valve horn in F with the second valve depressed and then hand stopped” (p. 209), whereas Schubert actually wrote the work for the valved horn crooked in E (a

1. This was shown over twenty years ago by Herbert Heyde in part 1 of his series of articles on the early valve and valved instruments in Germany (*Brass Bulletin* 24 [1978]: 9–32), an important resource which, curiously, was not included in the extensive bibliography. The original source of the myth is an 1828 article by F. J. Fétis, translated in Jeffrey L. Snedeker, “Fétis and the ‘Meifred’ Horn,” this *JOURNAL* 23 (1997): 126–27. I discuss the issue in “Heinrich Stöelzel and Early Valved Horn Technique,” *The Historic Brass Society Journal* 9 (1997): 63–82.

common practice according to numerous nineteenth-century sources that indicate the use of crooks on the valved horn, which was not necessarily treated as a fixed-pitch instrument in F). I must also disagree with his statement that the middle section of the work is “virtually unplayable” on the natural horn, since several modern hand-horn artists have shown that *Auf dem Strom* can, in fact, be played on the natural horn, although an instrument and mouthpiece of authentic, period design must be used to obtain the necessary flexibility of pitch.²

One additional concern is worth noting. Several definitions in the glossary will seem, at the least, obscure to the reader in the United States. For example, German silver is defined as “white bronze,” whereas in the United States it would be called “nickel silver” and would not be thought of as being a bronze, since the alloy normally has no tin content.

Minor problems aside, *The Cambridge Companion to Brass Instruments* is a strong volume and would be a valuable addition to any library on instruments.

JOHN Q. ERICSON
CRANE SCHOOL OF MUSIC
SUNY POTSDAM

Brian W. Harvey and Carla J. Shapreau. *Violin Fraud: Deception, Forgery, and Lawsuits in England and America.* Second edition. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997. xxi, 212 pp.: 5 facsim. ISBN: 0-19-816655-9. \$35.00 (cloth).

Many of us have at one time or another had an experience with musical instrument fraud, and some of us experience it far too often. While the violin family has been the most targeted of musical instrument groups because of the extravagant value attached to many of its finer examples, fraudulent practices have affected all types of instruments. Various kinds of violin fraud have occurred since the dawn of violin making, but until now we collectors, connoisseurs, appraisers, and makers of violins have had few references to use in dealing with these practices. With this book, Brian Harvey (a law professor in Birmingham, England, and a violin connoisseur) and Carla Shapreau (an art law and intellectual property lit-

2. I had the privilege of hearing a stunning performance of *Auf dem Strom* on the natural horn by Richard Seraphinoff at the Early Brass Festival in 1997.

igator and a professional violin maker) have given us much needed information pertaining to fraud—information applicable to all musical instruments, not just the violin family.

Professor Harvey made his first attempts to expose forms of violin fraud with three articles published in *The Strad* (June–August 1982). A first edition of *Violin Fraud* was published in 1992. In this second edition, Harvey expands upon the former volume and adds an immensely important section by Ms. Shapreau covering violin fraud in America, along with such related topics as breach of contract and warranties, criminal liability, ethics, and intellectual property rights.

This volume should have something of interest for everyone. As a director in a major auction house, I was of course drawn immediately to the sections dealing with auctions, where Harvey cites laws and describes civil cases pertaining to the sale of goods in an open market (auction). In essence, auctions appear to be somewhat protected from several of the more common laws of malpractice and fault since, by definition, an auctioneer acts merely as an agent on behalf of each party—seller and buyer. Thus many disputes are resolved between seller and buyer, not between either party and the auction house. Also discussed are “Conditions of Sale,” which auction houses must clearly disclose to customers. Although designed to protect the auction house as thoroughly as possible, conditions of sale and exclusion clauses cannot be used to put the consumer at an unfair disadvantage. The descriptions of various civil cases arising from auction sales makes for enlightening and sometimes cautionary reading, both for buyers and for those of us who catalogue instruments and make representations about them.

Harvey also addresses the matter of honesty in evaluation of a private party’s instrument, explaining that appraisers are held only by their own ethics, not by law, to assure that their customers receive fair market valuations and are not offered sums known by the appraiser to be far less than the value. In addition, according to English law it is illegal to “disguise” business sales—to lead someone to believe that you are an unknowledgeable private party when in fact you are a member of the trade and legally considered an expert.

The history of false labeling (perhaps the most prevalent form of violin fraud) has been documented as far back as the seventeenth century, when Matthias Albiani’s instruments were copied, with false labels, during his lifetime. In some cases fraudulent instruments were near-perfect copies of the originals. The account of one particularly famous fraud,

the “Balfour” Stradivari, illustrates some of the difficulties in suppressing fraudulent instruments. This violin was offered in 1901 by Balfour & Co. (shippers and former jewelry dealers—why the public considered them violin experts we cannot know) as an instrument made by the master himself in 1692. It was sold as a genuine Stradivari and, despite publicity questioning its authenticity, changed hands several times after that. Many experts of the time were outraged by this instrument that they had long considered an imitation; finally, in 1964, the firm of W. E. Hill and Sons purchased it to take it off the market entirely, thus ending its saga of deceit.

In other chapters Harvey presents information on forgeries and related problems of attribution, and discusses violin theft, mentioning several case histories and describing the legal ramifications of selling, representing, or buying stolen property.

In the second half of the book, subtitled “The American Scene,” Ms. Shapreau opens with an account of the case of the lost or stolen “Duke of Alcantara” Stradivari violin, with which she was associated as a member of the legal team working for the University of California, Los Angeles, in its successful effort to repossess the instrument after it was found in someone else’s hands some twenty-six years later. The case illustrates legal points of possession, including the requirement that the finder of lost property must attempt to locate the true owner, and that reclaiming lost or stolen property after a long period of time may depend on how diligent the theft or loss victim has been in pursuing the missing property and notifying the world of its loss.

On the subject of misdescription, Shapreau focuses on the representations made by experts. I was surprised to discover that even a verbal misrepresentation during a transaction can constitute liability if it is proven that the buying party relied on the seller’s expert knowledge for the purchase. A stickier situation occurs with negligent misrepresentation, where the dealer gives professional *opinions*, believing them to be factual, that later turn out to be false; this also can constitute fraud due to negligent misrepresentation.

A brief chapter on tax issues will be of special interest to those who perform professionally and would like to be able to depreciate their often expensive instruments. A 1995 decision appears to set a highly useful precedent: Richard and Fiona Simon, both first violinists with the New York Philharmonic, won their court case in the Second Circuit against the Internal Revenue Service with regard to the depreciation of two François Xavier Tourte violin bows. They convinced the court that their

bows should not be considered art objects but “tools of the trade,” subject to wear and tear and thus depreciable, even though a “played out” bow could retain value as a collector’s item.

A worrisome issue is the all too common practice of “secret commissions” between teachers and dealers in sales of instruments to students. As Shapreau explains, concealing a commission may constitute fraud under the common law if the teacher’s relationship with the student gives rise to a duty to disclose this commission. In part to address issues such as this, the American Federation of Violin and Bow Makers has outlined a Code of Ethics (listed in Appendix 3) for all its members; violations can result in disciplinary action such as expulsion or suspension.

Although the detailed accounts of specific trials and laws in this book are highly informative, the section of most ready use is Appendix 1, which outlines practical guidelines for members of the trade, dealers, auctioneers, and others, such as collectors and teachers. These concisely and directly-stated points (presented as guidelines for those involved in the British violin trade, but applicable to America as well) summarize the legalities detailed in the previous chapters. The entire book should prove invaluable as a guide to legal and ethical practices in our field.

TODD FRENCH
BUTTERFIELD & BUTTERFIELD
LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA

Robert L. Barclay, editor. *The Care of Historic Musical Instruments*. Edinburgh: Museums & Galleries Commission and Canadian Conservation Institute [in cooperation with the International Committee of Musical Instrument Museums and Collections of the International Council of Museums, with financial assistance from the John S. Cohen Foundation], 1997. vi, 145 pp.: 18 black-and-white figures. ISBN: 0-660-17116-3. Can\$36.00 (paper).

Every collector should be concerned about the safekeeping of valuable instruments, but professional guidance is not always easy to find; published sources of specific technical information are scarce and sometimes contradictory, and reasoned approaches toward conservation can differ widely. This handbook goes a long way toward addressing the concerns of non-specialists. Its advice especially about handling and cleaning instruments will help private owners and restorers as well as

institutional custodians. The seven contributors—Robert Barclay (Canadian Conservation Institute, Ottawa), May Cassar (Museums & Galleries Commission, London), Friedemann Hellwig (Fachhochschule Köln), Cary Karp (Swedish Museum of Natural History, Stockholm), Arnold Myers (Edinburgh University Collection of Historic Musical Instruments), Jay Scott Odell (National Museum of American History, Smithsonian Institution, *emeritus*), and Mimi Waitzman (Early Keyboard Workshop, London)—beg the question of what makes any instrument “historic,” hence, presumably, worth preserving; their recommendations apply to modern as well as old instruments regardless of intrinsic quality. According to their specialties, the authors—mostly experienced conservators—discuss general care; storage and transport; properties of different substances; methods of fabrication, diagnosis and conservation; and maintenance. The text is packed with useful facts and strong opinions, not only on treatment and mistreatment of objects but also about professional ethics, environmental and cost controls, and documentation.

Specific problems of functioning organs and automatic and electronic instruments lie beyond the book’s scope; still, much information about their materials and potential hazards can be gleaned here. The book avoids excessive technicality, although a glossary would have been helpful, since words such as “frass” (insect debris and excrement) may not be familiar to all readers. Not all types of instruments receive equal attention: chapter 6, “Basic Maintenance of Playing Instruments” by Waitzman, Barclay, Odell, Karp, and Hellwig, devotes more than a dozen pages to stringed keyboards but less than two to woodwinds and only a few sentences to percussion, focused on drums (a little more about woodwinds and drums appears in chapter 5, “Basic Conservation Treatments”).

Although much useful advice is given, some pronouncements are questionable. Original or old drumheads, the book warns, “should never be sounded” (p. 105), though why this proscription should apply to, say, a drum of Ringo Starr’s is unclear. Even more dubious is the dogmatic assertion that “Playing original early instruments for historic and aesthetic reasons is philosophically unsound” (p. 107). Statements such as “No oil should ever be applied to the bores of historic instruments” (p. 77) or “Under no conditions should mechanical work be done on keywork of wood-bodied instruments” (p. 78) will provoke debate. Owners of glass flutes will be skeptical of the adjuration that woodwinds made of glass “should never be subjected to playing” (p. 101). The state-

ment that carbon dioxide and nitrogen “are becoming the preferred methods” (p. 25) of asphyxiating insects overlooks the increasing use of argon. Careless editing must have been responsible for such nonsensical statements as “A sudden change of relative humidity that may occur between removing an instrument from its case and beginning playing can be irreversibly damaging, and the opposite is true when returning it to storage after use” (p. 99) or “The jack holds the plectrum rigid while it is forced past the string creating a sound, damp the sound afterwards, and position the plectrum for sounding again” (p. 89). Elsewhere (pp. 75 and 97) missing words make sentences incomplete.

Consistent with a belief currently fashionable among some conservators that “Museums exist primarily to preserve the information inherent in objects” (p. 111), these authors’ primary concern is to retain irreplaceable evidence inherent in historic instruments by retiring them from active service. This is a contentious matter, but at least the book recognizes the futility of absolute “hands-off” policies and instead offers guidance for properly maintaining instruments that “must continue to work for their living” (p. v), even as it strongly discourages their use. In a sensible spirit of compromise, Odell and Karp distinguish playability from “soundability,” pointing out that “instruments can often be coaxed into providing useful audible evidence without first being subjected to invasive preparation” (p. 6), in contrast to the warning quoted above against ever sounding drums.

Whether or not playing historic instruments is perceived as a good thing obviously depends on viewpoints and circumstances, but it is clear that many important old instruments remain in regular use for compelling reasons and equally clear that such usage is ultimately harmful. For that matter, subjecting instruments to analytical examination, displaying them, or leaving them untouched also entails risk. Since even the most carefully protected artifacts will not last forever—certainly museums offer no guarantee of permanence—conservation efforts can only seek to prolong their existence, ideally for the benefit of humanity. However, an object’s potential heuristic, not to mention aesthetic, value is unknowable. Balancing future uncertainties against legitimate current interests and institutional needs is a delicate responsibility beyond the purview of most conservators.

The idea that museum pieces should be preserved intact rather than used (up) for the public’s benefit has long been debated. Discussing in 1857 whether London’s National Gallery should remove its paintings to

a less polluted but less accessible location, High Court Justice John Taylor Coleridge, himself no philistine, argued successfully that:

“. . . if it were demonstrable that the pictures in their present position must absolutely perish . . . this would conclude nothing. The existence of the pictures is not the end of the collection, but a means only to give the people an ennobling enjoyment. . . . If, while so employed, a great picture ‘perished in the using’ . . . it could not be said that the picture had not fulfilled the best purpose of its purchase, or that it had been lost in its results to the nation.”¹

Be this as it may, most owners and custodians today agree that musical instruments deserve respectful treatment, that unnecessary risks should be avoided, and that damage should not be ignored. The basis for any decision about conservation, restoration, or use should be the fullest available knowledge of the object: its significance, its materials and their properties, its design and construction, and the many factors tending toward deterioration—factors that include the effects of different treatments as well as absence of treatment, biological attack, pollution, and other perils. In any event, it is better to do nothing than to make an irreversible mistake. This book effectively conveys the complexity of responsible decision-making and constantly refers the reader to specialists for further guidance. To this end the authors’ addresses appear, along with a list of some relevant organizations and a brief bibliography, to which might be added Marjorie Shelley, ed., *The Care and Handling of Art Objects: Practices in The Metropolitan Museum of Art* (New York: The Metropolitan Museum of Art, rev. ed. 1996).

The sparsely illustrated text is slightly marred by production errors, including a few missing lines. But never mind the oversights and polemics; taken with a grain of salt, the book well serves its purpose as a cautionary guide to primary care.

LAURENCE LIBIN
THE METROPOLITAN MUSEUM OF ART

1. 1857 Report of the National Gallery Site Commission, quoted by Neil MacGregor in *‘To the Happier Carpenter’: Rembrandt’s War-Heroine Margaretha de Geer, the London Public and the Right to Pictures* (Groningen: The Gerson Lectures Foundation, 1995), 29–30.

Dieter Krickeberg, editor. *Der "schöne" Klang: Studien zum historischen Musikinstrumentenbau in Deutschland und Japan unter besonderer Berücksichtigung des alten Nürnberg*. Nuremberg: Germanisches Nationalmuseum, 1996. 287 pp.: 18 color photographs, 60 black-and-white photographs, 44 facsimiles, 27 tables. ISBN: 3-926982-48-9. DM45.00 (cloth).

This remarkably handsome book splendidly exemplifies its title. Its subject is "beautiful" sound, and the presentation is undoubtedly beautiful. The profuse illustrations are vivid and crisp, the type faces make for easy reading, and all of those involved in the production deserve every reader's gratitude. The book had its genesis in the planning at the Germanisches Nationalmuseum in Nuremberg of an exhibit on musical instrument building, and the Japanese connection came about through cooperation under the aegis of CIMCIM (Comité International des Musées et Collections d'Instruments de Musique).

It is never clear from the book why *schöne* is in quotation marks in the title. Perhaps the editor felt that beauty as applied to sound is a visual metaphor. Or perhaps *schöne* applies both to the instruments, whose manufacture in the workshops of Nuremberg and Japan provides the book's focus, and to the sounds they make. In any case, the editor makes clear (p. 7) that no unitary definition of beauty covers multiple cultures.

This is no mere "coffee-table" book, regardless of its many pictures of instruments and their manufacture. The essays, by first-rate scholars in Germany, North America, and Japan, deal with such subjects in Nuremberg instrumental history as historical woodwinds, their copies and re-creations (Rainer Weber, pp. 47–53), the baroque trumpet (Robert Barclay, pp. 54–65, one of four articles in English), acoustics of resonance plates (Bram Gätjen, pp. 66–67, and Dieter Krickeberg, pp. 68–70), gut strings in the sixteenth to eighteenth centuries (Mimmo Peruffo, pp. 99–111), the history of Nuremberg string-drawing to 1800 (Sabine Klaus, pp. 112–42), seven hundred years of Nuremberg organ building (Hermann Fischer and Theodor Wohnhaus, pp. 158–70), and research on Nuremberg instrument makers and musicians (Krickeberg, pp. 192–97, and Martin Kirnbauer, pp. 198–216). Herbert Heyde describes the means of production and trade organization in Nuremberg and Leipzig in the sixteenth to eighteenth centuries, asking why Leipzig rose above Nuremberg in wind-instrument categories during the eighteenth century (pp. 217–48). Finally, four articles, three of them translated into English, present materials on Japanese manufacture of

traditional instruments. Sumi Gunji compares these instruments with European instruments. Haruka Komoda and George Gish describe styles and manufacture of the biwa. Satoshi Simura presents the intricacies of the shakuhachi, and Tuneko Tukitani and Megumi Ochi give a great deal of information on the several kinds of Japanese drums.

The reviewer, faced with this diversity of authorship and of subject matter, has the dilemma of deciding whether to describe in a kind of précis all or most of the articles or to be (relatively) satisfied with some generalizations and some critical observations. As *Der "schöne" Klang* contains twenty-one articles, including a long, fascinating introduction by Dieter Krickeberg, the editor, I have telegraphed my own conclusion to this dilemma already by not even listing all of the articles. Those referred to above will give some sense of the variety of subjects handled in the book.

A general theme runs through the book, finding exemplification more or less clearly in the articles. As stated in the editor's preface, it is the "connections between musical culture and the structural and material details of musical instruments" ("Zusammenhänge zwischen der Musikkultur und den strukturellen bzw. materialen Details der Musikinstrumente," p. 7) as well as the intellectual, professional, and civic identity of the instrument maker. Not every article covers all of that ground, and the general topics on which the specific articles center are three: (1) an analysis of the stylistic periods in the fifteenth to eighteenth centuries in Europe, specifically in Nuremberg (and also Leipzig, in Heyde's offering); (2) the contrast between folk music and art music and the instruments associated with them; and (3) the contrast between Asia (specifically Japan) and Europe.

These topics are presented in Krickeberg's introductory essay, one of the longest articles in the book. Here he shows how instruments during the time period in Europe were modified as they were adapted to the developing roles of art music. On the whole, as polyphony took control in Europe after the thirteenth century, the relation between musical ideas and instrumental sound was changing toward dominance by the musical idea. Instruments, Krickeberg proposes, were less influential on the development of music than musical development was on instruments. Sound became the servant of the clarity necessary to polyphony, intonation had to be stabilized, and tone in instruments used for art music developed toward softer, fuller, and darker timbres. While the shawms used

for folk music could be rather raucous, their descendants, the oboes, took on a softer, darker kind of sound.

Krickeberg states the distinction between folk music and art music in the European scene quite convincingly, but in the Asian context it is less helpful. Indeed, as Sumi Gunji describes Japanese instruments, it seems that the distinction simply does not apply to them. They are all traditional, and the crafts have not changed nearly as much as those of the European traditions. To their credit, the authors of the essays on Japanese instruments do not attempt to mold their presentations to the thematics of the European articles. This reviewer finds in the two sections a series of presentations that underline the differences between the cultures. European culture in the fifteenth to eighteenth centuries, however conservative it may have been, accepted the idea of change, and embodied it in the design and manufacture of instruments. Japanese culture has, it seems, adopted change mainly in importing cultural goods, especially from China, Korea, and the West. Once something was in place, however, it appears that little change occurred. The shakuhachi was derived from China, but once adopted it underwent very little design change until recently. And flutes modified to permit playing Western scales stand beside instruments still made in traditional ways to the traditional models.

I should close with a positive response. Though the thematics proposed in the book do not work out entirely well, the material presented is thoroughly fascinating, and the book will repay frequent visits to its various parts. It is, indeed, a "beautiful" book on "beautiful" subjects.

EDWIN M. GOOD
SMITHSONIAN INSTITUTION