

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XIX • 1993



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

Trevor Herbert, ed. *Bands: The Brass Band Movement in the 19th and 20th Centuries*. Popular Music in Britain. Buckingham: Open University Press; Bristol, PA: [distributed by] Taylor & Francis, 1991. xii, 224 pp.; 14 photographs, 2 facs., 7 tables, 1 map. ISBN: 0-335-09703-0; cloth. ISBN: 0-335-09702-2; pbk.

Here, finally, is a volume which assigns to brass bands their rightful place in nineteenth-century culture. It does so with crusading zeal. No longer will brass bands endure a "ghetto-like existence," declares the editor. Let them shed their "half-caste identity" and their role as "musical Uncle Toms," so that they can be recognized for what they were: important social and cultural ambassadors for more than a century. Is there a touch of defensiveness in all this? Definitely. But the authors, most of whom are brass players, revel in their role as cultural underdogs and scholarly proselytizers, and this enriches their book.

Three articles tracing the history of British bands form the heart of this collection, while a fourth considers whether the band contest movement was a branch of art or sport. All four pieces wrestle with the old caricature of British brass bands as being "northern, masculine, working-class, and hedonistic." The studies are particularly good on questions of sponsorship and professionalism and provide a much-needed typology that recognizes the diversity manifest in factory bands, church bands, and other purely amateur groups. In the end, the standard caricature is qualified on every point. Yet, curiously, the authors neither demolish it utterly nor replace it with any concise alternative. This is a task for the future.

Trevor Herbert's own essay on the nineteenth-century movement is particularly notable in that it begins to address the question of high versus popular culture. He notes the huge importance of operatic transcriptions in the bands' repertoire. It would have been useful to break down this category of composition further, for it might have revealed that the overwhelming majority of such arias came from Italian and French operas, rather than the solid German classics. If this is so, it would justify some rethinking of the conflict between high and popular culture so beloved by present-day neo-Marxists. Clearly, not all high culture was exclusively elite, and, conversely, not all popular music was the exclusive property of the working class.

Finally, this collection provides information which, by a process of analogy, strikingly elucidates the history of brass bands in America. In

Great Britain the instrumental roots were deeper, the technology of instruments more advanced, commercial patronage more generous, and country-wide networking more intense than in the United States. Duncan Bythell's chapter on Australia provides material for more such parallels and contrasts. None of the essays draw explicit comparisons, but they are grist for the mill of anyone wishing to do so.

The international dimension of the band movement warrants further careful study. Everywhere, from Sicily to Stockholm, from the Urals to the Rockies, bands of brass instruments brought both cultivated and naive music to the masses. This fine book invites researchers to dig deeper into a rich but often belittled legacy.

S. FREDERICK STARR
OBERLIN COLLEGE

Margaret J. Kartomi. *On Concepts and Classifications of Musical Instruments.* Chicago Studies in Ethnomusicology, ed. Philip V. Bohlman and Bruno Nettl. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990. xix, 329 pp.; 2 photographs, 67 illustrations. ISBN: 0-226-42548-7; cloth. ISBN: 0-226-42549-5; pbk.

Margaret J. Kartomi is professor and chairperson in the Department of Music at Monash University in Clayton, Victoria, Australia. She is a specialist in organology and the music of Southeast Asia. Her publications include a book on Indonesian musical instruments,¹ 214 definitions of Southeast Asian instruments in *The New Grove Dictionary of Musical Instruments*, and additional articles in journals and collections of writings. She is a member of the editorial board of the series which published her book, the Chicago Studies in Ethnomusicology.

In Professor Kartomi's words, "this book presents and explains how various of the world's cultures classify their musical instruments and instrumental ensembles, together with the concepts of instruments upon which the schemes are based." Kartomi examines several theories of classifications, discusses cognitive structures resulting from the process of classifying, and defines some of the terminology used in classifications. In some chapters the basic data were derived from case studies

1. Margaret J. Kartomi, *Musical Instruments of Indonesia* (Melbourne: Indonesian Arts Society, 1985).