

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XVII • 1991



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

Elizabeth Liddle's appendix on tuning offers a helpful discussion for students ready to venture into that thorny subject. Preliminary explanations of the harmonic series, commas, and various temperaments lay the groundwork for practical information on setting temperaments. Fret diagrams and a table of measurements in cents for quarter-comma, fifth-comma, and sixth-comma meantone and for Valotti's system add much to this synopsis.

I noted only a few omissions. In the second appendix, Early Music America ought to appear along with the Viola da Gamba Society of Great Britain and the Viola da Gamba Society of America Inc., and this *Journal* along with *Early Music* and *Early Music News*. Deborah Teplow's *Performance Practice and Technique in Marin Marais' Pièces de viole* (Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1986) and Jason Paras's *The Music for viola Bastarda* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1986) do not appear in the bibliography, and I wish that the fine live concern recording, *In memoriam Jason Paras* (Focus 821), were in the discography.

These few reservations aside, Crum and Jackson's book is a worthy contribution to the beginning and intermediate study of viol playing. Readers of this journal will be most interested in the discussions of performance practice.

M. ALEXANDRA EDDY
Sweet Briar College

Martin van Schaik. *De harp in de middeleeuwen: Studies naar de symboliek van een muziekinstrument.* Utrecht: [the author] 1988. 244 pp., 52 black-and-white illustrations. ISBN: 90-9002348-8, Softbound. 75 Dutch guilders.

Martin van Schaik's dissertation covering aspects of symbolism of the medieval harp is a very welcome addition to the literature. As he notes, a vast body of information about the early harp has been transmitted to us but there are comparatively few modern studies devoted to this instrument. A reason, in part, for both circumstances is that the harp was awarded religious symbolic meaning by a culture very remote to ours, resulting in a profusion of sources that were protected and hence survive and now must be interpreted. In this study, van Schaik successfully separates the real from the symbolic in a way that illuminates the mean-

ing of the symbol. In the future, a general statement about David's harp, such as, "David is often [depicted] tuning his harp, preparing for the performance to come,"¹ will no longer suffice when it associates a theme such as David's harp tuning with a specific symbolism backed by exegesis dating to the first century A.D. Van Shaik's work will be useful to medievalists, iconographers, theologians, organologists, church musicians, and historical harpists, to name a few. It deserves a wide readership, and the English translation, to be entitled *The Harp in the Middle Ages: The Symbolism of a Musical Instrument*, now in the final stages of preparation, will help.²

This book covers ground traversed many times before but uses a new vehicle (new at least for studies of the medieval harp) and travels farther along the chosen paths. Van Schaik bases his study on two pillars, music iconography and the study of medieval texts. He begins his study with the year 1000 A.D., when a positive connection can be demonstrated between the name "harp" and the object harp, so that he can correlate the two types of data, and ends in 1400. As befits a (partly) iconographical work, all fifty-two pictures are reproduced with outstanding clarity.

Van Schaik chooses what are, at first view, "a quintet of strongly divergent subjects" (p. 14), which are indeed linked by a common thread, King David, but his determination to establish this connection actually hampers the presentation of material. Each subject is treated in a study and presented as a chapter with numbered sections. The results are given invariably in the chapter's penultimate section, and the associations with David, which he calls the important conclusions, are given in the chapter's final section labeled "Conclusion." Van Shaik relies implicitly on the common thread of David to bind together his study. He includes a summation in German that condenses the chapter conclusions.

In the first study, "Name and Object," van Schaik ferrets out the use of the term "harp" from a great diversity of sources. (Tables listing the most important texts are included in chapter 3.) His tenacity in pinpointing exactly when the term was introduced into a version of a text during its transmission is impressive. In light of his comments (p. 11) about the wealth but "inaccessibility" of medieval texts, this chapter is one of the most beneficial. It is also the most grisly: two of the thirteen terms

1. Ann Griffiths, Joan Rimmer, and Sue Carole de Vale, "Harp," *NGDMI* 2:136.

2. Personal correspondence, 6 Sept. 1990.

glossed with "harp" are instruments of torture. Van Schaik mentions an association in German texts of the name "swallow" with the "English" harp but dismisses a suggestion of swallow symbolism as speculation (p. 33). The suggestion indeed does not provide a contemporary document supporting the claim. He notes (p. 9) that it was unusual for an existing instrument like the harp to be awarded Christian symbolic significance. It would be even more unusual for an indigenous instrument to be entirely devoid of pre-Christian symbolism. Given the abundance of zoomorphic symbolism, even bird symbolism, in traditional instruments,³ van Schaik should reevaluate the suggestion in light of an exciting possible instance of surviving but undocumented pre-Christian symbolism.

In the second study, "Harp and David," van Schaik ostensibly seeks whether a symbolic meaning can be allied with each of the three different iconographical appearances of the harp with David (being held, being tuned, being played); the result is "yes." In actuality, after dispensing with the first and third appearances, he thoroughly investigates the second theme, extending to a classification of ten tuning key shapes. David's harp playing has two meanings, first as composer of psalms and second as healer of Saul's soul, thus symbolizing the ordering of the microcosm (harmonizing of body and soul). The contexts that determine the meaning of David's harp playing are succinctly presented in the conclusion of chapter 4 (p. 112), although van Schaik directs the reader elsewhere. The meaning of David's harp tuning in the context of a psalter-wide mensural symbolism is provided in the section entitled "Excursus." Van Schaik briefly touches upon two aspects of power frequently articulated for non-Western instruments and worthy of further investigation, the "troubling" idea that the harp in the hands of David represents power (p. 38), and an exegetical claim that the supposed precursor to the harp has power because of its shape (p. 41).

The "delta harp," to use its modern name (medieval exegetes called it *cithara* and *psalterium*), identifies the instrument shaped like the capital Greek letter delta, often with misplaced and missing tuning pegs and

3. For examples of the tenacity of zoomorphic symbolism, see Theodore C. Grame and Gen'ichi Tsuge, "Steed Symbolism on Eurasian String Instruments," *The Musical Quarterly* 58:1 (1972): 57-66. Leopold Vorreiter, in "The Swan-neck Lyres of Minoan-Mycenean Culture," *Galpin Society Journal* 28 (1975): 93-97, discusses early examples of bird symbolism. For later examples, especially those associated with the *kithara* itself, see Martha Maas and Jane McIntosh Snyder, *Stringed Instruments of Ancient Greece* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1989).

often pictured with King David; a delta harp with twenty-four strings and three tuning pegs is depicted on the cover of the book. The third study, "The Delta Harp," demonstrates the efficacy of van Schaik's dual approach: he derives a satisfactory understanding of this instrument from a confusion of illustrations and a confusion of instrument names from the Old Testament, Septuagint and Vulgate Bibles, and a thousand years of exegetical writing, precisely the situation F. P. Pickering calls "well-nigh hopeless."⁴ The delta harp is invested with symbolism of shape, of number, and of position (soundbox pointing up or down), to some of which some exegetes claimed exclusive understanding. It is ironic that the central question of this study, did it really exist as a corporeal instrument, should be answered negatively after assembling so many examples of its symbolism.

The strictly iconographical and quantitative fourth study, "The Harp in the Psalm Initials," extracts the criteria evidently used by medieval illustrators to select psalm initials in which harps are pictured. (They are position of psalm in classification system, instruments mentioned in psalm text, and psalm exegesis and symbolic interpretations about David and the harp.) Van Schaik examines those ten psalms that begin the divisions of West European psalter classification. An outstanding feature of this study is the concise history provided for each aspect. Surprisingly, van Schaik does not actually provide the actual numbers resulting from this first quantitative study made a psalm initials; they can be derived from Appendix III:

No. harp illustrations: 242					No. psalters: 219					
Psalm:	1	80	97	38	26	51	52	68	101	109
No. pict.	192	26	8	5	3	3	2	1	1	1
p. 195: "preferred by illustrators"					harp usually absent <i>even</i> when					
most harps depicted here					David is central figure					

Particularly in light of his discussion in the excursus of the hidden mensural symbolism in Psalms 1, 80 and 97, his classification of Psalm 38 is confusing.

In "The Ass with the Harp," van Schaik examines another difficult subject. He traces the transmission of the image in texts, and catalogs the depictions of the harp-playing or harp-tuning ass. Despite reviewing facets

4. F. P. Pickering, *Literature and Art in the Middle Ages* (Coral Gables, Fla.: University of Miami Press, 1970): 285.

as particular as the direction of the portal on which the sculpture is placed (usually west), he was not able reconcile information from the two sources. He concludes that the saying possibly was mixed with the concept of the contrasting character of the ass, representing disbelief in Christ, and David, the prefiguration of Christ, producing pictures in which the ass handled the harp as David did.

This work is insightful, thorough, and unfortunately not easy to use. First, van Schaik does not provide an overall conclusion, and the reader wanting this must supply it. Ideally a conclusion would give a comprehensive chronology incorporating the David themes, the delta harp, and the ass and harp. Second, Van Schaik sometimes furnishes such abbreviated references that the reader must consult the source. In particular, a summary of the arguments pertaining to the identification of David by his harp, a very important assumption in this study, would have been very welcome. Third, the reader must be careful with van Schaik's claims of what others wrote. For example, contrary to his claim on p. 114, Helen Adolf also asserts that the ass represents the pagan mind, using this exact wording.⁵ Again, Genette Foster does discuss the different appearances of the harp, in a sentence beginning on the very page (p. 37) that van Schaik claims that she does not. Further, the citation for this sentence refers to another author whom van Schaik also claims did not discuss the topic.⁶ Fourth, his discussion of non-Western instruments does not receive the same quality of attention as other aspects. He provides no references for his discussion of *sistrum* (p. 28). Contrary to his statement on p. 64, scholars do not agree that the Latin term *cithara* (from the Greek *kithara*) is derived from the Hebrew term *kinnor*.⁷

Finally, Van Schaik appears to have misplaced two full paragraphs about the harp as an unplayed attribute, placing them at the end of section 2.2.1, "David Ordering the Microcosm," already one of the most difficult sections. These complaints should not deter one from examining this important and useful study.

LINDA SIMONSON
Bowie, Maryland

5. Helen Adolf, "The Ass and the Harp," *Speculum* 25 (1950): 52.

6. Genette Foster "The Iconology of Musical Instruments and Musical Performance in Thirteenth-Century French Manuscript Illuminations," (Ph.D. dissertation, City University of New York, 1977), 30-31.

7. Maas and Snyder (p. 54) identify the positions held by different scholars and conclude that *kithara* derives from a term in an as yet unidentified (and perhaps unidentifiable) West Asiatic language.