

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XVII • 1991



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

present book make it a worthy companion to the author's previous work in the organological field. The importance of Puttick and Simpson was strongly indicated in the 1981 book, and has now been copiously documented here. As is often the case with scholarship on this level, the earlier work was the impetus for the present one.

Coover's 1981 bibliography of musical instrument collection catalogs provided us the first comprehensive view of the vast and little-charted world of organological documentary literature. For those trying to reconstruct the fragmented history of musical instruments, this work is, quite simply, invaluable and irreplaceable. Now, with his latest essay, this author has given us a work of equal value, illuminating an even more rarefied but no less important literature. We have much to thank James Coover for in this unique contribution to the growing scholarly literature in our field.

MICHAEL C. FINKELMAN

Sam Houston State University, Huntsville, Texas

Malou Haine. *Musica: Les instruments de musique dans les collections belges / Musical Instruments in Belgian Collections / Muziek-instrumenten in Belgische versammlungen*. Liège: Pierre Mardaga, 1989. 214 pp.; 152 color photographs, 8 black-and-white photographs, 4 x-ray photographs. ISBN: 2-87009-409-4. 1,950 Belgian francs / 347 French francs.

Malou Haine teaches at the Free University of Brussels and the University of Liège, and is a consultant to the staff of the Musical Instrument Museum of Brussels. She is known in the United States primarily for three publications: her detailed study of Adolphe Sax (the topic of her dissertation);¹ an excellent catalog (edited with Ignace De Keyser) of the instruments by Charles Joseph Sax and Adolphe Sax in the Musical Instrument Museum of Brussels and in other public and private collections;² and a comprehensive dictionary of instrument makers (edited

1. Malou Haine, *Adolphe Sax (1814–1894): sa vie, son oeuvre et ses instruments de musique* (Brussels: Editions de l'Université de Bruxelles, 1980). See the review by Carolyn Bryant in this *Journal* 9 (1983): 132–35.

2. Malou Haine and Ignace de Keyser, *Catalogue des instruments Sax au Musée instrumental de Bruxelles; suivi de la liste de 400 instruments Sax conservés dans des collections publiques et privées* (Brussels: Musée instrumental, 1980).

with Nicolas Meeùs) in the Walloon area and Brussels.³ Haine's extensive scholarly work includes a detailed study of Parisian musical instrument makers during the industrial period of the nineteenth century;⁴ a catalog of musical instruments made in the Walloon area and Brussels in the Musical Instrument Museum of Brussels;⁵ the editorship of a study of instrument makers active in the Walloon area and Brussels in 1985;⁶ and (with Nicolas Meeùs) a catalog of musical instruments in Brussels and the Walloon area for an exhibition at the Musée de Mariement.⁷ Her latest offering is a lavishly illustrated 214-page catalog entitled *Musica: Musical instruments in Belgian collections*.

This attractively-designed volume is primarily a picture book of some stunningly beautiful European instruments of various types, found in nine Belgian museums. However, this volume is of great interest to specialists because the majority of the instruments photographed have seldom or never appeared in previous publications to my knowledge. Haine notes in the introduction that this book is meant for the general public; therefore, technical descriptions and measurements are omitted on purpose. One hundred fifty-two color photographs of 147 instruments are presented according to eleven easily-understood groupings rather than organological categories: clavichords, virginals, and harpsichords (pp. 28–53); organs (54–63); pianos (64–77); plucked stringed instruments (78–91); bowed strings (92–110); flutes and reed instruments (111–33); mouthpiece instruments (134–59); percussion (160–71); mechanical instruments (172–79); popular instruments (180–97); and curiosities (198–209). (The category called mouthpiece instruments is somewhat misleading since woodwinds also have mouthpieces; perhaps the term lip-vibrated should have been considered.)

The caption to each photograph includes the name of the instrument, name of the maker, the place and date of manufacture (Haine cautions

3. Malou Haine and Nicolas Meeùs, eds., *Dictionnaire des facteurs d'instruments de musique en Wallonie et à Bruxelles du 9^e siècle à nos jours*, (Liège: Pierre Mardaga, 1986). See the reviews by Barbara Owen in this *Journal* 14 (1988): 164–67, and by William Waterhouse in *Galpin Society Journal* 41 (1988): 120–22.

4. Malou Haine, *Les facteurs d'instruments de musique à Paris au 19^e siècle: des artisans face à l'industrialisation* (Brussels: Editions de l'Université de Bruxelles, 1985).

5. Malou Haine, *Instruments de musique en Wallonie et à Bruxelles au Musée instrumental de Bruxelles* (Liège: Pierre Mardaga, 1984).

6. Malou Haine, ed., *Les facteurs d'instruments de musique actifs en Wallonie et à Bruxelles en 1985* (Liège: Pierre Mardaga, 1986).

7. Malou Haine and Nicolas Meeùs, *Instruments de musique anciens à Bruxelles et en Wallonie, 17^e–20^e siècles* (Liège: Pierre Mardaga, 1986).

the reader to be prudent about accepting dates even when found on the instrument), the location, museum, and inventory number. Prominent characteristics of each instrument are occasionally described, along with some discussion of construction or decoration, and other details of past ownership or playing technique. In addition, there are thirty excellent color details of instruments, eight black-and-white details (piano nameboards, labels of a guitar and woodwinds), and four revealing x-ray photographs of a virginal, a guitar, a tenor lute, and a set of crumhorns.

The text of the eighteen-page introduction and the captions for photographs of instruments in *Musica* are written in three languages: French, English, and Dutch. The original French text was translated into English by Allen James and into Dutch by Ignace de Keyser. Haine states that the object of this book is to induce the public to visit museums in Belgium in order to see these beautiful instruments. The choice of the illustrations was determined by two considerations: the first is to illustrate instruments from museums other than those frequently visited in Brussels and Antwerp (Bruges, Ghent, Dehay-Imay, Liège, Mons, Namur, Tournai); the second is to present in an attractive manner a wide range of European classical and folk instruments made from the sixteenth to the nineteenth centuries. These objectives have surely been achieved in this book. Other topics adroitly discussed in the introduction include the problem of forgeries and composite instruments (e.g. Ruckers harpsichords, violins by Stradivari and Amati); the illegal export of hundreds of old Italian bowed stringed instruments by the violin maker Luigi Tarisio (1790–1854); finely made copies of string instruments by Jean-Baptiste Vuillaume; and outright forgeries by Leopoldo Franciolini. Haine also touches upon the modernization of harpsichords, violins, and guitars by many makers during the eighteenth century; the recent restoration of many instruments in museums; some of the earliest collections of instruments from the sixteenth century; and the beginning of modern instrument museums in the nineteenth century.

The color photographs are of uniform quality and of sufficient clarity to study very small details. Readers of this *Journal* will recognize some well-known instruments in the Brussels museum: a clavichord by Hieronymus Albrecht Hass of Hamburg, 1744 (pp. 30–31); a bass viol attributed to Gaspard Tieffenbrucker, ca. 1560, but dating in part from the seventeenth century (pp. 104–105); a set of four crumhorns, Germany or Italy, end of the sixteenth century (pp. 116–17); and a clarinet by Jacob Denner, Nuremberg, early eighteenth century (p. 128). We also

find a number of fascinating and little-known examples. The keyboard instruments include a virginal by Gabriel Townsend, London, 1641 (pp. 38–39), according to the text the oldest extant example of an English virginal; a traveling harpsichord by Jean Marius, Paris, 1709 (pp. 44–45);⁸ a “harpsichord-spinet” by Jan Joseph Coenen, Roermond, 1734 (pp. 46–47); a “Vis-a-Vis” piano by Pleyel, Wolff & C^{ie}, Paris, 1899 (pp. 72–73), made so that two pianists can be seated directly across from each other to play on one instrument; and a pyramid piano by Christian Ernst Frederici, Gera, 1745 (pp. 74–75), made with doors highly decorated in marquetry.

Other unusual or important instruments photographed are an early Neapolitan mandolin by Vincenzo Vinaccia, 1750 (p. 83); a highly decorated bass viol by Joachim Tielke, Hamburg, 1701 (pp. 106–07), formerly owned by Adrien-François Servais; a set of four bajoncillos or early bassoons (pp. 124–25), two by Rodriguez Melchor, Madrid, second half of the seventeenth century; a chandelier made of twelve serpents and a Turkish crescent, Belgium, nineteenth century (p. 135); a musical box called a double comet, after 1885 (pp. 174–75), which plays two discs at once; a set of bells arranged on a frame for Janissary music called “Lochky” (spoons), Russia, nineteenth century (pp. 194–95); and a finger-exercise machine called a “chryo-gymnaste” by Casimir Martin, Paris, 1841 (pp. 208–209).

Unfortunately, the book lacks a list of photographs and an index to the instruments, both of which would have increased its utility a great deal. Only one photograph of three cornetts, Germany or Italy, sixteenth or seventeenth century, treble, alto, and tenor, is too small to see the instruments in sufficient detail (p. 134). The English translation is quite good throughout although occasionally sometimes too literal. For instance, on page 14 in a description of the detail of the “Plan de Paris” on the back of a bass viol attributed to Gaspard Tieffenbrucker, the phrase “it cannot be excluded that this marquetry was ‘fabricated’ in the 19th century . . .” would have been more clearly stated as “it is possible that this marquetry was ‘fabricated’ in the 19th century . . .” On page 123 there is a description of a Boehm-system oboe by Adolphe Sax the Younger, Paris, ca. 1910. Instead of referring to the mechanism as the “Boehm ring flute,” the more common English term is “Boehm flute” or,

8. See Laurence Libin’s informative article on these types of instruments entitled “Folding harpsichords,” *Early Music* 15 (1987): 378–83.

following the French text, "Boehm's flute with moveable rings" ("flûte à anneaux mobiles de Boehm"). One date in the English translation on page 185 should be 1829 instead of 1929, and on page 192 the first sentence should read: "A tambourine whose hoop has slits in which are small bells and small rings (not cymbals) of brass."

I found that some captions could have been clarified by a fuller explanation; for instance, how did the keyboard function in the transposing harpsichord by Andreas Ruckers, Antwerp, 1640 (pp. 40–44); and what is the pitch or dimensions of the basset clarinet by Johann Ziegler, ca. 1820 (p. 130)?⁹ The caption (p. 68) concerning an interesting square piano marked "Johannes Riburius Meirherz, Paris, 1780" states that this is the only example of his work. However, its place of origin might have been questioned, since it is known that some eighteenth-century makers sometimes signed their instruments as being made in Paris in order to ensure their sale.¹⁰ Under her description of walking-stick flutes, Haine should have mentioned that along with clarinets and violins, oboes, horns, and trumpets were made from the early sixteenth century in this form.¹¹ Three more substantial errors in the text must be noted. The Anonymous French "Cistre," ca. 1790 (p. 89) should not be called an "English Guitar" because it is different in many constructional features from the English instrument.¹² It would be more accurate to retain the name "Cistre" or perhaps "French Cittern." A photograph of three flutes made in Paris (pp. 114–15) includes instruments by Naust, 1750, Remi Genin, early nineteenth century, and I. Scherer, 1750. Yet Phillip T. Young's important article in the *Galpin Society Journal* of 1986, "The Scherers of Butzbach," established the identity of Johannes Scherer, Jr. and George Henrich Scherer; their place of manufacture in Butzbach, Germany; and the fact that only two bassoons are signed "I Scherer".¹³ An editorial lapse must have caused the caption to the photo of an oboe

9. At least one clarinet specialist, Nicholas Shackleton, believes that this instrument is a basset horn rather than the much rarer basset clarinet.

10. This observation was made to the reviewer by Michael Latcham, curator of the Gemeentemuseum in The Hague.

11. See Hermann Moeck, "Spazierstockinstrumente: Eine kurze Vorstudie zu folgendem Aufsatz," in *Studia instrumentorum musicae popularis III* (Stockholm: Musikhistoriska museets skrift, 1974), 149–51, 279; and Catherine Dike, *Cane Curiosa: From Gun to Gadget* (Geneva, 1983).

12. This fact was brought to my attention by James Tyler.

13. *Galpin Society Journal* 39 (1986): 112–24; see also Phillip T. Young, *Twenty-Five Hundred Historical Woodwind Instruments* (New York: Pendragon Press, 1982).

by Jean-Hyacinthe Rottenburgh, Brussels, ca. 1750 (p. 122), to state that this instrument was made rather than "invented" by Jean Hotteterre.¹⁴

Apart from these few comments, this is a book well worth having both for the music lover and the organologist. It will create a desire by the public to see these exceptional instruments in Belgium. For those who wish more information on specific instruments, one can consult catalogues or write directly to the museum where the instrument is preserved.

ALBERT R. RICE

The Fiske Museum of The Claremont Colleges

14. For an important study of the Rottenburgh family of instrument makers, see Stefaan Ottenbourgs, "Die Familie Rottenburgh. Eine der zahlreichen musikalischen Dynastien aus dem barocken Brüssel," *Tibia* 14 (1989): 477–89, 557–67; German translation by Reinhold Quandt of "De Familie Rottenburg. Een van de talrijke muzikale dynastien uit het barokke Brussel," *Musica Antiqua, een uitgave van Het Vlaams Centrum voor Oude Muziek* (1988), pt. 4; (1989), pt. 1.

Kunitachi College of Music Research Institute, Division of Musical Instruments. *The Collection of Musical Instruments*, ed. Sumi Gunji, Kazue Nakamizo, Miki Ito, and Mayumi Okada. Tokyo: Kunitachi College of Music Research Institute, 1986. 319 pp.; 101 color photographs, 963 black-and-white photographs, 18 x-ray photographs. No price given.

Reference books for non-European instruments are rare. The first notable such monograph, Victor-Charles Mahillion's. *Catalogue descriptif et analytique du Musée instrumental du Conservatoire royal de musique de Bruxelles*, 2nd ed., 5 vols. (Gand: A. Hoste, 1893–1922), is not readily accessible, and does not contain adequate artwork for all instruments.

The Collection of Musical Instruments, is currently the most complete pictorial dictionary of non-western instruments organized as a catalog of this museum's collection. Four points are of interest in this review.

First, of the approximately 500 depicted instruments, all the photographs are clear, contain a measurement gauge, are accompanied by very legible catalog information in English, and are printed on high-quality pages that are strongly bound into a durable book. The catalog information is organized thusly: registered number (presumably museum accession number), system number (see below), instrument name,