

*Journal of the  
American Musical  
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XVI • 1990



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).  
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair  
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).  
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

**David M. Guion.** *The Trombone: Its History and Music, 1697–1811*. Musicology Series, ed. F. Joseph Smith, vol. 6. New York: Gordon and Breach, 1988. xvii, 333 pp.; 20 black-and-white plates, 52 musical examples. ISBN: 2-88124-211-1. \$65.00.

This study of the eighteenth-century trombone, based on the author's doctoral work at the University of Iowa, is a lengthy book, organized in eight chapters. The book emphasizes descriptions of the instrument appearing in published sources from 1697 to 1811 and several musical works which include the trombone during this period. A short introduction discusses the instrument; its four playing positions and the eventual adoption of seven positions during the early nineteenth century; and an overview of the trombone's use in churches, courts, civic ceremonies, and instrumental ensembles throughout the late seventeenth and early nineteenth centuries. This is followed by a long chapter citing information about the trombone with English translations from twenty-six historical sources beginning with Daniel Speer's *Grundrichtiger Kurtz- leicht- und nöthiger Unterricht der musikalischen Kunst* (Ulm: Kühnen, 1687) and ending with Joseph Fröhlich's *Vollständige theoretisch-practische Musikschule für alle bey dem orchester gebräuchliche wichtigere Instrumente*, 4 vols. (Bonn: Simrock, 1810–1811).

Chapter three provides information about the musical use of the trombone in America, Austria and Bohemia, England, Germany, Italy, Russia, and Sweden. Chapter four is devoted to a detailed study of the use of the trombone in France before and after the Revolution. Chapter five discusses the use of the trombone in six representative choral works, and chapter six provides information about the same number of operas. Chapter seven discusses six symphonic works and chapter eight provides a brief discussion of the trombone in military music. There are two appendices: the first lists all of the sources given by Zedler in an article on the trombone in his *Grosses vollständiges Universal-Lexicon* (Leipzig: Zedler, 1732–1750); the second gives the musical examples found in Fröhlich's *Vollständige theoretisch-practische Musikschule* (1810–11). A bibliography, general index, and index of music with trombone parts conclude the volume.

Guion has provided the reader with a great deal of information not found in the standard books concerning the trombone by Gregory (1973), Bate (1978) and Baines (1978).<sup>1</sup> His book expounds our knowledge of

1. Robin Gregory. *The Trombone: The Instrument and Its Music* (London: Faber and Faber, 1973). Philip Bate. *The Trumpet and Trombone: An Outline of Their History, Development, and Construction*, 2nd ed. (London: Benn; New York: Norton, 1978). Anthony Baines. *Brass Instruments: Their History and Development* (New York: Scribner, 1978).

eighteenth-century trombone music begun in a detailed study of the Viennese literature by Wigness (1978)<sup>2</sup> and complements Lane's study of the trombone in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance (1982).<sup>3</sup> Guion's most important contributions are his citation and translation of several historical sources and discussion of published musical sources, the majority of which were published in France. His distinction between a Viennese and French manner of writing for the trombone is supported by several musical examples. Guion's study has proven, contrary to previous opinions, that there was an enormous amount of music written for the trombone during the eighteenth century.

I am disappointed in some aspects of this book. The editing could have been more carefully done; besides several misspellings and confusing sentences, the writing style is not on a consistently high level for a scholarly study. In a few cases, a fuller explanation would have clarified the meaning of several terms for those non-trombonists who will read and study this book. For example, a chart showing the seven modern positions (based on chromatic pitches from B $\flat$ ) and the four positions (based on diatonic pitches from A) given by Speer and others would have clarified Guion's discussion of slide positions. Concerning the question of pitch, Guion concludes (on the basis of descriptions by Praetorius, Virgiliano, and Speer) that the tenor instrument of the renaissance was in A, the alto in d and the bass in D (p. 2). However, he virtually ignores the suggestion that the tenor instrument could have been in B-flat or A based on the study of several extant examples by Henry George Fischer in *The Renaissance Sackbut and Its Use Today* (1984).<sup>4</sup>

Guion suggests that the change in pitch level of the earlier trombones from A to B-flat occurred during the eighteenth century in France, where instruments made in low pitch were played. Here, composers such as Gossec required low E-flats in their works which could be played, if the local pitch was low enough, by pulling the slide all the way to the first position (Guion, 120–1). This suggestion is quite logical; however, the pitch level in France was not standardized during the eighteenth century. I have found evidence in a late eighteenth-century German treatise published in Basle that the pitch used for brass instruments in France was sometimes higher

2. Robert C. Wigness. *The Soloistic Use of the Trombone in Eighteenth-Century Vienna* (Nashville, Tenn.: Brass Press, 1978).

3. George B. Lane. *The Trombone in the Middle Ages and The Renaissance* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1982).

4. See the review by Herbert W. Myers in the *Journal* 12 (1986): 170–73.

than that in use in Germany. The *Vollständige theoretische und praktische Geschichte der Erfindungen*<sup>5</sup> includes a chapter concerning brass ("Messing") where a section entitled "Trompetenmacher, oder Instrumentenmacher" includes a few sentences about the trombone (with no new material), and an interesting discussion of the pitch of trumpets made in different countries:

The trumpet consists of several types, such as the German or ordinary trumpet, the French, a tone higher, the English, a third higher than the ordinary trumpet, and twisted trumpets such as the Italians', which are round about and also similar to the trombone.<sup>6</sup>

Guion's plates illustrating trombones and their players would be more useful to the reader if the source of each plate were fully identified and dated. Plate 1, described as "a seventeenth-century wind band from the low countries," is identified by Victor-Charles Mahillon in his catalogue of the Brussels musical instrument collection<sup>7</sup> as a "tableaux" entitled, "la procession des Pucelles du Sablon" by Antoine Sallert in the Royal Museum of Painting of Brussels. An identical group of six musicians in an engraving (dated 1616) of a "shawm band of Brussels" by Dennis van Alsoot after Sallaert is reproduced by G. B. Lane (1982, p. 111). This type of information would greatly enhance the usefulness of Guion's book. Furthermore, most of these illustrations are not described or integrated into the text.

Personally, I believe photographs of eighteenth-century trombones and an analysis of their differences in construction would have contributed much to this study. If the thin walls, small bore, and loose stays of renaissance instruments have a definite effect on tone quality, as Fischer believes, then a great deal can be learned from a detailed study of the extant eighteenth-century instruments.

In chapter two, Guion emphasizes twenty-six theoretical writings concerning the trombone, citing the original texts with an English translation when necessary. Here, there are a few small errors which one hopes will be corrected in a second edition. The last names of two often quoted authors are incorrectly cited: Bonanni should be Buonanni and Verschure-

5. Edited by J. H. von Oroll in four volumes (Basle: J. J. Flick, 1789-95).

6. Ibid. I, 217. "Die Trompeten sind von verschieden Art, als, teutsche, ordinaire Trompeten, ferner, französische, die einem Ton höher sind, die englische, die die ordinären Trompeten eine ganze Tertie in her Höhe übertrifft, weiter gewundene Trompeten, wie die italiänischen sind, welche etlichemal rund herum gewunden sind, dahin gehören auch die Posaunen."

7. Victor-Charles Mahillon. *Catalogue descriptif et analytique du Musée instrumental du Conservatoire royal de musique de Bruxelles*, 5 vols. (Ghent: Hoste, 1893-1922), II, 24-26.

Reynvaan should be Reynvaan.<sup>8</sup> The earliest dictionaries of musical terms in the Dutch language are not those by Reynvaan (1798, 1795), but the anonymous *Verhandeling over de muziek . . .* (The Hague, 1772) [I have not been able to check this dictionary for an article concerning the trombone]. The author of the short article "Sacquebute" in the *Encyclopédie, ou Dictionnaire raisonné* (1765) was not Jean-Jacques Rousseau, whose initial is given as "S" or "s" at the end of his articles; it was written by the most prolific contributor to the *Encyclopédie*, Louis Chevalier de Jaucourt (1704–1780), whose initial is given as "D.J."<sup>9</sup>

Guion cites information about the trombone from the second edition of J. G. Albrechtsberger's treatise published in 1821. This information is identical to that in Albrechtsberger's *Gründliche Anweisung zur Composition* published in 1790 (428, 439–40). According to C. F. Whistlings' *Handbuch der Musikalische Litteratur* (Leipzig: Hofmeister, 1817), eleven sections concerning instruments and the "Singschule" from Joseph Fröhlich's important *Vollständige theoretisch-practische Musikschule* (1810–11) were published as individual methods by Simrock between 1811 and 1817. It is possible that a copy of the "Posaunenschule" will be uncovered in a library.

Prior to Fröhlich's treatise, there is another German treatise which provides some additional information concerning the trombone: Johann Joseph Klein, *Lehrbuch der theoretischen Musick* (Offenbach: J. André, 1800). The chapter on the trombone (99–104) provides the ranges for four instruments: discant or alto as g to a"; tenor as E to a'; quint as C to e'; and quart as C to d'. These ranges are similar to those given by Speer and Albrechtsberger (1790), although the lower note for the alto exceeds the latter's range. Klein (104) states that there are three main slide positions: 1) entirely out (*ganz hinaus*) where the instrument is at its greatest length and gives its lowest progression; 2) entirely in (*ganz hinein*), next to the mouthpiece where the highest progression is made; and 3) in the middle. To

8. The spelling of Bonanni on the title page of his *Gabinetto Armonico* (Rome, 1722) is incorrect; see P. Omodeo, "Buonanni, Filippo," *Dizionario biografico degli Italiani* (Rome: Istituto della Enciclopedia Italiana), vol. 15 (1972), 142–4. Reynvaan occasionally included a hyphen after his middle name on the title pages of some of books; see Jan Willem Enschedé, "Reynvaan, (Mr. Joos Verschuere)," *Nieuw Nederlandsch Biografisch Woordenboek*, eds. P. C. Molhuysen and P. J. Blok (Leiden: A. W. Sythoff), vol. 1 (1911), 1435–37.

9. It has been calculated that Jaucourt wrote 28 percent of the total number of articles and 24 percent of the text contained in the original seventeen volumes of the *Encyclopédie*. See John Lough, *The Encyclopédie* (New York: D. McKay, 1971), 44–6; R. N. Schwab and W. E. Rex, "Inventory of Diderot's *Encyclopédie*," *Studies on Voltaire and the Eighteenth Century*, vol. 91 (1972), 926, no. 2894, 1092, 3440; vol. 93 (1972), 155, no. 2894, 180, no. 3440; Frank A. Kafker and Serena L. Kafker, "The Encyclopedists as individuals: a biographical dictionary of the authors of the *Encyclopédie*," *Studies on Voltaire and the Eighteenth Century*, vol. 257 (1988), 175–180.

these he adds that there are two additional slide positions or extensions to these positions, which are not entirely in or out.

Klein gives the notes available in each position for the four trombones, omitting the fundamental or pedal notes. Discant or alto trombone: first position (entirely in): a, d', f#, a', c'', d'', e'', f'', g'', a''; with extension (not entirely in): g#, c#, f', g#, b', c#, d#, f'', g#; second position (in the middle): g, c', e', g', b#; with extension (not entirely out): b, d#; third position (entirely out): b<sup>b</sup>. Tenor trombone: first position: A, e, a, c#, e', a'; with extension: d#, g#, c', d#, g#; second position: G, d, g, b, d', g'; with extension: F, c, f#, b, f#; third position: E, B, f, f'. Quart trombone: first position: E, B, e, b; with extension: D#, B<sup>b</sup>, d#, b#; second position: D, A, d, a, d'; with extension: C#, G#, c#, f, f#, g#, c#; third position: C, F, F#, G, c, g, c'. Quint trombone: first position: D, F#, A, d, f#, a, d'; with extension: C#, F, G#, c#, f, g#, c#; second position: C, E, G, c, e, g, c', e'; with extension: D#, B, d#, b, d#; third position: B<sup>b</sup>, b<sup>b</sup>. Klein's positions for the discant or alto and tenor instruments roughly correspond to those given by Fröhlich, starting with Fröhlich's second position. The pitch levels of these instruments are also A and D, rather than Fröhlich's B-flat and E-flat.

Although not cited, Guion's discussion of the music written for the trombone in Czechoslovakia during the eighteenth century (142–3) is supported by the tri-lingual dictionary (Latin, German, Czech) by Jan Karel Rohn, entitled *Nomenclator, Artifex et Mechanicus* (Prague, 1768).<sup>10</sup> Rohn (362) describes five trombones (as found in Praetorius): discant, alto, tenor, quart or quint, and bass. Finally, Guion (234, 239) incorrectly lists the instrumentation of Gluck's *Orfeo ed Euridice* in the Viennese (1762) and Paris editions (1774). In the first edition, chalumeaux were specified rather than clarinets, and, according to Ludwig Finscher, the cornetto and chalumeaux of the Viennese production were replaced by clarinets and oboes in Paris.<sup>11</sup>

These comments should be kept in context; players, teachers, early music directors, and scholars will be pleased to have Guion's study on the eighteenth-century trombone. We are grateful for his thorough work in investigating numerous written and musical sources. This book represents a foray into an area of musical knowledge that has been unjustly neglected.

ALBERT R. RICE, Kenneth G. Fiske Museum

10. For a brief description of this little-known treatise, see the reviewer's article entitled, "Clarinet Fingering Charts, 1732–1816" in *Galpin Society Journal* 37 (1984): 38 note 9; and *Knihopis Českých A Slovenských Tisku od doby Nejstarší až do Konce XVIII. Století*, ed. F. Horák (Prague: Nakladatelství Českoslovenké Akademie Věd, 1961), 436–9.

11. See Christoph Willibald Gluck, *Orphée et Euridice*, ed. L. Finscher (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1967), XXII; Colin Lawson, *The Chalumeau in Eighteenth Century Music* (Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1981), 58.