

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XVI • 1990



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

cial values and their effects on the purchase of pianos for domestic use. Later chapters contain tiresome examination of the various agencies and organizations that were involved in reviving the piano business. Although consideration of such elements is, of course, critical to an understanding of the book's subject, the degree of digression into this material intrudes upon the flow of events.

Among readers interested in musical instruments, it is doubtful that many would seek out, for casual reading, a book about the business history of the piano. In the long run, the book's value will most likely be as a fine reference work, from which scholars may draw supporting material for studies dealing more directly with the piano. In 1911, Alfred Dolge, in his *Pianos and their Makers* (Covina, Calif.: Covina Publishing Company, 1911), committed to print what he, as an insider to the trade, knew about the piano industry. Eighty years from now I suspect we will also be grateful to Mr. Roell for having documented a slightly later epoch of this subject.

DARCY KURONEN, Museum of Fine Arts, Boston

Don L. Smithers. *The Music and History of the Baroque Trumpet before 1721*. 2nd ed. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 1988. 352 pp.; 21 black-and-white plates, 17 musical examples, 2 tables. Hard-bound. ISBN: 0-8093-1497-5. \$50.00.

Smithers's *The Music and History of the Baroque Trumpet before 1721* began as a doctoral dissertation at Oxford University and was published in its first edition by Syracuse University Press in 1973. While the book received considerable attention by trumpeters, its limited printing, an unfortunate review in the *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, and other circumstances of poor marketing prevented it from access to a wider musical audience. The first edition set a high standard for trumpet research and planted the seeds of the renaissance in natural trumpet performance.

Despite the newly-found professionalism of the historically-informed performance practice movement, the natural trumpet remains a problematic instrument. It may be the last major historical instrument to be mastered and brought to a high professional standard. Many performers and teachers have suffered from negative critiques in the press for their "work-in-progress" performances on uncompromised baroque trumpets. Some of the thickest skinned performers have given up the instrument because of the economic implications and negative status that these reviews had on their careers. The 1960s and 1970s-vintage compromised reproduction in-

struments (which were made easier to play by the addition of holes and redoubled tubing) now lie dormant in college collegium storage rooms. The quest for impressive professional performances that are as “note perfect” as those on modern instruments, the current economic necessity for limited rehearsal time, and the new commercial nature of the early music movement have led to the demise of the baroque trumpet revival in ways that parallel the instrument’s original decline in the late classic period. In short, the majority of the players who are in demand as recording artists on the baroque trumpet play instruments that are neither originals nor true modern reproductions.¹ To say that this situation annoys Smithers would be an understatement in the extreme.

In his preface to the second edition, Smithers gives an impassioned plea for authentic performance practice. We have heard the argument before, but Smithers gives it special eloquence. “With the publication of the second edition of this study, therefore, it is devoutly to be wished that the message is now loud and clear: neoclassicism and the revival of historically viable principles can know no compromises of truth. History is not the lie commonly agreed upon.”²

The second edition has the look of the original with the same type fonts, pagination, and paper quality. The number of plates has increased from the original eleven to twenty-one, and they are placed in a more logical sequence than in the first edition, where they were bound together in a clump. Rather than resetting the entire text, a thirty-page addenda was placed at the end with the “<<ADD>>” indication placed in the appropriate portion of the original text. Apparently, this system was the best method for getting the second edition out while the author was also preparing his forthcoming treatise on the classic trumpet which will deal with events from 1721 (the date of Bach’s *Brandenburg Concertos*) forward to the music of Beethoven.³ For those who are familiar with the first edition, the ad-

1. There are a few happy exceptions: Crispian Steele-Perkins performs on a William Bull trumpet from the Museum of London on his album, *Shore’s Trumpet* (EMI Compact disc, CDC 7 47664 2); Smithers plays without holes on an instrument made by the modern firm of Meinel und Lauber. A sample of his natural trumpet playing can also be heard on *The Virtuoso Trumpet* (Philips, 6500 304), *Bach’s Trumpet* (Philips, 6500 925), and *The Trumpet Shall Sound* (Philips 6500 926). A two-record set, *Two Centuries of Trumpet* (Philips 6760 056), was Smithers’s last project for Philips and has some examples of trumpet ensemble music.

2. Don Smithers. *The Music and History of the Baroque Trumpet before 1721*, 2nd ed. (Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 1988), 12.

3. Ibid., 324. The complete title of the new work is given by Smithers as *Treatise on the music, history, manufacture and the use of THE CLASSIC TRUMPET*. No publisher or specific release date is given.

denda system provides an instantly helpful update, but first-time readers may not appreciate the flipping back and forth from the main text to the addenda. The bibliography needed updating, but it did not happen. Important works by Detlev Altenburg, Herbert Heyde, Edward Tarr, Henry Meredith and others which have been published since 1973 are still absent.⁴ A number of them are mentioned in the addenda, but complete information in bibliographic format would have been useful. This is particularly unfortunate because the first edition generated and provided a basis for much of the important research that has been done in baroque trumpet over the past sixteen years.

Smithers's book remains the best source on the baroque trumpet and its music in English. The book introduces and defines the baroque trumpet and then treats its use by region or country. There is a very good chapter on the guilds in northern Europe. A sixty-one-page appendix cites the

4. Detlev Altenburg, *Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der Trompete im Zeitalter der Clarinblastkunst (1500–1800)*, 3 vols. (Regensburg: Gustav Bosse, 1973). Herbert Heyde, "Trompete und Trompetenblasen im europäischen Mittelalter," (Ph.D. diss., Karl-Marx-Universität Leipzig, 1965). Also important are Heyde's catalogs of brass instruments in the Musikinstrumenten-Museum der Karl-Marx-Universität, most notably, *Trompeten, Posaunen, Tuben*. (Leipzig: Deutscher Verlag für Musik, 1980) and other recent articles. The two above items complement Smithers's work. Smithers was not aware of either Heyde's dissertation or Detlev Altenburg's work when he was drafting his first edition, but acknowledges their importance in his addenda. Henry M. Meredith Jr., "Girolamo Fantini's Method: A Practical Edition" 2 vols. (D.A. diss., University of Colorado, 1984). Smithers was well aware of this work but does not mention it in the addenda. He provided some important information to Meredith regarding pasted over sections in original copies of Fantini's *Modo*, which were not obvious on microfilms or the modern reprint. In his dissertation, Meredith questions Smithers's conclusions about the coiled trumpet, and it would have been interesting to hear Smithers respond. While claiming not to cover the method material, Smithers did devote considerable space to a discussion of Fantini, particularly in the Italian chapter, where he included a translation of the preface from the method. Edward Tarr's translations of Johann Ernst Altenburg's *Versuch einer Anleitung zur heroisch-musikalischen Trompeter- und Pauker-Kunst als Trumpeters' and Kettledrummers' Art (1795)* (Nashville, Tenn.: Brass Press, 1974), and Fantini's *Modo per imparare a sonare di tromba* (Frankfurt/Main: D. Wastch, 1685, facs. ed., Milan: Bollentino bibliographico musicale, 1934) published as Girolamo Fantini, *Method for Learning to Play the Trumpet in a Warlike Way*, facs. ed., English translation and critical commentary by Edward H. Tarr, (Nashville: Brass Press, 1978), are both important baroque trumpet sources which escaped mention in the addenda. Tarr contributed some sixty-eight articles relating to trumpet in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 20 vols., ed. Stanley Sadie (London: Macmillan, 1980) (including the article on Smithers!), which greatly expanded the coverage of the baroque trumpet. Smithers only mentions *The New Grove* in relation to his own articles on Pavel Joseph Vejvanovský and the Shore family.

sources for the music indexed by composer. Smithers seized the opportunity of the second edition to reply to the critics of his first edition, particularly to the specific *JAMS* review cited above. For the most part, the limitations of the second edition are the same as the delimitations that Smithers set for himself in the first edition. For example, there is no discussion of playing technique, or the method book material from the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries (although there is considerable space given to complaints about recent performances on bogus instruments). The inventory of musical sources is representative and impressive, but (as Smithers is the first to point out) incomplete. Modern performing editions of the literature are not included. There are important collections which contain significant parts for trumpet which were also beyond the scope of the original study. There is no discography, nor would a comprehensive one be possible with the current explosion of reissues and cut-outs in the record industry. More comprehensive treatment of these and other important material is promised in the author's forthcoming book on the classic trumpet. Judging from Jeffrey Nussbaum's interview with Smithers in a recent issue of the *International Trumpet Guild Journal*, the new book will be a monster project that will arouse at least as much debate and controversy as his first book.⁵

We need people like Don Smithers to stir the pot and to make us question what appears to be the norm. Not every trumpeter will agree with everything Smithers has to say about the natural trumpet. *The Music and History of the Baroque Trumpet before 1721*, however, remains essential reading for any trumpeter who performs this literature and for the conductors, contractors, record producers, and concert presenters who want to do more than pretend that they know what they are doing when they make music with baroque trumpets. The second edition is a welcome opportunity to have this valuable work available again.

RALPH DUDGEON, State University College at Cortland, N.Y.

5. Jeffrey Nussbaum, "An Interview with Don L. Smithers," *International Trumpet Guild Journal*, 13: 2 (December 1988) 11–20, 30. In this interview, Smithers outlines the structure of the new book on the classic trumpet, reviews his playing career, comments on important collections of trumpet literature, and makes an appraisal of the work yet to be done in the research of the baroque trumpet.