

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME XV • 1989



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

decide to bring out an edition or editions in other languages, many readers will be dismayed at having to buy an expensive book all over again in order to become more closely involved with its massive text.

The photographs reproduced are not all of equal quality, although many are very good and some are excellent. But a number of them are too dark; the purple of some violins cannot even be seen, for example. Others are not in focus, while still others have highlighting problems. Although control of significant factors such as these is now within the competence of the most serious writers and publishers, it would be unfair not to point out that many photos must have been supplied by third parties, and that the quality of these could not be readily controlled.

Despite the criticisms noted, this is a grand effort worthy of high praise, and a most distinguished addition to the literature.

LAURENCE C. WITTEN II, Fairfield, Connecticut

Laurence Dana Dreyfus. *Bach's Continuo Group: Players and Practices in His Vocal Works*. Studies in the History of Music, ed. Lewis Lockwood and Christoph Wolff, 3. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1987. xii, 264 pp.; 28 facsimiles, 14 tables, 20 musical examples, 2 black-and-white illustrations. ISBN: 0-674-06020-2 \$35.00.

The concept of basso continuo seems a simple and known quantity: its foundational role in eighteenth-century music is taken for granted, and its practice is frequently thought to be obvious. Yet so many decisions go into realizing a basso continuo that players will be grateful for this fundamental study in which Laurence Dreyfus examines a myriad of clues and sheds a great deal of light on J. S. Bach's continuo practices.

To organize his study, Dreyfus asks four questions: which keyboard instrument accompanied Bach's sacred vocal works; how continuo players executed the bass parts in recitatives; when Bach used doubling bass instruments such as the bassoon, cello, and violone; and whether instruments such as the viola da gamba, the lute, or the violoncello piccolo ever played continuo. A chapter is devoted to each question and its implications.

There is much controversy today regarding Bach's choice of continuo instrument for his sacred vocal music. Many assume that the organ is automatically the instrument of choice, but Dreyfus believes that this view overlooks a considerable quantity of documentary and notational evidence, and he marshalls his evidence to form a new theory of "dual accompaniment." His belief is that while the organ is indeed basic to

Bach's sacred vocal music, the harpsichord played "a substantial role" and must not be neglected via an "either/or" resolution of the problem. The two might even have been used simultaneously on occasion.

It is fascinating to follow Dreyfus as he examines his sources. He carefully summarizes Bach scholarship on each topic and shows how we have arrived at our current beliefs. He examines documents from Bach's time, often supplying new translations to clarify a point. And he takes us to Bach's workshop and endeavors to examine Bach's pattern of thought. Dreyfus finds that "on the one hand [in Bach's working manuscripts], there are indications of extreme care in Bach's preparations of his parts even for occasional works. On the other hand, there are certain omissions of whole measures of music which Bach never saw fit to supply and which must have wreaked havoc at each subsequent performance. The parts tell a human story" (p. 9).

A particularly enlightening part of the discussion relates to the dual continuo parts, frequently found in Bach's hand or in that of a trusted copier. For Cantata 40, for example, one continuo part is in *Cammerton* (chamber pitch, suitable for the harpsichord) and a second is transposed to *Chorton* (choir pitch, suitable for organ). This provides a springboard for a lengthy discussion of all the underlying implications of the two tunings. The difference in the figuration of the two parts also has interesting implications.

Dreyfus provides valuable insight on how to accompany recitatives in discussing "the discrepancy between notation and execution" (the shortening of notes in secco recitatives). As in other chapters he summarizes a great deal of contemporary thought, and finds many clues in Bach's manuscripts on which to build his case, ultimately forming some striking and practical conclusions relating to the appropriate performance of these problematic areas in Bach's music.

A complete chapter is devoted to the bassoon and its role in the continuo group. Dreyfus first recognizes and describes the long history of the bassoon as a "colla parte" instrument in sacred choral music ("an instrument to be tolerated, a crude if sometimes necessary adjunct to the bass contingent," p. 108), and then reconciles this with the new "galant" style of bassoon playing (in which it becomes "an elegant, even aristocratic companion to the pair of orchestral oboes," p. 108), concluding that the bassoon played an adjunct role in Bach's continuo realization.

Dreyfus' final chapter is devoted to the various stringed instruments in the continuo group. An important question posed is, exactly what *was*

Bach's violone? Dreyfus concludes that Bach used three different models, depending upon the availability of the instruments and the style of the music. He comes to the striking conclusion that the violone played sometimes at pitch, and sometimes an octave below.

The appendices are generous and useful as well. Included is a lengthy, and seemingly complete, catalog of original performance parts for Bach's vocal works, a list of Bach's continuo parts arranged by date of performance, and copious notes citing the important Bach studies pertaining to the various subtopics. Some of the original parts are supplied in facsimile or in modern reconstruction. These are very helpful, and we can only wish that more could have been supplied. The author's charts, illustrating the various relationships among his materials, are clear and helpful.

Bach's Continuo Group started life as a Ph.D. dissertation, and it is good to have it circulated here to a broader audience. It reads easily, is carefully researched, and opens up wonderful new vistas for Bach performance practice. The book is very detailed yet not at all pedantic. I predict that it will be quoted frequently by the next generation of Bach performers and scholars. It is an important contribution to Bach studies, beyond any doubt.

GORDON SANDFORD, University of Colorado at Boulder

Meredith Alice McCutcheon. *Guitar and Vihuela: An Annotated Bibliography.* RILM Retrospectives, 3. New York: Pendragon Press, 1985. xlv, 353 pp.; 6 facsimiles, 7 black-and-white illustrations. ISBN: 0-918728-28-2 \$64.00.

Guitar performers and researchers who have been frustrated with the lack of a guide to works on the history of the guitar now have a major bibliographical reference, thanks to Meredith McCutcheon.

The introduction cites, first, historical documents that address the nebulous etymology of the guitar and vihuela, and second, sources of information about music for these instruments. Since some of the works cited in chapter 1, "General Histories and Dictionaries," are histories of plucked instruments, such instruments as the mandolin and lute may be discussed in them as well as the guitar and vihuela. Chapter 2, "National Histories," includes literature from various countries on the history of the guitar (most of the entries are published in the United States).