

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME IX • 1983



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

The presentation is clear, orderly, and most helpful.

Four appendices and a bibliography, totalling together forty pages, conclude the book with impressive data. The first appendix is an extensive list of primary sources containing music for solo guitar up to ca. 1800. The second appendix is a list of composers who published books of *alfabeto* for accompanying vocal music. The third appendix is a list of sources for eighteenth-century vocal music accompanied by guitar. The fourth appendix lists available facsimile editions of guitar tablatures. Concluding the work is a fourteen-page bibliography which includes all the important articles and texts on Tyler's subjects.

Tyler's book is a pioneer effort bringing together a refined sampling of the latest research and thinking about early guitars. His investigations bring us closer to the shrouded repertoires of these little-known instruments, enabling us to make much more sense out of the music and to develop performance techniques which should help to vindicate their previous popularity. As one reads through the work, it becomes more and more obvious that a twentieth-century guitar is no vehicle for this music. The tablatures and performance techniques of previous times were tailored to fit those instruments specifically. While the title, *The Early Guitar*, is completely appropriate for the book, indicating a generic kindred among types, this overview cannot, and should not, obscure our perception of each instrument's individuality. I suspect that instrument makers will delight in the new orders for vihuelas, four-course, and five-course guitars which a practical application of Tyler's book necessitates.

The Early Guitar is essential reading for serious guitarists and is also highly recommended for historians and devotees.

CLARE CALLAHAN

Malou Haine. *Adolphe Sax (1814–1894): Sa vie, son oeuvre et ses instruments de musique*. Brussels: Editions de l'Université de Bruxelles, 1980. 283 pp.; numerous illustrations. 480 FB.

Malou Haine's book brings together an impressive amount of material about the life and career of Adolphe Sax. It is certainly the most all-inclusive study of Sax to date, and should help future researchers greatly in evaluating the work of this innovative, versatile, and controversial man.

In her introduction Mlle. Haine describes the difficulties in gathering

information about Sax. It is not that material is scarce—quite the contrary, as her extensive bibliography attests. But she points out that much of what has been published, especially by Sax's contemporaries, is unreliable in one way or another. A lengthy biography of Sax by his contemporary Oscar Comettant, for example, is highly detailed but often inaccurate and lacking in adequate references. François-Joseph Fétis, in his *Biographie universelle des musiciens*, devoted a substantial article to Sax, but his information is also somewhat under question, although he may have relied heavily on material provided by Sax himself. Since Sax evidently aroused strong feelings in both his supporters and his detractors, there are conflicting accounts of his work, especially in the numerous articles that appeared in journals of the time. Friends such as Fétis, Comettant, and Hector Berlioz portrayed him as a genius beset by jealous enemies. In contrast, writer Adrien de La Fage and rival instrument maker Gustave Besson, for example, described him as overly ambitious, even unscrupulous.

To overcome these difficulties, Malou Haine went back to the original sources. She consulted the patents that Sax was granted, the legal documents associated with the suits in which he was involved, catalogues of exhibitions where he showed his instruments, official documents of organizations (such as the Paris Opéra and Conservatoire) with which he had dealings, and even many civil documents concerning the Sax family. The sheer number of sources is impressive, and if the resulting absorption with detail makes for slow going in the text, it also helps make the book a valuable reference tool.

The book consists of five chapters of text plus a number of appendices. The first two chapters concern the Sax family and Adolphe's early career in Brussels. Several family members besides Adolphe were involved with instrument making, notably his father, Charles-Joseph, and brother, Alphonse. While still working in his father's shop, Adolphe obtained his first patent, for a bass clarinet, and started the researches that led to the saxophone (first demonstrated in 1841 but not patented until 1846). Chapter 3, which begins with Sax's move to Paris in 1842, covers the many inventions, both musical and nonmusical, for which he obtained French patents. These include the families of saxhorns (1843), saxotrombas (1845), and saxtubas (1849), and a system of six independent valves for various brass instruments. In the patent the saxhorns are referred to only as "un nouveau système d'instruments chromatiques"—the name by which we now know them was given to them later. In applying the independent valve system, Sax devised some very cu-

rious instruments having seven separate bells. Among Sax's other patents were those for a system of kettledrums that could provide all the notes in a scale, a new design for a concert hall, and (in a nonmusical vein) an air purifier. In this chapter Mlle. Haine also describes the acceptance of Sax's instruments in orchestras and military bands and discusses his thirteen-year career as teacher of saxophone to military musicians in classes associated with the Paris Conservatoire. When musicians in the Paris Opéra objected to the use of Sax's bass clarinet in their orchestra, Sax and Berlioz organized concerts featuring ensembles of Sax's clarinets, saxophones, and brass instruments. For the French military bands, Sax proposed an ensemble based on a choir of saxhorns, from soprano to contrabass, instead of the woodwind-based band in use at that time. When others objected to his plan he arranged a contest between his band and the more traditional ensemble. The listeners preferred the more powerful and homogeneous sound of Sax's band, the French military adopted his instruments, and Sax received a virtual monopoly. Not surprisingly, other French instrument makers protested this decision. Later a group of four of them filed a suit challenging the validity of Sax's patents for saxhorns, saxotrombas, and saxophones.

The fourth chapter focuses on Sax's commercial activities. The author follows the ups and downs of Sax's instrument manufacturing business (established in 1842 and continued by his son, Adolphe, after Sax's death in 1894) and of a music publishing firm that he operated from 1858 to 1878. The high quality of Sax's work becomes especially apparent as one reads of the instruments he showed and the prizes he won. He was consistently awarded the highest honors, and both his woodwind and brass instruments were much praised by contemporary critics. At the 1851 "Exhibition of the Works of Industry of All Nations" in London, Sax was the only one out of twelve French instrument makers to receive a Council Medal, the highest award.

The closing chapter is devoted to the many legal proceedings in which Sax was involved as he sought to defend his patents. Sax actually won most of the cases, both those filed by other makers and the counter-suits he filed in return, but he derived little benefit from the favorable decisions.

The material described above makes up less than two-thirds of the book. Over 100 additional pages are devoted to "documents," bibliography, and notes. Among the documents are such useful items as a complete list not only of Adolphe Sax's patents (from Belgium, France, and England) but also those of his father, Charles-Joseph, and two of

his brothers, Alphonse and Joseph-Edouard. The text of the protest by other makers over the introduction of Sax's instruments into the military bands is also included. The bibliography is admirable (though I noticed a few minor errors, mainly in listings of English sources), and the notes, of which there are over 700, are almost excessive. Many interesting illustrations have been provided, including photographs of Sax's instruments now in the Musée instrumental in Brussels, illustrations from his catalogs, views of his *ateliers* from contemporary journals, and photographs of Sax and members of his family. The reproduction of these illustrations, unfortunately, is only fair.

Though Mlle. Haine appears to have been both thorough and precise in collecting information, less care seems to have been taken with the finishing of the book. A serious flaw is the lack of an index, which makes it particularly hard to locate the scattered references to Sax's fellow musicians. Also, the appendices could have been arranged in a more logical order, and various documents are crowded together, making it difficult to find any particular one. Finally, I think the book would have benefitted from a more thorough editing. Information is sometimes presented in a scrambled fashion (Adolphe's children's lives are discussed before his father's, for instance) or is needlessly repeated (that Adolphe was christened Antoine-Joseph is mentioned a number of times in the first two chapters).

These annoyances aside, Malou Haine's study is valuable and interesting. Though I rather hoped to find more evaluation of Sax in relation to his contemporaries, that kind of analysis is probably beyond the scope of a biography of this sort. What is needed now is a comparative study of nineteenth-century wind-instrument makers, and Mlle. Haine proposes to write such a study herself. I hope she does, and I shall look forward to reading it.

CAROLYN BRYANT

Gary M. Stewart. *Keyed Brass Instruments in the Arne B. Larson Collection. The Shrine to Music Museum Catalog of the Collections*, ed. André P. Larson, vol. 1. Vermillion, S.D.: The Shrine to Music Museum Foundation, 1980. 34 pp.; 31 plates. \$6.50.

Duncan Phillips, who assembled the superb collection of recent art works in Washington, D.C., that today bears his name, often spoke of what he had around him as "an embarrassment of riches." It may well also