

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME VIII • 1982



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

Some additions to the bibliography would be appropriate for a second edition: Christopher Welch, *Six Lectures on the Recorder and Other Flutes in Relation to Literature* (London: Oxford University Press, 1911); Hans-Peter Schmitz, *Querflöte und Querflötenspiel in Deutschland während des Barockzeitalters* (Kassel: Bärenreiter-Verlag, 1952); Karl Ventzke, *Die Boehmflöte: Werdegang eines Musikinstruments* (Frankfurt am Main: Verlag Das Musikinstrument, 1966); and Gustav Scheck, *Die Flöte und ihre Musik* (Mainz: B. Schott's Söhne, 1975). Toff gives us several bibliographical items not available elsewhere: patent specifications for France, Great Britain, and the U.S. (but, surprisingly, not for Germany), and a list of trade catalogs. A separate listing of instructional treatises, especially for the transitional period, would have been useful and interesting. The published tutors of such composer-performer-teachers as Gunn, Devienne, Tromlitz, Hugo and Wunderlich, and Toulou and Tillmetz can add the dimension of practical applicability to a study of mechanical development. They are all available from the Library of Congress, Frits Knuf (The Flute Library), or Minkoff Reprints in Geneva.

This excellent survey should be an important reference for flutists and flute historians who want to examine the critical impact of Boehm and his successors. Toff's information is presented in a clear and objective manner, allowing readers to decide for themselves the merits of each design change and to understand the current state of the art of flute construction.

JANE P. AMBROSE

Helmut Ottner. *Der Wiener Instrumentenbau 1815–1833. Wiener Veröffentlichungen zur Musikwissenschaft*, vol. 9. Tutzing: Hans Schneider, 1977. 172 pp.

Konrad Ruhland. *Alte Musikinstrumente aus niederbayerischen Werkstätten. Bavaria antiqua: Verborgene Kostbarkeiten der bayerischen Kulturgeschichte.* Munich: Bayerische Vereinsbank, 1978. 63 pp.; 28 plates, 8 in color; 1 map.

Anyone who has ever attempted to study a historical subject is well aware of the valuable work done by bibliographers and lexicographers, those who painstakingly ferret out individual bits and pieces of information without which conclusive studies could never be written. It is just this sort of information that is presented by Helmut Ottner in *Der Wiener Instrumentenbau 1815–1833*, the final, published version of his

doctoral dissertation (University of Vienna, 1968). Ottner has combed through pertinent Viennese records—predominantly the *Wiener Zeitung* and various documents housed in the city archives—for data on over 570 musical instrument makers, whom he lists in the main section of his book. It is significant that the end of the period covered by Ottner is marked by the death of the important piano manufacturer Johann Andreas Streicher, for makers and sellers of keyboard instruments, especially pianos, account for almost seventy percent of the persons listed. Statistically eclipsed are the makers of string instruments (ten percent), winds (eight percent), and automatic instruments (five percent), as well as those engaged in the manufacture of bells, mouth organs, drums, and various accessories. Ottner's *terminus a quo*, on the other hand, was determined by practical considerations. His study was designed as a continuation and revision of the earlier, similar work by Helga Haupt, "Wiener Instrumentenbauer von 1791 bis 1815" (printed in *Studien zur Musikwissenschaft* 24 [1960]: 120–84), which is, in turn, a revised version of her dissertation, "Wiener Instrumentenbau um 1800" (University of Vienna, 1953).

The titles chosen by Haupt and Ottner are somewhat misleading, for neither author presents a full-fledged study of Viennese musical instrument making during the period in question. Rather, the emphasis in both works is entirely on individual makers (and in this respect Haupt's title of 1960 comes closer to the point); they are listed alphabetically, along with their dates, addresses, general areas of musical activity, and other personal data, including names of spouses and children, masters and apprentices, and even causes of death. While Haupt draws on a variety of sources for the information she gives on the work of these makers, Ottner provides few descriptions of musical instruments other than occasional quotations from newspaper advertisements and other information contained in the more limited sources he consulted. Surviving instruments are mentioned rarely in the former work and not at all in the latter. Thus, in view of the promises implied in Haupt's and Ottner's titles, both works seem incomplete as a result of their authors' policy of presenting only certain kinds of information and producing, in fact, biographical dictionaries. But their approach is surely valid in the world of scholarship, and the biographical facts they bring to light can serve as the basis for further investigation into the careers of individual Viennese instrument makers—a backbone to be fleshed out, as it were, by additional knowledge gained from studying the instruments themselves and the music that was played on them.

Unlike writers of historical studies, authors of lexicographical works are generally relieved of the necessity of making deductive evaluations and presenting their material in colorful, compelling language. In turn, the lexicographer is bound all the more by the requirements of accuracy, straightforwardness, and consistency. In itself, Ottner's accuracy in reporting information and citing sources in the book under consideration appears trustworthy, but his evident lack of clear, consistent method in doing so cannot fail to cast doubt on the quality and usefulness of the work as a whole. In his brief introduction, Ottner acknowledges the connection between his study and the one by Haupt that preceded it. Naturally, certain names will appear in both lists, and in these cases, he explains, his own entry—identified by an "H"—includes only supplementary information or corrections of previous mistakes. This procedure seems logical, and it appears to have been followed in most cases, but a comparison of the two lists reveals many inconsistencies in Ottner's work.

A few examples may serve to illustrate the many problems that readers will face in using Ottner's book. Unlike Haupt, Ottner provides no cross references to alternate spellings of names, leaving readers unaccustomed to the vagaries of old German orthography to fend for themselves. For example, Jakob Pertsche (Bärtsche, Bertsche), listed by Haupt with cross references from the two alternate spellings, appears in Ottner as Jakob Bertsche (Pertsche) with no cross reference and not even an "H" to indicate Haupt's listing. And Remigius Ahsfoly, for whom Haupt gives two cross-referenced alternates (Ossfaly and Uhsfoly), becomes Assfalg (Assfolg) in Ottner, with no mention of the other spellings. In many cases it is impossible to determine whether Ottner's information is meant to supersede Haupt's or merely to supplement it. For example, Haupt gives Ambros Bogner as a "Geigen- und Lautenmacher," while in Ottner he is listed as a "bürgerlicher Geigenmacher." Leaving aside the question of the man's citizenship, there seems no way for us to know what Ottner really means: was Bogner only a Geigenmacher from the beginning, or did he simply stop being a Lautenmacher after 1815? Occasionally, Ottner seems not even to know what is in Haupt. For example, Haupt lists Jakob Krasni as a "Geigen- und Lautenmacher" and goes on to comment that "his fiddles, guitars, and harps have become well known." Notwithstanding this, Ottner, who gives him as a "bürgerlicher Gitarren-, Harfen- und Klaviermacher," says that he was "not just a Geigenmacher, as indicated in Haupt." Even when it is faithfully followed, Ottner's policy of not duplicating infor-

mation already presented by Haupt diminishes the value of his book, for it cannot be used independently, and the reader must always consult both works for a full account, even of an event that occurred after 1815. For example, Haupt—going beyond her usual cut-off date—reports that Cyrill Demian, an important figure in the development of the accordion, received a two-year privilege for his invention in 1829 and a three-year extension in 1831. She also quotes his description of the instrument from the patent. Ottner's listing for Demian, however, makes no reference to the accordion whatsoever. Finally, mention should be made of the large and seemingly pointless variety of names used by Ottner to refer to occupations. Are the following terms, all taken from his book, the result of accurate reporting from original documents, or merely an attempt to avoid monotony?

Klavierbauer
 Klavermacher
 Klavierfabrikant
 Klavierinstrumentenmacher
 Klavierfabrikant und Instrumentenmacher
 Klavier- und Instrumentenmacher
 Klavermacher und -fabrikant

And, in the same vein, is the reader served by wondering if the author really intends to indicate different shades of meaning among the following?

Orgel- und Klavierbauer
 Orgel- und Klavermacher
 Klavier- und Orgelmacher
 Klavermacher und Orgelbauer
 Orgelbauer und Klavermacher
 Orgel- und Instrumentenmacher
 Tasteninstrumentenmacher

In spite of these weaknesses in Ottner's work, it is to his credit that he was able to find so much biographical information about so many musical instrument makers active in Vienna during one of the most artistically fertile periods in the city's history. It is not surprising that most of them were born elsewhere—just like the composers who made up the Viennese school—and were drawn to the cosmopolitan city by the opportunities it offered. It is fascinating to see, as reported in Ottner's individual entries and briefly summarized in his introduction, the ingenuity with which many of these makers invented new musical instruments and devised ways of adapting old ones to changing tastes.

* * *

Konrad Ruhland is best known through the performances and recordings of his early-music ensemble, the Capella Antiqua München, and through his work as a music editor. He appears here as the author of a handsome little volume in a series devoted to the appreciation of "hidden treasures of Bavarian cultural history." Ruhland has chosen "old musical instruments from workshops of Lower Bavaria" as his theme, and his book is an illustrated catalogue of thirty instruments of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries originating in the area lying some seventy-five miles northeast of Munich and bounded roughly by the cities Passau, Landshut, and Straubing.

The string instruments selected for this book include four violins, two violas d'amore, an English violet, a viola da braccio (probably originally made as a viola d'amore or a treble viol), two barytons, three contrabasses, a tromba marina, a lute, a guitar, and a zither. Winds are represented by three flutes, four clarinets, a clarinet d'amore, a basset horn, two English horns, and a natural trumpet. There is just one keyboard instrument, a positive organ. Some sixteen makers are represented, several with more than one instrument: Johann Ulrich Fischer of Landshut (4), Johann Stephan Thumhardt of Straubing (2), and Georg Heidegger (3), Simon Schödler (4), and Johann Benedikt Wasner (3), all of Passau. The instruments are located today in collections in the area studied, as well as in Basel, Berlin, Copenhagen, Leipzig, Munich, Nuremberg, Salzburg, and Vienna.

Ruhland presents his instrumental treasures in geographical order according to makers' locations (moving from west to east), rather than following the more customary method of grouping instruments together by families to facilitate comparison. Each item is discussed and illustrated by at least one photograph. In addition, there are detailed pictures of the carved heads of two of the string instruments, and a composite photograph at the back of the book includes five makers' labels (although no reference is given to the instruments in which they are found). Information is also provided in lists: the names, locations, and dates of instrument makers, including several not represented by items in the catalogue; the area's main centers of instrument making, excluding the "innumerable organ workshops"; the sources of the photographs (and therefore, indirectly, the present locations of the instruments, although readers must work hard to find this information for individual items); and a selected bibliography.

The text of this book is generally informed and well written for the

lay audience for which the "Bavaria antiqua" series seems to be intended. A few typographical errors, some of them glaring, reveal inadequate proofreading. The highest note of the tromba marina, given as G (p. 12), should be C. No doubt the following statement originally contained all real words: "Er arbeitete in einer Stadt, in welcher der Musik . . . nicht immer nur [sic] gute Stunden beschert waren" (p. 8). And one hardly knows what to make of: "Sils [sic] Begleitinstrument für den Mönchschor . . . geschaffen" (p. 56; "Sie war als"?). Also, an unfortunate transposition of two photographs, both showing a flute and a clarinet, occurred at some stage in the preparation of this work, for the picture on page 27 belongs on page 53, and vice versa. Finally, Ruhland's statement that three instruments survive by Anton and Michael Mayrhofer (p. 46) must be corrected to four to include the bass clarinet in the Munich Stadtmuseum recently discussed by Phillip T. Young in "A Bass Clarinet by the Mayrhofers of Passau," this *Journal* 7 (1981): 36-46.

The photographs in the book are well executed, and the eight in color are quite striking. Ruhland mentions in his foreword that several instruments were not included because they could not be photographed in playing condition. Yet, we see a picture of a guitar (p. 17) with two of its strings missing, and the photographs of the tromba marina (pp. 13 and 59) show not only no string, but also an incorrectly inserted tuning peg. Although the proper stringing and peg position are indicated in the accompanying text, it would surely have been better to make the corrections on the instruments themselves before the pictures were taken.

Lower Bavaria is relatively little known for its musical instruments, and we are indebted to Konrad Ruhland for making us acquainted with some of the best examples of this production. The Bayerische Vereinsbank is also to be praised for sponsoring the series in which his attractive catalogue appears.

WILLIAM E. HETTRICK