

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME VII • 1981



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

the contrary, one can only hope that the book will find a wide circle of users, and that we may in the future welcome equally valuable works on chamber organs of other regions, for which Gierveld's book can serve as a most useful model.

DALE CARR

Robert E. Eliason. *Early American Brass Makers*. Brass Research Series, no. 10. Nashville: The Brass Press, 1979. 56 pp.; numerous black-and-white plates. \$6.00.

Lovers of brass band music have to concede that the current haven for such music is the United Kingdom and that the British have surely and purposely developed the brass band to amazing heights. A parallel brass band movement during the nineteenth century in America had the makings of such development but fizzled out near the end of the century owing to renewed interest in the mixed wind-brass type of band. A study of the American brass band is most interesting, and Robert Eliason here tells us about four of our early brass instrument makers who helped shape the movement and supply the needs of early American bandsmen. Their products show great inventiveness, fortunately unhampered by various traditions that sometimes hindered European makers, and their craftsmanship was often superb even though they may have been to some extent self-taught.

It is fortunate that Dr. Eliason has taken the trouble to investigate the careers of such makers as Thomas Paine, J. L. Allen, E. G. Wright, and Isaac Fiske. He has described their lives and work in a very entertaining way, and I must say that I find those matters often more interesting than much of the repertoire their customers played.

One criticism I might venture concerns photography or, rather, the fitting of an object with proper accessories for its photograph. On page 40, for example, a Fiske helicon cornet is displayed without its detachable tuning shank, and a mouthpiece is simply inserted in its place. When photographs are supplied by uncontrollable sources (private collectors, other museums, etc.), one has to publish them as they are. But this instrument is apparently in the author's museum,

and it might have been better simply to show the instrument without accessories if the original ones are missing, rather than to picture it with an inappropriate one.

I am sensitive to this matter in that museums often have problems in finding or selecting proper accessories for display. For example, should eighteenth-century double-reed instruments be shown with no reeds so that they will not appear inauthentic to the specialist, or should they be supplied with some reasonably appropriate reeds so that the general viewer can learn how they work and appear when complete? For a museum display catering to the public, perhaps the latter is best until really proper accessories can be located or reconstructed. But for a publication that may be consulted by both specialists and the general public, I would suggest that photos show only what remains of an object and that missing parts be mentioned in the captions.

A couple of other technicalities remain to be mentioned. Several of the E-flat soprano, four-valve instruments are described as being in E flat and F because the fourth valve does, in fact, ascend a whole tone. But it is doubtful that when the fourth valve was in play the instrument was considered as being in F and used for extended passages, since the other three valve slides would then be too long for many notes. In the *Brass Band School* of 1853 by Allen Dodsworth, F and even high A-flat instruments are included in the list of soprano brass (without details), but Dodsworth is fairly clear in describing the ascending fourth valve as an alternate fingering-tuning aid and not as a sort of transposing device.

An additional error is, I suspect, one made some 129 years ago. On page 23, a Firth & Pond advertisement reproduced from an 1852 *Musical World & N.Y. Musical Times* shows proper instrumentation for brass bands of eight, ten, and twelve players; it lists the expected categories (with numbers of players for each) of what was surely meant to be (from treble to bass) E-flat soprano, B-flat alto, E-flat tenor, B-flat baritone, B-flat bass, and E-flat contrabass, but which instead reads E-flat soprano, E-flat tenor, E-flat alto, and the others as above. This must surely be a nineteenth-century typo, especially regarding the "E-flat alto," even if the list purposely placed the tenor, because of its octave-lead role, directly after the soprano.

Technicalities aside, Robert Eliason describes these important American craftsmen in such an informative and entertaining way that one wishes it were possible to go back and visit their shops. A short time ago, Dr. Eliason composed an equally interesting study of another American instrument-making firm, Samuel Graves & Company, which is available from the Henry Ford Museum in Dearborn, Michigan. I look forward to more publications of this type.

ROBERT E. SHELDON

Laurence Libin. *Musical Instruments in the Metropolitan Museum*. Foreword by Philippe de Montebello. New York: The Metropolitan Museum of Art, 1978. 48 pp. plus a 7-in. LP recording. \$3.00.

Laurence Libin. *A Checklist of European Harps*. New York: The Metropolitan Museum of Art, 1979. iv, 16 pp. \$1.00.

William L. Monical. *A Checklist of Viole da gamba (Viols)*. Preface by Laurence Libin. New York: The Metropolitan Museum of Art, 1979. viii, 20 pp. \$1.00.

Joyce Smar, Michaelene Gorney, and Jane Vial. *Musical Instruments*. Foreword by Roger Mandle. Toledo, Ohio: The Toledo Museum of Art, 1978. Vol. 20, no. 4, of the Toledo Museum of Art's *Museum News*. 29 pp. No price given.

Musical instruments, after having a Cinderella status in most museums for many years, are at long last coming to be recognized as works of art. Only a handful of the some four thousand instruments in the magnificent collection at New York's Metropolitan Museum of Art were on display prior to the opening in 1971 of the André Mertens Galleries for Musical Instruments, but since then thousands of visitors have been able to view and hear recordings of a representative selection of the instruments. About eight hundred instruments are now on permanent exhibit. Serving as an introduction to the collection, and nicely reflecting the amazing breadth of its holdings from all over the world, is the handsomely produced booklet *Musical Instruments in*