

*Journal of the
American Musical
Instrument Society*

VOLUME IV • 1978



Copyright by the [American Musical Instrument Society](#).
Content may be used in accordance with the principles of fair
use under [Section 107 of the United States Copyright Act](#).
Content may not be reproduced for commercial purposes.

trumpets before the king's resurrection (the word "mutilating," p. 12, should be "muting"). Those who are especially interested in the trumpets and their uses, incidentally, can also consult the 1946 study by Hans Hickmann, *La trompette dans l'Égypte ancienne*, which has been recently reprinted by The Brass Press in Nashville (Brass Research Series, no. 4).

Lise Manniche's two books on Egyptian instruments have appeared at a most propitious time, when the *Treasures of Tut'ankhamūn* exhibition has reminded us all of the artistic achievements of the ancient Egyptians. The instruments described in these books make it clear that music must have played as important a role as the visual arts in the cultural richness of this civilization.

MARTHA MAAS

Jeremy Montagu. *The World of Medieval and Renaissance Musical Instruments*. Woodstock, N.Y.: The Overlook Press, 1976. 136 pp.; 15 color, 99 black-and-white plates. \$20.00.

David Munrow. *Instruments of the Middle Ages and Renaissance*. Boxed two-record album; London: EMI Records, 1976. Accompanying 97-page illustrated booklet; London: Oxford University Press, 1976. \$15.95.

It has been inevitable from the burgeoning activity of early-music research, instrument building, and performance in Britain during the past decade, that publications such as these should appear. They are founded upon the solid base of a tradition that extends back, as David Munrow outlines in his introduction to *Instruments of the Middle Ages and Renaissance*, to Arnold Dolmetsch and Canon Francis Galpin, but their spiritual (if not technological) ancestor is A. J. Hipkins' *Musical Instruments Historic, Rare and Unique* (1888). It may also be inevitable that these two publications will be compared with each other, as their coincidental appearance in 1976 invites. The character of the two offerings is so different, however, that a true comparison would be improper.

In his introduction to *Instruments of the Middle Ages and Renais-*

sance, Munrow delineates eight sources of information about musical instruments: original instruments, folk instruments, iconography, literary evidence, accounts of performers and performances, theoretical works and tutors, payments and inventories, and finally the music itself. His comprehensive treatment of these subjects makes use of illustrations from historical iconography as well as modern photographs showing playing positions, generous quotations from primary and secondary sources (with copious footnotes), and fingering and range charts when needed. He relies, in such a proliferous field, upon studies by experts in certain areas: Smithers, Hayes, Baines, Ripin, and others, as well as Montagu himself.

In *The World of Medieval and Renaissance Musical Instruments*, Jeremy Montagu presents a more straightforward reading, with passing references in the text to his select bibliography, but he includes no footnotes and hence no specific page references. His discussion of the illustrative plates are often detailed and imaginative, although dealing with the color plates which are tipped into two gatherings is frustrating since no pagination is given for them in the list of illustrations.

Both authors present their readers with a mine of information and refer them to further sources, mostly in English. They also point to areas in need of research. The use of percussion in the Middle Ages "is the subject that we know the least about" (Montagu, p. 49), "the most uncharted area of early music performance practice" (Munrow, p. 31); both recommend studies by James Blades and Montagu [see the review below—editor's note]. While Munrow points out that "there can be no doubt of the preeminence of stringed instruments during the Renaissance" (p. 72), Montagu is more outspoken: "The most important instruments from the twelfth to the fourteenth centuries were the strings, a fact which is ignored in most modern performances of medieval music" (p. 23). About the viola da gamba, whose "precise origins remain obscure" (p. 86), Munrow warns that "several quite eminent histories of music still perpetuate the idea that the viol was a *medieval* instrument" (p. 27) because of mistranslations of ambiguous words such as *vielle*. Noticeably, he does not name these histories at this point, but Nathalie Dolmetsch's *The Viola da Gamba* particularly comes to mind. In pointing out the relative

importance of certain members of the medieval and Renaissance *instrumentarium*, Munrow calls attention to the modern overemphasis of the medieval recorder—"primus inter pares with the other instruments" (p. 14)—and also of the Renaissance recorder at the expense of the Renaissance flute. That the emphasis was the reverse in the late sixteenth century is suggested by the 1589 inventory of the Stuttgart Hofkapelle (p. 54), which lists 220 flutes, 113 cornetts ("the most versatile wind instrument of the Renaissance," p. 69), 48 recorders, and 39 viols.

François Lesure, in his introduction to *Music and Art in Society* (1968), condemns many current books on music that "make use of pictures as accessories for the reader's diversion," with the same paintings "rapidly copied from one book to another." Many illustrations have become so familiar by duplication on record albums, program covers, and elsewhere, that their documentary value may be diminished: take the "Triumph of Maximilian" plates, for example. One special attribute of Montagu's work is his presentation of most of the meticulous drawings by Henri Arnault de Zwolle (c. 1440), "one of the least known [sources] because he wrote before the invention of printing" (Montagu, p. 58). Elsewhere, Arnault's perhaps greatest value—as a primary source for portative organ design—has been little appreciated, because the Le Cerf/Labande 1932 edition was only once mentioned by Hans Hickmann in *Das Portativ* (1936). Munrow, for example, refers to Arnault concerning only the *dulce melos*, lute and harpsichord, and then relatively superficially. Other interesting illustrations presented by Montagu are of the Beauchamp Chapel windows of St. Mary's Church, Warwick (1447), painted from models supplied to the contractor. Montagu's reproductions, unfortunately, are in black and white, but at least they are better than those in Harrison and Rimmer's *European Musical Instruments* (1964), plate 77, which also offers some quite different interpretations of the instruments depicted. Twenty of the forty miniatures from the "Cantigas de Santa Maria" (Escorial J.b.2.) are also included and discussed by Montagu.

The recordings that form half of Munrow's publication represent a major event in the demonstration of historical instruments, not only because of the size of the undertaking (expanded considerably

from his Oryx recording, *The Medieval Sound*, EXP 46, available in North America on Musical Heritage Society, MHS 1454), but especially because of the manifest performing genius of David Munrow and the Early Music Consort. Munrow's meticulous preparation and execution are applied as much to the end of a note or phrase as to its beginning or middle. The selections are carefully synchronized with the text of the book and the illustrations: for example, after beginning with a discussion of Eastern shawms, the book gives a cross reference to the later European shawms that are heard at the opening—with Munrow multitracking all four parts!—of the first side of the Renaissance record.

The records contain many high points and few lows. Some of the high points include the humorous nose-thumbing irreverence of a motet from the "Roman de Fauvel," with excellent tromba marina playing. For the Renaissance families of instruments, ideal selections are made of Schein's "Padouane" for crumhorns, Attaingnant's *Chansons musicales* (1533) specifically marked for flutes and recorders, and Monteverdi's *Orfeo* toccata for open trumpets in C and then muted trumpets in D. Among the lows are: The hurdy-gurdy sounds choked; better playing can be heard on Musical Heritage, MHS 3436. The clarion piece by Hermann of Salzburg is not identified, even though Munrow discusses three of Hermann's melodies, described in the manuscript as "gut zu blasen," as possibilities for cornett-type instruments (p. 20). And the beautiful playing of the viol consort is done on instruments modeled after viols from a later century—the seventeenth.

Finally, one wishes that the modern sources of the music had been listed. Especially when such care has been taken to indicate the modern makers of the instruments used, it is frustrating that the modern editions employed by the performers are nowhere mentioned. Merely indicating the original sources of the music offers little help to other performers who may wish to play the music recorded on these discs. Would that Munrow had followed the practice he did on one of his latest and last albums, *The Art of the Netherlands* (Seraphim SIC-6104), that does provide a list of modern editions.

But these are mere cavils, not intended to stem the praise of a fine

presentation. Both Munrow's and Montagu's offerings are exemplary publications in the early music field.

BRUCE BELLINGHAM

This reviewer's brief acquaintance with David Munrow in 1971 revealed a musician of humility, wit, and consummate dedication. Munrow's death in 1976 brought a brilliant, brief career to an end which is lamented by everyone who was touched by him.

James Blades and Jeremy Montagu. *Early Percussion Instruments from the Middle Ages to the Baroque*. Early Music Series, 2. London: Oxford University Press, 1976. x, 72 pp. \$9.95.

Jeremy Montagu. *Making Early Percussion Instruments*. Early Music Series, 3. London: Oxford University Press, 1976. xiv, 49 pp. \$9.95.

Two authors who have both contributed substantially to our knowledge of early percussion instruments and their performance have produced, in *Early Percussion Instruments from the Middle Ages to the Baroque*, a useful volume dealing with the history and organology of these instruments. While most of the historical material is derived from Blades's uniquely important study, *Percussion Instruments and Their History* (2d ed.; London, 1974), this new work is ideally suited to professional performers and amateurs alike. It manages to strike a nice balance between history and practice and should be read by every practitioner who has occasion to play early music requiring percussion.

Blades, who is responsible for the historical material in the volume, begins with a discussion of makers, setting the stage as it were by a quotation from Shakespeare—who was referring to kettledrums, by the way. Surely a citation from the medieval period—from Joinville's *Histoire de St. Louis* or Chaucer's *Canterbury Tales*, for example—would have been far more representative of the clangor of the period. While numerous sources and illustrations are provided, expert advice from a musical iconographer would have resulted in better examples than many of those selected. Oxford Bodleian Library ms.Laud.misc.